REPORTER'S RECORD VOLUME 28 OF 36 VOLUMES TRIAL COURT CAUSE NO. 0885306D

THE STATE OF TEXAS X IN THE DISTRICT COURT

VS. X TARRANT COUNTY, TEXAS

BILLY JACK CRUTSINGER X 213TH JUDICIAL DISTRICT

TRIAL ON THE MERITS CONTINUED

On September 23, 2003, the following proceedings came on to be heard in the aboveentitled and numbered cause before the Honorable Robert K. Gill, Judge presiding, held in Fort Worth, Tarrant County, Texas.

Proceedings reported by computerized stenotype machine.

APPEARANCES

HONORABLE MICHELE HARTMANN SBOT NO.09167800

and

HONORABLE LISA CALLAGHAN SBOT NO. 0116700

Assistant District Attorneys

401 W. Belknap

Fort Worth, Texas 76196

Phone: (817) 884-1700 FOR THE STATE

HONORABLE WILLIAM H. RAY SBOT NO. 16608700

5041 Airport Freeway

Fort Worth, Texas 76117

Phone: 817-831-8383

And

HONORABLE TIM MOORE SBOT NO. 14378300

115 West 2nd Street

Suite No. 202

Fort Worth, Texas 76102

817-332-3822

FOR THE DEFENDANT

INDEX - VOLUME 28 TRIAL ON THE MERITS CONTINUED

September 23, 2003		•		PAGE			
	STAT	STATE'S EVIDENCE					
NAME	DIRECT	CROSS	VOIR DIRE				
Wilson, Glenn	6, 58, 63	48, 62	7, 32, 40				
Ball, Mark	64, 89	87	83				
McCaskill, John	89, 153	133, 157		•			
Johnson, Cheryl	158, 179	172					
Fuller, Randy	182, 188	187, 189	185				
Turner, Harvey	190	204	•				
Angram, Loretta	210			•			
Shrader, Denise	215	220	218, 219				
Daley, Rosalee	221	224					
White, Lynn	226						
•							

INDEX OF EXHIBITS - VOLUME 28 STATE'S EXHIBITS

239

Reporter's Certificate....

Vo.	Description	Offered	Received
42-62	Large Mounted Photographs	7	8
64-72	Large Mounted Photographs	18	18
73	Bag	30	30
73 - A	Envelope	30	30
73-B	Sample 1	31	31
73-C	Sample 7	31	31
73-D	Sample 8	31	31
73 - E	Sample 23	31	31
73-F	Remainder of Samples	30	31
73-G	Envelope	30	30
73-H	Control Sample 1	31	31 .
73-I	Control Sample 7	31	31
73 -J	Control Sample 8	31	31
73-K	Control Sample 23	31	31
73-L	Remainder of Control Samples	30	31
74	Envelope	37	37
74-A	Blade	37	37
75	Sack	39	39
75-A	Tile in Baggie	41	41
76	Bag	35	35
76-A	Bag	33	33
76-B	Eyeglasses	33	33
76 - C	Envelope	33	33
76-D	Necklace	33	33
76-E	Envelope	34	34
76-F	Photo	34	34
77	Brown Paper Sack	41	41
78	Brown Bag with Comforter	· 41	41

No.	Description	Offered	Received
79	Box	41	41
80	Photo	97	98
81-89	Photos	67	67
99	Hospital Records	232	
100	Vehicle Inquiry	235	235
101	Photo Answering Machine	115	115
102	Photo	109	109
103	Photo	110	110
104	Photo	109	109
106-112	Photo	162	162
113	Photo	203	203
114	Composite of Photos	114	114
124	Sack	166	166
124-A	Denim Shirt	167	167
125	Bag	168	168
125-A	Cuttoff Jeans	168	168
126	Bag with white socks	170	170
127	Bag with t-shirt	170	170
128	Bag with towel	170	170
129	Paper Bag	81	83
129-A	Paper Bag	81	83
129-B	Seatbelt	83	83
129-C	Remainder of Swabs	81	83
129-D	Various Items	84	84
129-E	Swab	83	83
129-F	Swabs	81	83
130	Miranda Warning	112	112
131	Audio cassette tape	113	113
132	Factory Brand Shoes Recipt	217	217
133	Permission to Collect Bio Sample	122	122
134	Cheek Swab Kit	127	127
135	Receipt from Razoo's	222	222
136	Set of Buccal Swabs	132	132
137	Bluejean Cuttings	170	170
139	Credit Card Records	185	185

DEFENDANT'S EXHIBITS

No.	<u>Description</u>	Offered	Received
2	Box	175	175
4	Search Warrant and Affidavit	158	158

ALPHABETICAL INDEX OF WITNESSES - VOLUME 28

NAME	DIRECT	CROSS	VOIR DIRE
Angram, Loretta	210		
Ball, Mark	64, 89	87	83
Daley, Rosalee	221	224	
Fuller, Randy	182, 188	187, 189	185
Johnson, Cheryl	158, 179	172	
McCaskill, John	89, 153	133, 157	
Shrader, Denise	215	220	218, 219
Turner, Harvey	190	204	
White, Lynn	226		
Wilson, Glenn	6, 58, 63	48, 62	7, 32, 40

Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Cendense II 13/17 Page 5 of 64 PageID 4641 Page 3 Page 1 REPORTER'S RECORD 1 what Ms. Hartmann doesn't want in front of the jury is the fact 2 VOLUME 28 OF 36 VOLUMES 2 that Detective McCaskill went and got a subsequent search 3 Trial Court Cause No. 0885306D 3 warrant for the Defendant's DNA sample which was signed about THE STATE OF TEXAS IN THE DISTRICT COURT x 4 halfway through jury selection. vs. X TARRANT COUNTY, TEXAS 5 Detective McCaskill in a prior hearing testified 6 BILLY JACK CRUTSINGER'Y 213TH JUDICIAL DISTRICT 6 that the reason he did that, as the Court is aware, is because 7 7 the District Attorney's Office was worried about the Court's 8 TRIAL ON THE MERITS CONTINUED 8 ruling on the admissibility of the search. It is my a 9 understanding that's what Ms. Hartmann doesn't want us to go 10 On the 23rd day of September, 2003, the following 10 into. 11 proceedings came on to be heard in the above-entitled and 11 In response to her three statements, as I -numbered cause before the Honorable Bob Gill, Judge presiding, 12 understand it, her three reasons are that, number one, probable 13 held in Fort Worth, Tarrant County, Texas: 13 cause is not a legal issue; the second being hearsay; and the 14 last one, statements of the district attorney's office wouldn't 15 Proceedings reported by computerized stenotype 15 be admissible. 16 Machine; Reporter's Record produced by Computer-Assisted 16 First of all, as far as probable cause goes, we 17 Transcription. 17 are entitled to a jury question if the issue -- a legal issue as 1 Ω 18 to whether or not the evidence was legally obtained is 19 proper. As the Court is well aware, we voir dired on that, and 20 as I remember, the State asked every single prospective juror 21 that, even the ones that aren't on the jury. 22 22 The way this case has played out with that 23 STEVE SCHILLER, Texas CSR No. 4665 23 subsequent search warrant, as the Court is aware, the way that 24 Official Court Reporter 213th Judicial District Court search warrant was worded - or the affidavit was worded, it 25 Tarrant County, Texas 25 deleted a lot of the facts that Detective McCaskill was aware of Page 4 Page 2 PROCEEDINGS 1 in order to justify a finding of probable cause outside the 1 2 (September 23, 2003) 2 Defendant's arrest. 3 3 It's our position that if that search was (Morning Session:) 4 illegal, which we are certainly entitled to contest under the MS. HARTMANN: Your Honor, at this time the State 5 would ask for an oral motion in limine. Mr. Ray, during his 5 Fourth Amendment, whether or not probable cause is a 6 opening statement yesterday afternoon, gave information to the 6 determination that the jury has to make or not make. The fact 7 jury that he anticipated that they would be seeing an affidavit 7 that it is a legal or illegal search would render that 8 for a search warrant. admissible at the proper time. 9 In addition, he told the jury that he believed 9 As far as being hearsay, the fact that those 10 that the search warrant was obtained as a result of concern on 10 statements are hearsay is really -- I really don't believe that behalf of personnel of the district attorney's office. 11 enters into the equation. Detective McCaskill -- and Judge 12 And the State's position is that whether there is 12 Sharen Wilson, when she signed that warrant, had to make that 13 probable cause is a legal issue, not a fact issue for the jury's 13 determination, but this jury is entitled to view that and see if 14 determination, so it's not relevant from that standpoint. the search was, in fact, proper. 15 Second of all, the affidavit and search warrant. 15 Lastly, as far as statements of the prosecutor 16 in and of themselves, are hearsay and are inadmissible, and I 16 are concerned, what she really doesn't want is the fact that 17 know of no exception in the rules of evidence that would allow 17 they were concerned about your ruling, which hadn't taken place 18 their introduction before the jury. 18 yet. That's an admission of a party opponent to the extent that 19 Any statements that I, Ms. Callaghan or any other 19 they made any statements. It also goes to the detective's bias 20 member of the district attorney's staff made to Detective 20 and our ability to cross-examine him completely under the Sixth 21 McCaskill in the course of preparation for this case would be 21 Amendment 22 hearsay, they're not relevant; and even if the Court found them 22 We believe that every fact in this case that 23 to be relevant, their probative value would be substantially 23 Defendant McCaskill, who was the chief case agent in this case, 24 outweighed by any prejudicial effect on this jury. was aware of or used in his expertise and in his investigation 25 MR. RAY: May I respond? It is my understanding would be a proper subject of cross-examination, and we believe

		711.0	
1	Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Files 1 we are entitled to go into it. That's my response.		Page 03/17 Page 6 of 64 PageID 4642 Page were opened, we would open and put a number
2	THE COURT: The Motion in Limine is granted.	2	Q. Did you move anything else around in any of these
3	We'll take the matter up more fully before the	3	
4	Defense goes into it.	4	A. No.
5	MS. HARTMANN: Thank you, Your Honor.	5	MR. RAY: No objection to 42 through 62.
6	THE COURT: Are both sides ready for the jury?	6	THE COURT: 42 through 62 are admitted.
7	MS. HARTMANN: State's ready, Your Honor.	7	(State's Exhibit No. 42 through 62 received)
8	MR. RAY: We are ready.	8	DIRECT EXAMINATION CONTINUED
9	(Jury present)	9	BY MS. CALLAGHAN:
10	Whereupon,	10	Q. Why don't you go ahead and stand up there.
11	GLENN WILSON,	11	A. (Witness complies)
12	having been first duly sworn, testified as follows:	12	Q. First of all, let's start off with State's Exhibit No.
13	DIRECT EXAMINATION	13	42. Can you show us what area of the house is depicted here?
14	BY MS. CALLAGHAN:	14	A. This is the this is the southeast bedroom with
15	Q. I believe, Officer Wilson, that we ended yesterday	15	this is the bed, this is the chest
16	with my completing showing the jury stack 2, which ended with	16	Q. Clothing chest?
17	- · · ·	17	A. Yes. Chest, bed, south bedroom downstairs.
18	A. Yes.	18	Q. Now, in State's Exhibit No. 42, what you are referring
19	Q. All right. Let's go ahead and start with the next	1	to on State's Exhibit No. 8, the diagram, is there is a large
20		20	
21	separated into stack 3 here.	21	"small photograph, pieces of carpet and comforter." These all
22	A. (Witness complies)	1	refer to this long square, which is the bed, correct?
23	Q. Have you had chance to review State's Exhibit 42	23	A. Yes.
24	through 62	24	Q. And the clothes chest at the foot of the bed is the
25	A. Yes, ma'am.	25	smaller square?
\vdash		┿	
- 1	Page 6	1	Page
1,	Page 6	1	Page 8
1 2	Q inclusive? Are all of these photographs true and	1	A. Yes.
2	Q inclusive? Are all of these photographs true and accurate depictions of how the victims' house appeared when you	1 2	A. Yes. Q. And then there is other furniture here that's
3	Q inclusive? Are all of these photographs true and accurate depictions of how the victims' house appeared when you were out there on	1 2 3	A. Yes. Q. And then there is other furniture here that's depicted, dressers and
2 3 4	Q inclusive? Are all of these photographs true and accurate depictions of how the victims' house appeared when you were out there on A. Yes, ma'am.	1 2	A. Yes. Q. And then there is other furniture here that's depicted, dressers and A. Yes.
2 3 4 5	Q inclusive? Are all of these photographs true and accurate depictions of how the victims' house appeared when you were out there on A. Yes, ma'am. MS. CALLAGHAN: The State would offer State's	1 2 3 4 5	A. Yes. Q. And then there is other furniture here that's depicted, dressers and A. Yes. Q. Let's go to the next two, which are 43 and 44. Now,
2 3 4 5 6	Q. — inclusive? Are all of these photographs true and accurate depictions of how the victims' house appeared when you were out there on — A. Yes, ma'am. MS. CALLAGHAN: The State would offer State's Exhibit 42 through 62 inclusive subject to tendering them to	1 2 3 4 5 6	A. Yes. Q. And then there is other furniture here that's depicted, dressers and A. Yes. Q. Let's go to the next two, which are 43 and 44. Now, for the record can you tell us, State's Exhibit 43, what this
2 3 4 5 6 7	Q inclusive? Are all of these photographs true and accurate depictions of how the victims' house appeared when you were out there on A. Yes, ma'am. MS. CALLAGHAN: The State would offer State's Exhibit 42 through 62 inclusive subject to tendering them to Defense counsel for inspection.	1 2 3 4 5 6 7	A. Yes. Q. And then there is other furniture here that's depicted, dressers and A. Yes. Q. Let's go to the next two, which are 43 and 44. Now, for the record can you tell us, State's Exhibit 43, what this depicts?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Q. — inclusive? Are all of these photographs true and accurate depictions of how the victims' house appeared when you were out there on — A. Yes, ma'am. MS. CALLAGHAN: The State would offer State's Exhibit 42 through 62 inclusive subject to tendering them to Defense counsel for inspection. VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8	 A. Yes. Q. And then there is other furniture here that's depicted, dressers and A. Yes. Q. Let's go to the next two, which are 43 and 44. Now, for the record can you tell us, State's Exhibit 43, what this depicts? A. These are Item 9 and 10 was the blood on the carpet
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Q. — inclusive? Are all of these photographs true and accurate depictions of how the victims' house appeared when you were out there on — A. Yes, ma'am. MS. CALLAGHAN: The State would offer State's Exhibit 42 through 62 inclusive subject to tendering them to Defense counsel for inspection. VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION BY MR. RAY:	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	A. Yes. Q. And then there is other furniture here that's depicted, dressers and A. Yes. Q. Let's go to the next two, which are 43 and 44. Now, for the record can you tell us, State's Exhibit 43, what this depicts? A. These are Item 9 and 10 was the blood on the carpet and we collected the piece of carpet. And this is blood on the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Q inclusive? Are all of these photographs true and accurate depictions of how the victims' house appeared when you were out there on A. Yes, ma'am. MS. CALLAGHAN: The State would offer State's Exhibit 42 through 62 inclusive subject to tendering them to Defense counsel for inspection. VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION BY MR. RAY: Q. Officer, there was a dishwasher that's in one of these	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	A. Yes. Q. And then there is other furniture here that's depicted, dressers and A. Yes. Q. Let's go to the next two, which are 43 and 44. Now, for the record can you tell us, State's Exhibit 43, what this depicts? A. These are Item 9 and 10 was the blood on the carpet and we collected the piece of carpet. And this is blood on the comforter that was on the bed, and that's just the first picture
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Q inclusive? Are all of these photographs true and accurate depictions of how the victims' house appeared when you were out there on A. Yes, ma'am. MS. CALLAGHAN: The State would offer State's Exhibit 42 through 62 inclusive subject to tendering them to Defense counsel for inspection. VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION BY MR. RAY: Q. Officer, there was a dishwasher that's in one of these photographs, State's Exhibit 58. The door is open to the	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	A. Yes. Q. And then there is other furniture here that's depicted, dressers and A. Yes. Q. Let's go to the next two, which are 43 and 44. Now, for the record can you tell us, State's Exhibit 43, what this depicts? A. These are Item 9 and 10 was the blood on the carpet and we collected the piece of carpet. And this is blood on the comforter that was on the bed, and that's just the first picture we see before.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Q inclusive? Are all of these photographs true and accurate depictions of how the victims' house appeared when you were out there on A. Yes, ma'am. MS. CALLAGHAN: The State would offer State's Exhibit 42 through 62 inclusive subject to tendering them to Defense counsel for inspection. VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION BY MR. RAY: Q. Officer, there was a dishwasher that's in one of these photographs, State's Exhibit 58. The door is open to the dishwasher. Is that the way it was when you saw it?	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	A. Yes. Q. And then there is other furniture here that's depicted, dressers and A. Yes. Q. Let's go to the next two, which are 43 and 44. Now, for the record can you tell us, State's Exhibit 43, what this depicts? A. These are Item 9 and 10 was the blood on the carpet and we collected the piece of carpet. And this is blood on the comforter that was on the bed, and that's just the first picture we see before. Q. Referring now to State's Exhibit No. 44, you can see
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Q. — inclusive? Are all of these photographs true and accurate depictions of how the victims' house appeared when you were out there on — A. Yes, ma'am. MS. CALLAGHAN: The State would offer State's Exhibit 42 through 62 inclusive subject to tendering them to Defense counsel for inspection. VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION BY MR. RAY: Q. Officer, there was a dishwasher that's in one of these photographs, State's Exhibit 58. The door is open to the dishwasher. Is that the way it was when you saw it? A. No, sir.	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	A. Yes. Q. And then there is other furniture here that's depicted, dressers and A. Yes. Q. Let's go to the next two, which are 43 and 44. Now, for the record can you tell us, State's Exhibit 43, what this depicts? A. These are Item 9 and 10 was the blood on the carpet and we collected the piece of carpet. And this is blood on the comforter that was on the bed, and that's just the first picture we see before. Q. Referring now to State's Exhibit No. 44, you can see that there are numerous small, dark stains right here by the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Q. — inclusive? Are all of these photographs true and accurate depictions of how the victims' house appeared when you were out there on — A. Yes, ma'am. MS. CALLAGHAN: The State would offer State's Exhibit 42 through 62 inclusive subject to tendering them to Defense counsel for inspection. VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION BY MR. RAY: Q. Officer, there was a dishwasher that's in one of these photographs, State's Exhibit 58. The door is open to the dishwasher. Is that the way it was when you saw it? A. No, sir. Q. You opened it yourself?	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	A. Yes. Q. And then there is other furniture here that's depicted, dressers and A. Yes. Q. Let's go to the next two, which are 43 and 44. Now, for the record can you tell us, State's Exhibit 43, what this depicts? A. These are Item 9 and 10 was the blood on the carpet and we collected the piece of carpet. And this is blood on the comforter that was on the bed, and that's just the first picture we see before. Q. Referring now to State's Exhibit No. 44, you can see that there are numerous small, dark stains right here by the side of the bed, correct?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Q. — inclusive? Are all of these photographs true and accurate depictions of how the victims' house appeared when you were out there on — A. Yes, ma'am. MS. CALLAGHAN: The State would offer State's Exhibit 42 through 62 inclusive subject to tendering them to Defense counsel for inspection. VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION BY MR. RAY: Q. Officer, there was a dishwasher that's in one of these photographs, State's Exhibit 58. The door is open to the dishwasher. Is that the way it was when you saw it? A. No, sir. Q. You opened it yourself? A. Yes, sir.	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	A. Yes. Q. And then there is other furniture here that's depicted, dressers and A. Yes. Q. Let's go to the next two, which are 43 and 44. Now, for the record can you tell us, State's Exhibit 43, what this depicts? A. These are Item 9 and 10 was the blood on the carpet and we collected the piece of carpet. And this is blood on the comforter that was on the bed, and that's just the first picture we see before. Q. Referring now to State's Exhibit No. 44, you can see that there are numerous small, dark stains right here by the side of the bed, correct? A. Yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Q. — inclusive? Are all of these photographs true and accurate depictions of how the victims' house appeared when you were out there on — A. Yes, ma'am. MS. CALLAGHAN: The State would offer State's Exhibit 42 through 62 inclusive subject to tendering them to Defense counsel for inspection. VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION BY MR. RAY: Q. Officer, there was a dishwasher that's in one of these photographs, State's Exhibit 58. The door is open to the dishwasher. Is that the way it was when you saw it? A. No, sir. Q. You opened it yourself? A. Yes, sir. Q. In 59 there was a drawer that was open when you took	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	A. Yes. Q. And then there is other furniture here that's depicted, dressers and A. Yes. Q. Let's go to the next two, which are 43 and 44. Now, for the record can you tell us, State's Exhibit 43, what this depicts? A. These are Item 9 and 10 was the blood on the carpet and we collected the piece of carpet. And this is blood on the comforter that was on the bed, and that's just the first picture we see before. Q. Referring now to State's Exhibit No. 44, you can see that there are numerous small, dark stains right here by the side of the bed, correct? A. Yes. Q. And there are dark stains on the comforter itself.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Q. — inclusive? Are all of these photographs true and accurate depictions of how the victims' house appeared when you were out there on — A. Yes, ma'am. MS. CALLAGHAN: The State would offer State's Exhibit 42 through 62 inclusive subject to tendering them to Defense counsel for inspection. VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION BY MR. RAY: Q. Officer, there was a dishwasher that's in one of these photographs, State's Exhibit 58. The door is open to the dishwasher. Is that the way it was when you saw it? A. No, sir. Q. You opened it yourself? A. Yes, sir. Q. In 59 there was a drawer that was open when you took pictures of it. Was that open when you —	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	A. Yes. Q. And then there is other furniture here that's depicted, dressers and A. Yes. Q. Let's go to the next two, which are 43 and 44. Now, for the record can you tell us, State's Exhibit 43, what this depicts? A. These are Item 9 and 10 was the blood on the carpet and we collected the piece of carpet. And this is blood on the comforter that was on the bed, and that's just the first picture we see before. Q. Referring now to State's Exhibit No. 44, you can see that there are numerous small, dark stains right here by the side of the bed, correct? A. Yes. Q. And there are dark stains on the comforter itself. A. Yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Q. — inclusive? Are all of these photographs true and accurate depictions of how the victims' house appeared when you were out there on — A. Yes, ma'am. MS. CALLAGHAN: The State would offer State's Exhibit 42 through 62 inclusive subject to tendering them to Defense counsel for inspection. VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION BY MR. RAY: Q. Officer, there was a dishwasher that's in one of these photographs, State's Exhibit 58. The door is open to the dishwasher. Is that the way it was when you saw it? A. No, sir. Q. You opened it yourself? A. Yes, sir. Q. In 59 there was a drawer that was open when you took pictures of it. Was that open when you — A. No, it was closed.	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. Yes. Q. And then there is other furniture here that's depicted, dressers and A. Yes. Q. Let's go to the next two, which are 43 and 44. Now, for the record can you tell us, State's Exhibit 43, what this depicts? A. These are Item 9 and 10 was the blood on the carpet and we collected the piece of carpet. And this is blood on the comforter that was on the bed, and that's just the first picture we see before. Q. Referring now to State's Exhibit No. 44, you can see that there are numerous small, dark stains right here by the side of the bed, correct? A. Yes. Q. And there are dark stains on the comforter itself. A. Yes. Q. These are bloodstains that ultimately were collected?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Q. — inclusive? Are all of these photographs true and accurate depictions of how the victims' house appeared when you were out there on — A. Yes, ma'am. MS. CALLAGHAN: The State would offer State's Exhibit 42 through 62 inclusive subject to tendering them to Defense counsel for inspection. VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION BY MR. RAY: Q. Officer, there was a dishwasher that's in one of these photographs, State's Exhibit 58. The door is open to the dishwasher. Is that the way it was when you saw it? A. No, sir. Q. You opened it yourself? A. Yes, sir. Q. In 59 there was a drawer that was open when you took pictures of it. Was that open when you— A. No, it was closed. Q. Here in several of these photographs there are doors	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	A. Yes. Q. And then there is other furniture here that's depicted, dressers and A. Yes. Q. Let's go to the next two, which are 43 and 44. Now, for the record can you tell us, State's Exhibit 43, what this depicts? A. These are Item 9 and 10 was the blood on the carpet and we collected the piece of carpet. And this is blood on the comforter that was on the bed, and that's just the first picture we see before. Q. Referring now to State's Exhibit No. 44, you can see that there are numerous small, dark stains right here by the side of the bed, correct? A. Yes. Q. And there are dark stains on the comforter itself. A. Yes. Q. These are bloodstains that ultimately were collected? A. Yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Q. — inclusive? Are all of these photographs true and accurate depictions of how the victims' house appeared when you were out there on — A. Yes, ma'am. MS. CALLAGHAN: The State would offer State's Exhibit 42 through 62 inclusive subject to tendering them to Defense counsel for inspection. VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION BY MR. RAY: Q. Officer, there was a dishwasher that's in one of these photographs, State's Exhibit 58. The door is open to the dishwasher. Is that the way it was when you saw it? A. No, sir. Q. You opened it yourself? A. Yes, sir. Q. In 59 there was a drawer that was open when you took pictures of it. Was that open when you — A. No, it was closed. Q. Here in several of these photographs there are doors to closets, hallways, looks like there was one by a washing	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	A. Yes. Q. And then there is other furniture here that's depicted, dressers and A. Yes. Q. Let's go to the next two, which are 43 and 44. Now, for the record can you tell us, State's Exhibit 43, what this depicts? A. These are Item 9 and 10 was the blood on the carpet and we collected the piece of carpet. And this is blood on the comforter that was on the bed, and that's just the first picture we see before. Q. Referring now to State's Exhibit No. 44, you can see that there are numerous small, dark stains right here by the side of the bed, correct? A. Yes. Q. And there are dark stains on the comforter itself. A. Yes. Q. These are bloodstains that ultimately were collected? A. Yes. Q. Now, let me show you State's Exhibits 45 and 46.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q. — inclusive? Are all of these photographs true and accurate depictions of how the victims' house appeared when you were out there on — A. Yes, ma'am. MS. CALLAGHAN: The State would offer State's Exhibit 42 through 62 inclusive subject to tendering them to Defense counsel for inspection. VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION BY MR. RAY: Q. Officer, there was a dishwasher that's in one of these photographs, State's Exhibit 58. The door is open to the dishwasher. Is that the way it was when you saw it? A. No, sir. Q. You opened it yourself? A. Yes, sir. Q. In 59 there was a drawer that was open when you took pictures of it. Was that open when you — A. No, it was closed. Q. Here in several of these photographs there are doors to closets, hallways, looks like there was one by a washing machine that are open. Is that the way you saw them?	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A. Yes. Q. And then there is other furniture here that's depicted, dressers and A. Yes. Q. Let's go to the next two, which are 43 and 44. Now, for the record can you tell us, State's Exhibit 43, what this depicts? A. These are Item 9 and 10 was the blood on the carpet and we collected the piece of carpet. And this is blood on the comforter that was on the bed, and that's just the first picture we see before. Q. Referring now to State's Exhibit No. 44, you can see that there are numerous small, dark stains right here by the side of the bed, correct? A. Yes. Q. And there are dark stains on the comforter itself. A. Yes. Q. These are bloodstains that ultimately were collected? A. Yes. Q. Now, let me show you State's Exhibits 45 and 46. These are even closer photographs of the same items, correct?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q. — inclusive? Are all of these photographs true and accurate depictions of how the victims' house appeared when you were out there on — A. Yes, ma'am. MS. CALLAGHAN: The State would offer State's Exhibit 42 through 62 inclusive subject to tendering them to Defense counsel for inspection. VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION BY MR. RAY: Q. Officer, there was a dishwasher that's in one of these photographs, State's Exhibit 58. The door is open to the dishwasher. Is that the way it was when you saw it? A. No, sir. Q. You opened it yourself? A. Yes, sir. Q. In 59 there was a drawer that was open when you took pictures of it. Was that open when you — A. No, it was closed. Q. Here in several of these photographs there are doors to closets, hallways, looks like there was one by a washing machine that are open. Is that the way you saw them? A. No.	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A. Yes. Q. And then there is other furniture here that's depicted, dressers and — A. Yes. Q. Let's go to the next two, which are 43 and 44. Now, for the record can you tell us, State's Exhibit 43, what this depicts? A. These are — Item 9 and 10 was the blood on the carpet and we collected the piece of carpet. And this is blood on the comforter that was on the bed, and that's just the first picture we see before. Q. Referring now to State's Exhibit No. 44, you can see that there are numerous small, dark stains right here by the side of the bed, correct? A. Yes. Q. And there are dark stains on the comforter itself. A. Yes. Q. These are bloodstains that ultimately were collected? A. Yes. Q. Now, let me show you State's Exhibits 45 and 46. These are even closer photographs of the same items, correct? A. Yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q. — inclusive? Are all of these photographs true and accurate depictions of how the victims' house appeared when you were out there on — A. Yes, ma'am. MS. CALLAGHAN: The State would offer State's Exhibit 42 through 62 inclusive subject to tendering them to Defense counsel for inspection. VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION BY MR. RAY: Q. Officer, there was a dishwasher that's in one of these photographs, State's Exhibit 58. The door is open to the dishwasher. Is that the way it was when you saw it? A. No, sir. Q. You opened it yourself? A. Yes, sir. Q. In 59 there was a drawer that was open when you took pictures of it. Was that open when you — A. No, it was closed. Q. Here in several of these photographs there are doors to closets, hallways, looks like there was one by a washing machine that are open. Is that the way you saw them? A. No. Q. So some of them were closed and some of them were not?	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	A. Yes. Q. And then there is other furniture here that's depicted, dressers and A. Yes. Q. Let's go to the next two, which are 43 and 44. Now, for the record can you tell us, State's Exhibit 43, what this depicts? A. These are Item 9 and 10 was the blood on the carpet and we collected the piece of carpet. And this is blood on the comforter that was on the bed, and that's just the first picture we see before. Q. Referring now to State's Exhibit No. 44, you can see that there are numerous small, dark stains right here by the side of the bed, correct? A. Yes. Q. And there are dark stains on the comforter itself. A. Yes. Q. These are bloodstains that ultimately were collected? A. Yes. Q. Now, let me show you State's Exhibits 45 and 46. These are even closer photographs of the same items, correct? A. Yes. Q. And for the record, State's Exhibit No. 45 contains
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	Q. — inclusive? Are all of these photographs true and accurate depictions of how the victims' house appeared when you were out there on — A. Yes, ma'am. MS. CALLAGHAN: The State would offer State's Exhibit 42 through 62 inclusive subject to tendering them to Defense counsel for inspection. VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION BY MR. RAY: Q. Officer, there was a dishwasher that's in one of these photographs, State's Exhibit 58. The door is open to the dishwasher. Is that the way it was when you saw it? A. No, sir. Q. You opened it yourself? A. Yes, sir. Q. In 59 there was a drawer that was open when you took pictures of it. Was that open when you — A. No, it was closed. Q. Here in several of these photographs there are doors to closets, hallways, looks like there was one by a washing machine that are open. Is that the way you saw them? A. No.	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	A. Yes. Q. And then there is other furniture here that's depicted, dressers and — A. Yes. Q. Let's go to the next two, which are 43 and 44. Now, for the record can you tell us, State's Exhibit 43, what this depicts? A. These are — Item 9 and 10 was the blood on the carpet and we collected the piece of carpet. And this is blood on the comforter that was on the bed, and that's just the first picture we see before. Q. Referring now to State's Exhibit No. 44, you can see that there are numerous small, dark stains right here by the side of the bed, correct? A. Yes. Q. And there are dark stains on the comforter itself. A. Yes. Q. These are bloodstains that ultimately were collected? A. Yes. Q. Now, let me show you State's Exhibits 45 and 46. These are even closer photographs of the same items, correct? A. Yes.

Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Condense 163/17 Page 7 of 64 PageID 4643

Page 9

1 which is what you used to mark the piece of carpet you

2 collected.

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Okay. Now let's move along to a different area of the

5 house. Can you tell us what State's Exhibits 47 and 48 are?

6 A. This is the kitchen, this area right here.

Q. For the record you are pointing at the upper

8 right-hand section of State's Exhibit No. 8 in the big square

9 marked picture?

10 A. Yes.

7

11 Q. From what vantage point would you be looking at

12 State's Exhibit 47?

13 A. This is in the front entry. The picture was taken

14 about in this area right here viewing this way. This is the

15 back door right here.

16 Q. Okay. You are standing in the kitchen photographing

17 the back-door area.

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. What about this one, State's Exhibit 48?

A. This is standing in this area right here and taking a

21 picture back this way.

Q. Okay. So you are standing in the doorway and looking

23 towards the -- what would you call that?

24 A. We called it an island.

Q. The island containing the stove top.

Page 10

A. Right,
 O. Okay.

25

Q. Okay. Let's go to State's Exhibits 49 and 50. Can

3 you tell us what 49 is?

4 A. This is a picture of this area right here taken

5 from standing about right here.

6 Q. The area you just put your finger on in State's

7 Exhibit No. 8 is marked by dot 6, in the picture, correct?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. What State's Exhibit No. --

10 A. This is a picture of -- this is the refrigerator and

11 this is a picture going back into the hardwood flooring of this

12 formal dining room. So this is looking down kind of like this

13 from this area looking back this way.

14 Q. Okay. So there is piece of carpeting on the floor in

15 front of the refrigerator, which is depicted right inside the

16 door of the kitchen to the left, correct?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. And it shows some bloodstains on that, correct?

19 A. Yes.

20 MS. CALLAGHAN: If I may inquire of the jury,

21 Your Honor, can everyone see; there is no glare?

22 (No response)

Q. Okay. Let's go to State's Exhibits 51 and 52 for

24 identification. These are pictures, correct?

5 A. Yes.

1 O. Can you tell us what area it is in 51?

A. This is the island right here and this is the carpet

3 that was right here and this is the dishwasher that was right

4 here. So it is taken from standing right here aiming down like

Page 11

Page 12

5 that to show all of the -- this area right in here.

Q. Okay. And there are dots of blood on the floor that

7 are depicted in State's Exhibit 51, correct?

A. Yes.

9 O. And the general area is shown by these three red dots,

10 23, 24 and 25.

A. This blood right here would be on the ground right

12 here. These were actually some items that we took from that

13 area --

14 Q. What I'm saying is the area that is shown in here

15 is --

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. They are the same area as the photograph.

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. All right. And State's Exhibit 52?

20 A. Just a picture of the refrigerator.

21 Q. Okay. Let's go on to 53 and 54.

A. Direct picture of the dishwasher standing about right

23 here directly at it showing the blood on the dishwasher and on

24 the floor.

22

Q. There is blood on the surface of the dishwasher?

1 A. Yes.

2 O. What about 54?

A. That is the same area, but now it's got a marker.

4 Q. And I am referring to State's Exhibit No. 54, which

5 has a number "5" in the center of the dots of blood.

6 A. And that's right in front of the dishwasher.

7 Q. Let's go to State's Exhibit 55 and 56.

A. This is depicting blood on the dishwasher handle in

9 front here.

10 O. That's State's Exhibit 55?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. That is where on this diagram?

13 A. Right here.

14 Q. What about State's Exhibit No. 56?

15 A. This is the -- there was -- right here is Item 6

16 marked six, and that was this area right in here, a closeup of

17 it.

18 Q. State's Exhibit 56, there is a yellow number where you

19 marked an item retrieved, No. 6 --

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. -- and it corresponds to No. 6 in the diagram.

22 A. Yes.

Q. Okay. Let's go to State's Exhibits 57 and 58.

24 A. There was some blood on this drawer, so we took a

25 picture of it and then we'll put a marker there.

CondenseItTM

Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Filed 11/03/17 Page 8 of 64 PageID 4644 Page 15 1 Q. In State's Exhibit 8, the diagram, there is a red dot 1 Exhibits 7 and 63. 2 on one of the counter surfaces marked 7, and that corresponds 2 MR. RAY: No objection. 3 with the 7 in the photograph, correct? 3 THE COURT: 7 and 63 are admitted. A. Yes. 4 (State's Exhibit No. 7 and 63 received) Q. What about State's Exhibit 58? 5 O. Come on down here. I'm just running you ragged. A. After we found the blood on the dishwasher in front, 6 Come on over here. 7 we opened it up and we found the blood inside the dishwasher. A. This is the front entry. Q. Okay. Let's go to State's Exhibit 59 and 60. Q. The front door? A. This is just a drawer that we pulled out just to -- in A. Yes. 10 the process of looking through things, we pulled it out and took Q. Even though it was April, it appears somebody still 10 11 a picture of it. It's right here in this corner area, and -- we 11 had their Christmas decorations, didn't they? 12 didn't -- I don't believe that -- well, the towel was not 12 A. Yes. 13 collected. 13 O. There is a snowman on the front door. 14 Q. And State's Exhibit No. 60? Let's look at State's Exhibit 63. This is kind 14 15 A. This is a picture of the rear door, which is this area 15 of a montage, correct? 16 right here. 16 A. Yes. This is -- it is the detached -- I called it a 17 Q. All right. Now, there is a small room at the very top 17 garage apartment. There was not anybody living in there, and it 18 marked "back porch." 18 was just directly south of this area right here. It would be 19 A. Yes. 19 sitting right here. 20 Q. Is that a sun-room type deal? 20 Q. And you are referring to the very top left-hand 21 A. Yes, uh-huh, enclosed with an exit out towards the 21 portion of the State's Exhibit 8, the diagram, correct? 22 south of the residence. A. Yes. 23 Q. Okay. Now, State's Exhibits 61 and 62, can you tell 23 Q. Now, if you will come back over here, right outside 24 the jury what these are? 24 that sun room where the door to the sun room is, there is kind 25 A. These are the upstairs -- it's been a long time since 25 of a deck, right? Page 14 Page 16 1 I have been up there, but if I remember correctly, I believe it A. Yes, ma'am. 1 2 is upstairs, two upstairs bedrooms. 2 Q. And this comes directly out the back of the house? 3 Q. There were two bedrooms? A. Yes. A. Yes, two upstairs bedrooms and one bathroom. Q. And there is a sidewalk on the bottom of State's Q. And you took one general picture of each room just to 5 Exhibit 63, and when you reached the end of the sidewalk, what 6 document it? 6 is back here? A. Yes. 7 That's the detached garage. 8 Q. But there was nothing of significance found. Q. Okay. A. Behind -- it is detached. 10 Q. Okay. You can go ahead and have a seat. 10 Q. So there is actually another building behind the 11 A. (Witness complies) 11 yellow building -- another building --12 Q. Now, let me ask you to go ahead and take a look at 12 A. Right. Completely detached. Each building is 13 State's Exhibits 7 and 63 for identification. Do you recognize 13 separated. 14 these? Q. Okay. Let's go ahead and show over here. There is a 15 A. Yes. 15 deck that is in the back of the house depicted on the left hand O. What is State's Exhibit No. 7? 16 16 side as you are facing State's Exhibit 63, right? 17 A. Front entry. 17 A. Yes. 18 Q. That's the front door of the house? 18 Q. And you are coming out that back door of the house, A. Front door of the residence and this is the front of 19 you would come down here and at the bottom there is a sidewalk 20 the detached -- it was like -- had a little mini garage like a 20 that goes around. 21 little apartment kind of. 21 A. Yes. 22 Q. Are these true and accurate depictions of the way the 22 Q. This is kind of the detached apartment in front but 23 front and back of the house appeared on --23 there is also a detached garage behind that, correct?

24

25

A. Correct.

Q. Okay. Now let me show you some more photographs in

24

25

A. Yes.

MS. CALLAGHAN: The State would offer State's

Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Cpndense 103/17 Page 9 of 64 Page 10 4645

1 stack 4. Go ahead and take a look at those for me.

- 2 A. (Witness complies)
- 3 Q. Now, have you examined State's Exhibits No. 64 through
- 4 72 inclusive?
- A. Yes.
- 6 Q. Are they true and accurate depictions of the way the
- 7 victims' house appeared on April 8, 2003?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 MS. CALLAGHAN: State would tender State's
- 10 Exhibits 64 through 72 to Defense Counsel for their inspection,
- 11 and we would also offer them into evidence.
- 12 MR. MOORE: No objection.
- THE COURT: 64 through 72 are admitted.
- 14 (State's Exhibit No. 64 through 72 received)
- 15 Q. Come on over here and start with State's Exhibits 64
- 16 and 65. Starting with this half of the jury, let's show them
- 17 what these are.
- 18 A. This is the rear door.
- 19 Q. You are referring to State's Exhibit 64?
- 20 A. 64 is the rear door. That is what I am referring to
- 21 as the rear door. This is just to that back porch area.
- Q. You are talking about the door that leaves the kitchen
- 23 and goes into the sun room, correct?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. Okay. And this is just an area showing the rear entry

A. In 70 this is just another picture of the garage, just

Page 19

Page 20

- 2 from another angle.
- 3 Q. This is taken from the doorway looking in?
- 4 A. Yes. And this is another picture of -- we found some
- 5 blood right here, and this is a picture of it.
- 6 Q. Now, on the right-hand side of State's Exhibit No. 71
- 7 there is a door frame. Is this the door where you come into the
- 8 garage?
- A. Yes --
- 10 Q. And then there is blood on the floor that's a few feet
- 11 in front of the garage door, correct?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. If you were parking a car pulling it in directly to
- 14 that door, which side of the garage would the driver's door be
- 15 on?

16

- A. If they were pulling a car --
- 17 Q. Front first.
- 18 A. Front first, then that would be where the driver's
- 19 area would be.
- 20 Q. Where you see this blood, correct?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. Okay. All right. Let's reexplain that over here to
- 23 this half of the jury.
- A. Okay. This is just another view of inside the
- 25 garage. There was only one doorway into the garage that you saw

- 1 door would be back inside here. This is that deck area to the
- 2 rear of the residence?
- 3 A. Okay.
- 4 Q. Okay. And in State's Exhibit No. 65 what you are
- 5 seeing is the door on the -- going from the outside to the back
- 6 room?
- 7 A. That picture is taken from this area showing this area
- 8 right here.
- 9 Q. And you are referring to the upper left-hand corner of
- 10 State's Exhibit No. 8 where there is a space for the door.
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. All right. State's Exhibits 66 and 67, if we can
- 13 start with this half of the jury, can you tell us what this is?
- 14 A. This is just standing in front of that deck, rear --
- 15 that rear sun room and showing back towards the residence, and
- 16 this is -- 67 is the -- this is actually the detached apartment
- 17 garage. The detached garage is actually behind that, and it is
- 18 just showing back towards the residence.
- 19 Q. Okay. Okay. Now, State's Exhibit No. 68, starting
- 20 with this half of the jury, can you tell us what that is?
- 21 A. This is the doorway leading into the detached garage
- 22 which is the southern building. The apartment garage is right
- 23 in this area right here. There is a walkway that goes around to
- 24 it. And 69 is inside the garage.
- Q. Now let's show them State's Exhibits 70 and 71.

- 1 last picture. This is just another view of that and then
- 2 looking right down the side of the garage in 71 here, there was
- 3 blood found right here. And if a vehicle were pulled head-in,
- 4 then that would be approximately right where the driver's door
- 5 area would be.
- 6 Q. Okay. So here is the doorway on the right-hand side
- 7 of State's Exhibit 71, the doorway where you come into the
- 8 garage. You can see the door post here. And if you pull the
- 9 car in directly nose-first into the garage, the driver's door
- 10 would be approximately where the blood drops are on the ground,
- 11 correct?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. Okay. And State's Exhibit No. 72, is this a closeup
- 14 of the --
- 15 A. Closeup of Item 8.
- Q. Item 8 was a blood drop where a sample was on the
- 17 garage floor?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. And this is a closeup of that marked by the plastic
- 20 number 8.
- 21 A. Yes.
- Q. Now, it appears from looking at all the State's
- 23 exhibits that we introduced and talked about, there are a number
- 24 of photographs in there of dots of blood in various areas of the
- 25 house.

Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Filed 211 /03/17 Page 10 of 64 PageID 4646

- 1 A. Yes.
- Q. Why were those dots of blood, those trails of blood,
- 3 significant to you?
- 4 A. It appears that after during the victims were
- 5 injured, that after we found the knife blade, it's pretty
- 6 common that when someone is stabbed and a knife blade and
- 7 that one was bent also and broken -- that it probably struck
- 8 bone, which would lead -- a person who was stabbing that person,
- 9 their hand will slip. As the blade stops, their hand keeps
- 10 going, they are cut.
- 11 So it was pretty obvious from working many a many
- 12 a scene that that was probably not our victims' blood; it was
- 13 the actor's blood.
- 14 So that's when we go back and put cones down
- 15 throughout various locations hoping to find the actor's blood.
- 16 Q. The trail of drops itself, the fact that it was mobile
- 17 and was all over the house including the garage, suggested
- 18 moving when a person left those drops, correct?
- 19 A. Yes.
- Q. And it is common, you said, for people in the course
- 21 of an attack if the knife has no guard, for them to cut
- 22 themselves.
- 23 A. Yes.
- Q. So you felt like that was a significant piece of
- 25 evidence you needed to record.

- 1 we want to record where evidence is if it is -- you know, if
- 2 it's significant that a measurement get made on it, we want to

Page 23

Page 24

- 3 tie that into the scene, into a location.
- 4 Q. So you record the measurements where evidence is
- 5 physically located, you make measurements so that that can be
- 6 preserved later in the event it becomes significant.
- A. Yes.
- 8 Q. It isn't always meaningful, but sometimes it is.
- A. Correct.
- 10 Q. Then do you go through the process of collecting
- 11 evidence?
- 12 A. Yes.
- Q. Can you give the ladies and gentlemen an idea of how
- 14 you go about collecting evidence?
- 15 A. Okay. When I was collecting blood evidence, what I
- 16 will do is I will take two swabs of cloth and -- sterile cloth,
- 17 and we use distilled water. We put a little distilled water on
- 8 one cloth, and we'll call that a control sample.
- 19 So if I have blood on this piece of wood, I am
- 20 going to take a couple of drops of distilled water. Here is my
- 21 blood sample. I am going to wipe close to it and let that dry
- 22 and put it in an envelope. That's a control. I will tell you
- 23 what that does in just a second.
- 24 Then I will take my other cloth. And if the
- 25 blood is wet, I will just dip it in there, get a good sample.

Page 22

- A. Very.
- 2 Q. Now, after you photographed the scene, what did you do
- 3 next?

1

- 4 A. After the photographs -- like I said, there was a --
- 5 on a scene this extensive, there are a number of things that
- 6 have to be done. And as we are finishing photographing, then we
- 7 want to try to get measurements before we do anything else. We
- 8 don't want to move anything until we get everything recorded as
- 9 it's laying on the ground, so we'll start taking measurements.
- 10 And Officer Wallace began taking measurements,
- 11 and then later I believe Officer Sullivan was assisting him
- 12 doing that. And as Officer Wallace was beginning the
- 13 measurements, myself and Detective McCaskill would probably be
- 14 doing a little other searching for more evidence that we can
- 15 photograph before anything gets moved. We would like to try to
- 16 find evidence anywhere we can and photograph it before anything
- 17 gets moved. So that was probably that process.
- 18 At a scene like this -- and I have worked many --
- 19 you have got an assist officer or a couple of assist officers,
- 20 crime scene officers, and you ask them to do something; and then
- 21 while they're doing that, I'm doing something else.
- Q. Okay. Well, let me ask you this. What is your
- 23 purpose in taking measurements?
- 24 A. Well, you want to record where everything is as it
- 25 lays on the ground. That is my job, and that's what we do. So

- 1 If it's dried blood, I will put a little distilled water on my
- 2 cloth, rub it and -- because sometimes you have to wipe it off
- 3 there. I will let that dry and put that in an envelope.
- 4 The control tells whoever is looking at the blood
- 5 what all is on the surface of this because it may have cleaner,
- 6 they may have spilled Coke, there may be all kinds of elements
- 7 in that blood when I wipe it off, and a control will tell them
- 8 what all is in there and they can subtract that from what all is
- 9 in the blood to find what they need to find.
- 10 Q. Okay. So that's how you recover blood evidence at the
- 11 scene?
- 12 A. Yes
- 13 Q. And how do you obtain and preserve other items of
- 14 evidence?
- 15 A. The other items -- like I say, after they have been
- 16 photographed, measured, we will -- always, of course, wearing
- 17 gloves -- just pick them up, place them in a bag, and they are
- 18 packaged -- everything is packaged separately, and we will just
- 19 put it in a property-storage area inside the residence until at
- 20 one time I and my assist officers can take that all out to my
- 21 van.
- Q. Okay. And what do you do with the evidence once you
- 23 have physically taken it, preserved it and placed it in the van?
- 24 A. After I get back to my processing room at the crime
- 25 scene office, then I will -- if I can, I'll mark it. If it is

Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Condensol 3/17 Page 11 of 64 PageID 4647

Page 25

1 going to contaminate -- and usually you won't mark blood

- 2 evidence because you don't want your marking pen to contaminate
- 3 anything.
- 4 So you just package it and seal it, which is as
- 5 good, and then you can mark the package, which is just as good
- 6 as marking an item because that's another way of marking
- 7 something without actually physically marking it to know that it
- 8 has been properly maintained.
- 9 Q. Okay. Looking at your list there, do you have your
- 10 report with you?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. Okay. Go over your list and tell the ladies and
- 13 gentlemen all of the physical evidence that you recovered from
- 14 the scene.
- 15 A. Okay. Well Items 1 through 8 and -- and they are all
- 16 on that board except for Item 8. And Item 8 was the blood
- 17 sample from the garage. We just didn't have room to put that on
- 18 there. But Items 1 through 8 were blood samples and -- of
- 19 course, I collected all the blood and all the controls and then
- 20 11 1 through 8 are blood samples, and I just go 1 through 31
- 21 because we had 31 items we collected.
- Item 9 was the comforter in the south bedroom,
- 23 state's Exhibit No. 10 was the -- a piece of carpet by the bed
- 24 by that comforter, and then Items 11 through 14 were more blood
- 25 samples.

Page 26

- Items 15, 16, 17-A and 17-B were tile that we
- 2 found that were -- had bloody shoe prints on them that were
- 3 collected, and then Item 18 was the piggy bank, and then 19 was
- 4 a pair of eye glasses that were bloodstained, and they were
- 5 between -- Items 19 and 20 was a necklace. They were
- 6 bloodstained and they were by the two victims.
- And Item 21 was a small picture on that bed, and
- 8 Item 22 was the blade in the bathroom that was blood covered.
- 9 And Items 23 and 24 were more blood samples. Then 25-A and B,
- 10 26, 27, 28 and 29 were processed tiles from that first front
- 11 entryway that we later picked up and processed them chemically
- 12 out on the scene, and then Items 30 and 31 were the bathroom
- 13 tiles that we processed on the scene.
- 14 Q. Okay. Well, let's go back and talk about some of the
- 15 specific blood samples that were taken. Okay?
- 16 A. Okay.
- 17 Q. Let's talk about blood sample No. 7. Can you tell us
- 18 where that came from? And if you could, step down and show us
- 19 on the diagram where item 7 was taken.
- 20 A. That was taken from the second drawer -- there was a
- 21 row of -- I believe it was four drawers. And it was on the
- 22 front of the second drawer of this row of drawers right here in
- 23 the kitchen.
- Q. What about Item No. 8, blood sample No. 8?
- A. It was out in the garage, the detached garage on the

- 1 side where if a vehicle were pulled head-in, it would be on the
- 2 driver's side.
- 3 Q. What about sample 1?
- 4 A. Sample 1 was taken from right in the front entry right
- 5 here on this front entry tile.
- Q. What about item No. 23?
- 7 A. 23 -- let me check my report.
- O. Go ahead.
- 9 A. Yeah, it was on the front of the dishwasher.
- 10 O. Can you show where that was?
- 11 A. That would be right here. It was kind of on that
- 12 knob. I believe the picture showed it was on the knob.
 - O. Okay. So there were specific samples that were taken
- 14 from the drawer, that were taken from the dishwasher, that were
- 15 taken from the tiles in the front and one from the floor in the
- 16 garage that's marked 8, correct?
- 17 A. Uh-huh.

13

- 18 Q. And you took both a blood sample and a control sample;
- 19 is that correct?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. Now, why don't you come over here. Did you have an
- 22 opportunity to bring the physical evidence from the property
- 23 room that you collected yesterday morning?
- 24 A. Yes.
- Q. And did I open the bags and mark them in for you?

Page 28

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. Did we mark this in the presence of the court
- 3 reporter?
- 4 A. Yes
- O. Let me show you what's been marked as State's Exhibit
- 6 No. 73 for identification in this cause.
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 O. What is it?
- 9 A. It is a plastic bag I put all these blood samples.
- 10 Q. Let me show you what's been marked as 73-A. Can you
- 11 identify it?
- 12 A. Yes. It is a bag where I put the blood samples.
- 13 Q. Was 73-A inside the larger bag, State's Exhibit 73?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Do you recognize these by your writing which appears
- 16 on the front of these bags?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. Does your writing also appear on the back?
- 19 A. Yes. On this right here, this is my mark.
- Q. Now, let me show you items that we removed yesterday,
- 21 State's Exhibit 73-B, 73-C, 73-D and 73-E. Are these the
- 22 packaging that contains Sample 1, Sample 7, Sample 8 and Sample
- 23 23 for identification?
- 24 A. Yes.
- Q. All right. And Sample 1 is State's Exhibit 73-B, and

	Cond		
	Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Filed 19	TAO:	3/17 Page 12 of 64 PageID 4648 Page 31
1	Sample 7 is 73-C and Sample 8 is 73-D and that's 73-E?	1	bags, for the record only.
2	A. Correct.	2	MR. RAY: No objection.
3	Q. These contain blood samples that you collected.	3	THE COURT: They are admitted for the record
4	A. Yes.	4	oaly.
5	Q. Do you recognize them by your handwriting on those	5	(State's Exhibit No. 73-F And 73-L received)
6	bags?	6	MS. CALLAGHAN: At this time the State would
7	A. Yes.	7	offer 73-B, 73-C, 73-D and 73-E, which are all the packaging
8	Q. Can you tell us what State's Exhibit 73-F are?	8	which contains all the blood samples for all purposes.
9	A. These are the control samples - no, these are the	9	MR. RAY: No objection.
10	remainder of the other blood samples, these are the remaining	10	THE COURT: They are admitted.
11	blood samples.	11	(State's Exhibit No. 73-B, 73-C, 73-D, 73-E received)
12	Q. So of all the remaining blood samples not 1, 7, 8	12	MS. CALLAGHAN: The State would offer 73-H, 73-I,
13	and 23 all the remainder are inside State's Exhibit 73-F,	13	73-J and 73-K, which are the packaging containing the control
14	correct?	14	samples for all purposes.
15	A. Yes.	15	MR. RAY: Can I ask him a question about those?
16	Q. Let me show you 73-G. Can you tell the ladies and	16	VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION
17	gentlemen what that is?	17	BY MR. RAY:
18	A. These are where I placed all the control samples.	18	Q. Those are control samples that you took from the
19	Q. And do you recognize this bag, 73-G, by your	19	house?
20	handwriting on it?	20	A. Yes, sir.
21	A. Yes.	21	MR. RAY: No objection.
22	Q. Was it also placed inside with the control samples	22	THE COURT: They are admitted.
23	inside State's Exhibit 73?	23	(State's Exhibit No. 73-H, 73-H, 73-J, 73-K received)
24	A. Yes.	24	DIRECT EXAMINATION CONTINUED
25	Q. Now, can you identify State's Exhibit 73-H?	25	BY MS. CALLAGHAN:
	Page 30		Page 32
1	•	1	
	A. 168. That 8 a control of blood Sample 1.	1	O. Now, you indicated there were some items found in the
2	A. Yes. That's a control of blood Sample 1. Q. What is 73-I?	1 2	Q. Now, you indicated there were some items found in the bathroom that you also retained. A pair of glasses, a necklace
3	Q. What is 73-I?	2	bathroom that you also retained. A pair of glasses, a necklace
1.	Q. What is 73-I? A. A control sample of blood sample 7.	3	bathroom that you also retained. A pair of glasses, a necklace
3	Q. What is 73-I?A. A control sample of blood sample 7.Q. And can you identify 73-J	3	bathroom that you also retained. A pair of glasses, a necklace and one other item, I believe. I'm sorry. Just the glasses and the necklace.
3	Q. What is 73-I? A. A control sample of blood sample 7.	2 3 4 5	bathroom that you also retained. A pair of glasses, a necklace and one other item, I believe. I'm sorry. Just the glasses and the necklace. A. The glasses and the necklace were actually in the
3 4 5	 Q. What is 73-I? A. A control sample of blood sample 7. Q. And can you identify 73-J A. Control sample of blood sample 8. Q. And what is 73-K. 	2 3 4 5	bathroom that you also retained. A pair of glasses, a necklace and one other item, I believe. I'm sorry. Just the glasses and the necklace. A. The glasses and the necklace were actually in the hallway.
3 4 5 6	 Q. What is 73-I? A. A control sample of blood sample 7. Q. And can you identify 73-J A. Control sample of blood sample 8. Q. And what is 73-K. A. Control of blood sample 23. 	2 3 4 5 6 7	bathroom that you also retained. A pair of glasses, a necklace and one other item, I believe. I'm sorry. Just the glasses and the necklace. A. The glasses and the necklace were actually in the hallway. Q. I'm sorry. Can you show the jury on the diagram where
3 4 5 6 7 8	 Q. What is 73-I? A. A control sample of blood sample 7. Q. And can you identify 73-J A. Control sample of blood sample 8. Q. And what is 73-K. A. Control of blood sample 23. Q. And these are the packages into which you placed those 	2 3 4 5 6 7	bathroom that you also retained. A pair of glasses, a necklace and one other item, I believe. I'm sorry. Just the glasses and the necklace. A. The glasses and the necklace were actually in the hallway. Q. I'm sorry. Can you show the jury on the diagram where they were?
3 4 5 6 7 8 9	 Q. What is 73-I? A. A control sample of blood sample 7. Q. And can you identify 73-J A. Control sample of blood sample 8. Q. And what is 73-K. A. Control of blood sample 23. 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	bathroom that you also retained. A pair of glasses, a necklace and one other item, I believe. I'm sorry. Just the glasses and the necklace. A. The glasses and the necklace were actually in the hallway. Q. I'm sorry. Can you show the jury on the diagram where they were? A. The pair of glasses were found right in this area
3 4 5 6 7 8 9	 Q. What is 73-I? A. A control sample of blood sample 7. Q. And can you identify 73-J A. Control sample of blood sample 8. Q. And what is 73-K. A. Control of blood sample 23. Q. And these are the packages into which you placed those blood samples when you collected them in the way that you 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	bathroom that you also retained. A pair of glasses, a necklace and one other item, I believe. I'm sorry. Just the glasses and the necklace. A. The glasses and the necklace were actually in the hallway. Q. I'm sorry. Can you show the jury on the diagram where they were? A. The pair of glasses were found right in this area here.
3 4 5 6 7 8 9	 Q. What is 73-I? A. A control sample of blood sample 7. Q. And can you identify 73-J A. Control sample of blood sample 8. Q. And what is 73-K. A. Control of blood sample 23. Q. And these are the packages into which you placed those blood samples when you collected them in the way that you described earlier? 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	bathroom that you also retained. A pair of glasses, a necklace and one other item, I believe. I'm sorry. Just the glasses and the necklace. A. The glasses and the necklace were actually in the hallway. Q. I'm sorry. Can you show the jury on the diagram where they were? A. The pair of glasses were found right in this area here. Q. I'm sorry. You said before they were found near the
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	 Q. What is 73-I? A. A control sample of blood sample 7. Q. And can you identify 73-J A. Control sample of blood sample 8. Q. And what is 73-K. A. Control of blood sample 23. Q. And these are the packages into which you placed those blood samples when you collected them in the way that you described earlier? A. Yes, the control sample. Q. And what is 73-L? 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	bathroom that you also retained. A pair of glasses, a necklace and one other item, I believe. I'm sorry. Just the glasses and the necklace. A. The glasses and the necklace were actually in the hallway. Q. I'm sorry. Can you show the jury on the diagram where they were? A. The pair of glasses were found right in this area here. Q. I'm sorry. You said before they were found near the
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	 Q. What is 73-I? A. A control sample of blood sample 7. Q. And can you identify 73-J A. Control sample of blood sample 8. Q. And what is 73-K. A. Control of blood sample 23. Q. And these are the packages into which you placed those blood samples when you collected them in the way that you described earlier? A. Yes, the control sample. Q. And what is 73-L? A. This is the remainder of all the control samples from 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	bathroom that you also retained. A pair of glasses, a necklace and one other item, I believe. I'm sorry. Just the glasses and the necklace. A. The glasses and the necklace were actually in the hallway. Q. I'm sorry. Can you show the jury on the diagram where they were? A. The pair of glasses were found right in this area here. Q. I'm sorry. You said before they were found near the victims' bodies?
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	 Q. What is 73-I? A. A control sample of blood sample 7. Q. And can you identify 73-J A. Control sample of blood sample 8. Q. And what is 73-K. A. Control of blood sample 23. Q. And these are the packages into which you placed those blood samples when you collected them in the way that you described earlier? A. Yes, the control sample. Q. And what is 73-L? A. This is the remainder of all the control samples from 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	bathroom that you also retained. A pair of glasses, a necklace and one other item, I believe. I'm sorry. Just the glasses and the necklace. A. The glasses and the necklace were actually in the hallway. Q. I'm sorry. Can you show the jury on the diagram where they were? A. The pair of glasses were found right in this area here. Q. I'm sorry. You said before they were found near the victims' bodies? A. Yes.
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	 Q. What is 73-I? A. A control sample of blood sample 7. Q. And can you identify 73-J A. Control sample of blood sample 8. Q. And what is 73-K. A. Control of blood sample 23. Q. And these are the packages into which you placed those blood samples when you collected them in the way that you described earlier? A. Yes, the control sample. Q. And what is 73-L? A. This is the remainder of all the control samples from the blood samples we took. Q. Do you recognize those by your handwriting on the 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	bathroom that you also retained. A pair of glasses, a necklace and one other item, I believe. I'm sorry. Just the glasses and the necklace. A. The glasses and the necklace were actually in the hallway. Q. I'm sorry. Can you show the jury on the diagram where they were? A. The pair of glasses were found right in this area here. Q. I'm sorry. You said before they were found near the victims' bodies? A. Yes. Q. And they were in the hallway area.
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	 Q. What is 73-I? A. A control sample of blood sample 7. Q. And can you identify 73-J A. Control sample of blood sample 8. Q. And what is 73-K. A. Control of blood sample 23. Q. And these are the packages into which you placed those blood samples when you collected them in the way that you described earlier? A. Yes, the control sample. Q. And what is 73-L? A. This is the remainder of all the control samples from the blood samples we took. Q. Do you recognize those by your handwriting on the 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	bathroom that you also retained. A pair of glasses, a necklace and one other item, I believe. I'm sorry. Just the glasses and the necklace. A. The glasses and the necklace were actually in the hallway. Q. I'm sorry. Can you show the jury on the diagram where they were? A. The pair of glasses were found right in this area here. Q. I'm sorry. You said before they were found near the victims' bodies? A. Yes. Q. And they were in the hallway area. A. Yes.
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	 Q. What is 73-I? A. A control sample of blood sample 7. Q. And can you identify 73-J A. Control sample of blood sample 8. Q. And what is 73-K. A. Control of blood sample 23. Q. And these are the packages into which you placed those blood samples when you collected them in the way that you described earlier? A. Yes, the control sample. Q. And what is 73-L? A. This is the remainder of all the control samples from the blood samples we took. Q. Do you recognize those by your handwriting on the packaging 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	bathroom that you also retained. A pair of glasses, a necklace and one other item, I believe. I'm sorry. Just the glasses and the necklace. A. The glasses and the necklace were actually in the hallway. Q. I'm sorry. Can you show the jury on the diagram where they were? A. The pair of glasses were found right in this area here. Q. I'm sorry. You said before they were found near the victims' bodies? A. Yes. Q. And they were in the hallway area. A. Yes. Q. Now, you collected those. Can you take a look at
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	 Q. What is 73-I? A. A control sample of blood sample 7. Q. And can you identify 73-J A. Control sample of blood sample 8. Q. And what is 73-K. A. Control of blood sample 23. Q. And these are the packages into which you placed those blood samples when you collected them in the way that you described earlier? A. Yes, the control sample. Q. And what is 73-L? A. This is the remainder of all the control samples from the blood samples we took. Q. Do you recognize those by your handwriting on the packaging A. Yes. MS. CALLAGHAN: At this time the State will 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	bathroom that you also retained. A pair of glasses, a necklace and one other item, I believe. I'm sorry. Just the glasses and the necklace. A. The glasses and the necklace were actually in the hallway. Q. I'm sorry. Can you show the jury on the diagram where they were? A. The pair of glasses were found right in this area here. Q. I'm sorry. You said before they were found near the victims' bodies? A. Yes. Q. And they were in the hallway area. A. Yes. Q. Now, you collected those. Can you take a look at *76-A?
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	 Q. What is 73-I? A. A control sample of blood sample 7. Q. And can you identify 73-J A. Control sample of blood sample 8. Q. And what is 73-K. A. Control of blood sample 23. Q. And these are the packages into which you placed those blood samples when you collected them in the way that you described earlier? A. Yes, the control sample. Q. And what is 73-L? A. This is the remainder of all the control samples from the blood samples we took. Q. Do you recognize those by your handwriting on the packaging A. Yes. MS. CALLAGHAN: At this time the State will 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	bathroom that you also retained. A pair of glasses, a necklace and one other item, I believe. I'm sorry. Just the glasses and the necklace. A. The glasses and the necklace were actually in the hallway. Q. I'm sorry. Can you show the jury on the diagram where they were? A. The pair of glasses were found right in this area here. Q. I'm sorry. You said before they were found near the victims' bodies? A. Yes. Q. And they were in the hallway area. A. Yes. Q. Now, you collected those. Can you take a look at • 76-A? A. Yes. Q. Can you tell the ladies and gentlemen what that is?
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Q. What is 73-I? A. A control sample of blood sample 7. Q. And can you identify 73-J A. Control sample of blood sample 8. Q. And what is 73-K. A. Control of blood sample 23. Q. And these are the packages into which you placed those blood samples when you collected them in the way that you described earlier? A. Yes, the control sample. Q. And what is 73-L? A. This is the remainder of all the control samples from the blood samples we took. Q. Do you recognize those by your handwriting on the packaging A. Yes. MS. CALLAGHAN: At this time the State will offer State's Exhibits 73, 73-A and 73-G for the record only.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	bathroom that you also retained. A pair of glasses, a necklace and one other item, I believe. I'm sorry. Just the glasses and the necklace. A. The glasses and the necklace were actually in the hallway. Q. I'm sorry. Can you show the jury on the diagram where they were? A. The pair of glasses were found right in this area here. Q. I'm sorry. You said before they were found near the victims' bodies? A. Yes. Q. And they were in the hallway area. A. Yes. Q. Now, you collected those. Can you take a look at • 76-A? A. Yes.
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	 Q. What is 73-I? A. A control sample of blood sample 7. Q. And can you identify 73-J A. Control sample of blood sample 8. Q. And what is 73-K. A. Control of blood sample 23. Q. And these are the packages into which you placed those blood samples when you collected them in the way that you described earlier? A. Yes, the control sample. Q. And what is 73-L? A. This is the remainder of all the control samples from the blood samples we took. Q. Do you recognize those by your handwriting on the packaging A. Yes. MS. CALLAGHAN: At this time the State will offer State's Exhibits 73, 73-A and 73-G for the record only. MR. RAY: No objection. THE COURT: They're admitted for the record 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	bathroom that you also retained. A pair of glasses, a necklace and one other item, I believe. I'm sorry. Just the glasses and the necklace. A. The glasses and the necklace were actually in the hallway. Q. I'm sorry. Can you show the jury on the diagram where they were? A. The pair of glasses were found right in this area here. Q. I'm sorry. You said before they were found near the victims' bodies? A. Yes. Q. And they were in the hallway area. A. Yes. Q. Now, you collected those. Can you take a look at • 76-A? A. Yes. Q. Can you tell the ladies and gentlemen what that is? A. A pair of eyeglasses. Q. First of all, let's describe 76-A. Is that the
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	 Q. What is 73-I? A. A control sample of blood sample 7. Q. And can you identify 73-J A. Control sample of blood sample 8. Q. And what is 73-K. A. Control of blood sample 23. Q. And these are the packages into which you placed those blood samples when you collected them in the way that you described earlier? A. Yes, the control sample. Q. And what is 73-L? A. This is the remainder of all the control samples from the blood samples we took. Q. Do you recognize those by your handwriting on the packaging A. Yes. MS. CALLAGHAN: At this time the State will offer State's Exhibits 73, 73-A and 73-G for the record only. MR. RAY: No objection. THE COURT: They're admitted for the record 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	bathroom that you also retained. A pair of glasses, a necklace and one other item, I believe. I'm sorry. Just the glasses and the necklace. A. The glasses and the necklace were actually in the hallway. Q. I'm sorry. Can you show the jury on the diagram where they were? A. The pair of glasses were found right in this area here. Q. I'm sorry. You said before they were found near the victims' bodies? A. Yes. Q. And they were in the hallway area. A. Yes. Q. Now, you collected those. Can you take a look at \$\phi\$ 76-A? A. Yes. Q. Can you tell the ladies and gentlemen what that is? A. A pair of eyeglasses.
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 166 17 18 19 20 21 22	 Q. What is 73-I? A. A control sample of blood sample 7. Q. And can you identify 73-J A. Control sample of blood sample 8. Q. And what is 73-K. A. Control of blood sample 23. Q. And these are the packages into which you placed those blood samples when you collected them in the way that you described earlier? A. Yes, the control sample. Q. And what is 73-L? A. This is the remainder of all the control samples from the blood samples we took. Q. Do you recognize those by your handwriting on the packaging A. Yes. MS. CALLAGHAN: At this time the State will offer State's Exhibits 73, 73-A and 73-G for the record only. MR. RAY: No objection. THE COURT: They're admitted for the record only. 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	bathroom that you also retained. A pair of glasses, a necklace and one other item, I believe. I'm sorry. Just the glasses and the necklace. A. The glasses and the necklace were actually in the hallway. Q. I'm sorry. Can you show the jury on the diagram where they were? A. The pair of glasses were found right in this area here. Q. I'm sorry. You said before they were found near the victims' bodies? A. Yes. Q. And they were in the hallway area. A. Yes. Q. Now, you collected those. Can you take a look at • 76-A? A. Yes. Q. Can you tell the ladies and gentlemen what that is? A. A pair of eyeglasses. Q. First of all, let's describe 76-A. Is that the envelope into which you placed the eyeglasses? A. Yes.
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	 Q. What is 73-I? A. A control sample of blood sample 7. Q. And can you identify 73-J A. Control sample of blood sample 8. Q. And what is 73-K. A. Control of blood sample 23. Q. And these are the packages into which you placed those blood samples when you collected them in the way that you described earlier? A. Yes, the control sample. Q. And what is 73-L? A. This is the remainder of all the control samples from the blood samples we took. Q. Do you recognize those by your handwriting on the packaging A. Yes. MS. CALLAGHAN: At this time the State will offer State's Exhibits 73, 73-A and 73-G for the record only. MR. RAY: No objection. THE COURT: They're admitted for the record only. (State's Exhibit No. 73, 73-A, 73-G received) 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	bathroom that you also retained. A pair of glasses, a necklace and one other item, I believe. I'm sorry. Just the glasses and the necklace. A. The glasses and the necklace were actually in the hallway. Q. I'm sorry. Can you show the jury on the diagram where they were? A. The pair of glasses were found right in this area here. Q. I'm sorry. You said before they were found near the victims' bodies? A. Yes. Q. And they were in the hallway area. A. Yes. Q. Now, you collected those. Can you take a look at • 76-A? A. Yes. Q. Can you tell the ladies and gentlemen what that is? A. A pair of eyeglasses. Q. First of all, let's describe 76-A. Is that the envelope into which you placed the eyeglasses?

Ca	se 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Gree	79	903/17 Page 13 of 64 PageID 4649
	Page 33		Page 35
1 Q. I	s the contents, the eyeglasses themselves, in the	1	purposes.
2 bag mar	ked 76-B?	2	MR. RAY: No objection.
3 A. Y	Yes.	3	THE COURT: It's admitted.
4 Q. I	n regard to the necklace, do you recognize the bag	4	(State's Exhibit No. 76-F received)
5 marked	76-C?	5	MS. CALLAGHAN: May I publish it by walking in
6 A. Y	Yes, it is my writing.	6	front of the jury?
7 Q. I	s that the bag that contains 76-D, the necklace?	7	THE COURT: You may.
8 A. Y	Yes.	8	Q. Now, for the record only, State's Exhibit 76 was the
9 Q. A	And 76-D is the actual necklace you recovered at the	9	original bag that all those items came out of?
10 scene wi	hich is marked on State's Exhibit No. 8.	10	A. Yes.
11 A. Y	Yes.	11	Q. And you recognize this by your markings on the front?
12	MS. CALLAGHAN: At this time, Your Honor, the	12	A. Yes.
13 State wo	ould offer 76-A and C, the bags, for the record only.	13	MS. CALLAGHAN: state offers 76 for the record
14	MR. RAY: No objection.	14	only.
15	THE COURT: So admitted.	15	MR. RAY: No objection.
16	(State's Exhibit No. 76-A and 76-C received)	16	THE COURT: It's already in.
17	MS. CALLAGHAN: And the State would offer 76-B	17	Q. Now, there were some other items you recovered, one of
18 and D, v	which are the eyeglasses themselves and the necklace, for	18	which was a knife blade, correct?
19 all purp	oses.	19	A. Yes.
20	MR. RAY: B is the glasses?	20	Q. Can you show the ladies and gentlemen where on the
21	MS. CALLAGHAN: Yes.	21	diagram the knife blade was recovered?
22	MR. RAY: D is the necklace?	22	A. In the bathroom just inside the door the little
23	MS. CALLAGHAN: Yes.	23	door facing. Inside the bathroom right there.
24	MR. RAY: No objection.	24	Q. Let me show you what's been marked as State's Exhibit
25	THE COURT: They're admitted.	25	No. 74 for identification. Do you recognize this?
	Page 34		Page 36
1	(State's Exhibit No. 76-B and 76-D received)	1	
2	MS. CALLAGHAN: If I may publish them by walking	2	Q. What is it?
3 in front	t of the jury?	3	A. It is the bag I put the blade in.
4	THE COURT: Okay.	4	Q. You recognize it by your markings on the surface of
5 Q. 1	Now, you have examined the necklace, correct, Officer?	5	it?
6 A. Y	Yes.	6	A. Yes.
7 Q. T	The necklace is broken, is it not?	7	Q. Let me show you the contents of 74-A.
8 A. Y	Yes.	8	A. Yes.
9 Q. 1	Now, let me show you the small bag marked Item 21,	9	Q. What is it?
10 76E?		10	A. It is the knife blade I collected.
11 A. (Okay.	11	Q. All right. And why is it in a tube unlike the other
12 Q. I	Do you recognize this bag?	12	pieces of evidence?
	Yes, my handwriting.	13	A. It is strictly for safety.
14 Q. I	Does this baggie contain the small photograph that is	14	Q. Okay. Because it is a pointed object with blood on
15 marked	on 76-F?	15	it?
16 A. Y	Yes.	16	MR. RAY: Excuse me. I am going to object to
17 Q. (Can you show us on the diagram where that was found?	17	the prosecutor's question assuming facts not in evidence, that
l .	t was found right here on the bed in the south	18	being it's a pointed object with blood.
19 bedroor	m.	19	THE COURT: Sustained.
1	MS. CALLAGHAN: At this time, Your Honor, the	20	MR. RAY: Thank you. I would ask the jury be
20			· ·
21 State w	rould offer 76-E for the record only.	21	instructed to disregard the prosecutor's question.
21 State w 22	MR. RAY: No objection.	21 22	
21 State w 22 23	MR. RAY: No objection. THE COURT: It's admitted for the record	ł	THE COURT: Denied.
21 State w 22	MR. RAY: No objection.	22	THE COURT: Denied. Q. You recovered this blade.

$\textbf{CondenseIt}^{^{\text{TM}}}$

	Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Plaged 307	1/0	3/17 Page 14 of 64 PageID 4650 Page 39
1	A. Yes.	1	Q. Do you recognize this bag by your writing on the
2	Q. Does it appear to be covered with a dark red	2	front?
3	substance?	3	A. Yes.
4	MR RAY: Excuse me. Before he answers that, I	4	MS. CALLAGHAN: At this time the State would
5	would like to take the witness on voir dire for that particular	5	offer State's Exhibit No. 75 for the record only.
6	question I'll withdraw it.	6	MR. RAY: No objection.
7		7	
8	the same location in the diagram that is marked knife blade?	8	(State's Exhibit No. 75 received)
9	A. Yes.	9	MS. CALLAGHAN: State would offer 75-A and its
10	MS. CALLAGHAN: State would offer State's Exhibit	10	contents, which is the actual tile, for all purposes.
11		11	VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION
12	MR. RAY: No objection.	12	BY MR. RAY:
13	THE COURT: It's admitted for the record.	13	Q. Did that come from the back or the front?
14	(State's Exhibit No. 74 received)	14	
15	MS. CALLAGHAN: State would offer 74-A and its	15	MR. RAY: Okay. No objection.
	contents, the knife blade, for all purposes.	16	
17	MR. RAY: No objection.	17	`
18	THE COURT: It is admitted.	18	MS. CALLAGHAN: If I may walk in front of the
19	(State's Exhibit No. 74-A received)	19	jury, Your Honor.
20	MS. CALLAGHAN: If I may walk in front of the	20	THE COURT: Okay.
21	jury with it, Your Honor?	21	DIRECT EXAMINATION CONTINUED
22	THE COURT: You may.	22	BY MS. CALLAGHAN:
23	Q. Now, Officer, it is apparent that this knife blade	23	Q. Now there appears to be what is a pattern on the
1	does not have a handle, correct?	24	left-hand side.
25	A. Yes.	25	MR. RAY: Excuse me, Judge. I am going to object
	Page 38		Page 40
1	Q. And it did not have a handle when you found it.	ı	to the prosecutor continually interjecting her opinions about
2	A. No.	1	what something appears to be or the way something is. I don't
3	Q. Did you-all look for the handle?	1	have any objection to her asking the witness what this means to
4	A. Yes, we did.	1	him or what he found or the symbolism of it, but I object
5	Q. Did you ever find the handle?	1	strongly to the Prosecutor doing it. She's done it two or three
6	A. No.	6	times.
7	Q. Now, finally, you indicated that you you removed	7	THE COURT: Sustained.
1	some of the tiles from the front entryway	8	MR. RAY: Thank you.
9	A. Yes.	9	Q. This thing that I have my finger on, can you tell the
10	Q and processed them for footprints and processed	10	
	them for blood.	11	A. It appears to be a type of pattern of some type of
12	A. Yes.	12	shoe, a tennis shoe more than likely.
13	Q. Let me show you a package marked State's Exhibit 75.	13	Q. So it appears to be footprint for a shoe pattern?
1	Do you recognize this?	14	A. A shoe impression is what we call them.
15	A. Yes.	15	Q. Right. Okay. Thank you.
16	Q. What is it?	16	Now, the other items that you collected, did you also
17	A. This is a bag I placed that tile in.		bring them here to court?
18	Q. Okay. And you are saying that you placed 75-A, which	18	A. Yes.
i	is the tile, inside State's Exhibit 75?	19	Q. And were they also specifically marked?
20	A. Yes.	20	A. Yes.
21	Q. And did you remove this tile from the front hallway of	21	Q. For example, State's Exhibit 77, the piggy bank that
1	the victims' home?		was brought to court, the bag was marked?
23	A. Yes.	23	A. Yes.
24	Q. Did you place it in this item for safe keeping?	24	Q. And State's Exhibit 78, the comforter was bought to
25	A. Yes.	25	court and marked.

Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Gandensolt™ Page 15 of 64

Page 41

1 2 Q. And State's Exhibit 79, which is a large box

- 3 containing the remainder of the evidence was marked.
- A. Yes.

A. Yes.

- Q. And that was checked in with the court reporter back
- 6 in his office.
- A. Yes.
- 8 MS. CALLAGHAN: At this time the State would
- 9 offer those three items for the record only.
- 10 MR. RAY: I don't have any objection.
- 11 THE COURT: Could I have the numbers again,
- 12 please?
- 13 MS. CALLAGHAN: State's Exhibits 77, 78 and 79.
- 14 THE COURT: They are admitted.
- 15 (State's Exhibit No. 77, 78, 79 received)
- 16 MS. CALLAGHAN: For the record only, Your Honor.
- 17 THE COURT: Correct.
- 18 MS. HARTMANN: They are present here in court and
- 19 available should anyone need them.
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. Now, did you then examine the house for fingerprints?
- 22 A. Yes, we did.
- 23 Q. How did you do that?
- 24 A. Officer Wallace processed -- began at the front of the
- 25 residence and processed the front door -- front screen door --
 - Page 42
- 1 we call it a screen door, but it was a glass with iron bars.
- 2 And glass is the best surface we can have to print, so he
- 3 started there. And the same type of door was at the rear of the
- 4 residence, so I started at the rear. And those were the only
- 5 two places we got any prints of value.
- Q. That was on the glass in the front door? 6
- A. Interior of the front door and on the interior of the
- 8 rear glass screen door.
- Q. Can you tell the ladies and gentlemen what kind of
- 10 surface is best for recovering prints?
- 11 A. Well, glass is the best.
- 12 Q. Why is that?
- 13 A. It is as nonpourous as you can get for fingerprinting
- 14 with carbon black powder.
- 15 Q. In other words a smooth surface that is not rough or
- 16 textured is better for prints.
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. If a surface is textured or rough, it might be
- 19 difficult?
- A. Yes. 20
- Q. In collecting prints do people necessarily leave a
- 22 print just because they have touched something?
- 23 A. No.
- 24 Q. Why not?
- 25 A. Many factors. Some people just do not leave

1 fingerprints. There is a minor part of the population that does

Page 43

Page 44

- 2 not. Their hands do not secrete oil well, but most of us do.
- 3 But if we were to wash our hands real good and dry them real
- 4 good and then touch a glass in a pretty quick point of time, it
- 5 probably wouldn't leave a print; or it would be of such a minor
- 6 magnitude that you couldn't even -- you might get a trace of
- 7 somebody touched it, but you couldn't get a print of any value.
- Q. When people sometimes touch items and leave prints, do
- 9 they necessarily leave them in a usable condition?
- 10 A. No.
- 11 Q. Why not?
- 12 A. Most of the time it is smeared because of -- anything
- 13 that's on your hands, if you are excited you are going to be
- 14 sweating a little more. Whatever you have eaten, it is going
- 15 to -- microscopically, if you will, all those items will be on
- 16 your hands if you haven't washed your hands.
- 17 So when you touch something, the temperature
- 18 probably has more to do with it than anything, and the hotter it
- 19 is, the less -- the more likely a print will smear because it
- 20 has got a lot of oil in it.
- 21 The colder it is -- from 78 degrees is the
- 22 perfect temperature. If it is below 78, you won't leave as much
- 23 of a print because you won't be secreting as much oil. So it is
- 24 kind of bad if it's cold and bad if it's real hot.
- 25 Q. So all the stuff you see on Perry Mason about
- 1 fingerprints is bunk, right?
 - A. Yes.
 - Q. And you don't necessarily expect to recover usable
 - 4 prints all the time.
 - A. No.
 - O. How many total usable fingerprints did you recover at 6
 - 7 this site?
 - A. I believe we got five.
 - 9 Q. Five out of everything you looked at in the house?
 - 10 A. Yes.
 - 11 Q. How do you preserve those once you have taken them?
 - 12 A. After we have put our powder on the print, we will put
 - 13 a piece of tape -- it is Scotch tape, but perfect lifting tape;
 - 14 and we will lift the print off and put that on a fingerprint

 - 15 card this's like this, and then we turn it into
 - 16 the ID bureau, and a fingerprint expert will look at it.
 - 17 Q. To your knowledge, in this case none of those
 - 18 fingerprints were identified to any person; is that correct?
 - 19 A. No.
 - 20 Q. But they were examined.
 - 21 A. Yes.
 - 22 Q. Now, you indicated you also processed various tiles in
 - 23 the house for footwear impressions?
 - 24 A. Yes.

25

Q. Can you tell the ladies and gentlemen how you did

CondenseItTM PHE0141/03/17 Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Page 16 of 64 PageID 4652 1 that? 1 and did the sergeant take this evidence for you to the property A. Well, on the -- we collected - I believe it was four 2 room? 3 tiles -- the ones that were -- the initial when we first walked 3 A. Yes. 4 into the front entryway, that tile area, there were -- there was O. And then the next time you saw it was when you got it 5 a couple -- it was Item 15 and 16 and then 17-A and B. It was from the property room yesterday morning to bring it to court. 6 four tiles, and it had those footwear impressions on A. Yes. 7 there. Looked like blood footwear impressions. We collected 7 Q. Officer Wilson, thank you very much. I appreciate 8 it. 8 those, and we were going to let the lab have those to process. 9 9 Then -- and so we just collected those, and MS. CALLAGHAN: Pass the witness. 10 that's what was --10 CROSS-EXAMINATION 11 O. You mean 17-A? 11 BY MR. RAY: 12 A. Yes, ma'am. Excuse me. 12 Q. How are you doing, Officer Wilson? 13 Q. And I think that was marked State's Exhibit 75-A. 13 A. Okay. 14 A. Yes. Sorry about that, O. You said that the prints were examined. Do you 15 Q. No problem. 15 remember saying that a few minutes ago? 16 In order to be able to compare, though, footwear 16 A. The fingerprints? 17 with a footwear impression, you have to have the actual shoe, 17 Q. Fingerprints, yeah. Or somebody at the police 18 correct? 18 department told us they were examined and they weren't able to 19 A. Correct. 19 find that they were --20 O. Were you ever able to recover an actual shoe to A. Right. 20 21 compare it? 21 Q. -- that they matched anybody. Is that basically what 22 A. To my knowledge, it was never found anywhere. 22 you were told? 23 Q. Now, a lot of items you mentioned before when you 23 A. Well, when we get a hit, a match, they will send us a 24 collected them, they were wet with blood. 24 latent tip sheet. A. Yes. Q. They send you some sort of record back that tells you Page 46 Q. How do you go about drying those, making sure they 1 that fingerprint raps back to somebody? 2 are properly preserved in order to submit them to a lab? 2 A. Yes. A. We have a blood drying room that that's what that is Q. But the point is if you don't send those prints, if 3 4 for. We will lay out all of the bloody items on a table and let 5 them air dry. Before we can submit anything to the property 5 examine them, you wouldn't know it, right. 6 room, it has to be completely dry just for the integrity of the A. The only way I would know it is if I got a hit sheet 7 item that's bloodstained, and then also for just the safety 7 or if I spoke to them. 8 biohazard safety of anybody in the property room. Q. But if you didn't get anything, either they didn't So it has to be completely dry, so that's why a 10 couple of times you have to wait a day or two before you can A. That would be correct. 11 submit a bloody item because it has to dry out completely first. 12 Q. So with some of the bloody items, there was a delay in 12 one of those the situation was, correct? 13 drying between the time you received those in the house and the 13 A. Correct. 14 time they were actually submitted to the property room. Q. When you go out there and gather all this stuff up, A. Yes.

- 15
- 16 Q. In order to let them fully dry so that the property 17 room would accept them.
- 18 A. And also in this case we were back out there the next
- 19 day. It was two days out on the scene, so it would have been a
- 20 day delay anyway. So after you get your evidence and lay it
- 21 out, it would take it a day or two probably to dry.
- 22 Q. But while they were drying, they were secured in a
- 23 secure area?
- 24 Locked and alarmed.
- 25 Q. Okay. All right. And then finally you packaged them,

- 4 you don't turn them in, or if you turn them in and they don't
- 9 find anything and didn't tell you, or they didn't look at them.
- Q. And unless you talk to them, you wouldn't know which
- 15 y'all have a procedure, do you not, the way you bag everything
- 16 up?
- 17 A. There is a procedure -- there would be a procedure as
- 18 far as to seal items and mark them.
- 19 Q. What I'm getting at is if we went through every little
- 20 bag up there and looked at that, even the ones she's offering
- 21 for the record only, there is a pattern in the way you do that.
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. And the reason for that pattern is so you have some
- 24 consistency in your working, right?
- 25 A. Yes.

Page 47

Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Condeps: 17 Page 17 of 64 PageID 4653

Page 49

- 1 Q. It wouldn't matter if you had a toothpick or an engine
- 2 block; you are still going to label it the same way, right?
- 3 A. Sometimes we can't. If it contaminates the item or
- 4 because of the size, there would be a few constraints, but if we
- 5 can possibly mark something, we try to mark it.
- Q. And within the terms of safety like the knife in the
- 7 little plastic tube, you generally try to do everything the same
- 8 way?
- 9 A. Try to; yes.
- 10 Q. And you submitted all this stuff to the property room,
- 11 right?
- 12 A. Well, actually the sergeant did.
- 13 Q. When I say you, I mean the police department.
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Right.
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. And the property room is a place that's secure, right?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. I can't go over there and get something out of
- 20 property room.
- 21 A. No.
- 22 Q. If I walk over there and say, "Hey, I want to check
- 23 out State's Exhibit 42," they're not going to just let me have
- 24 it, right, or walk off with it?
- 25 A. You know, I don't know.

Page 50

- 1 Q. Okay. Trust me, they probably won't.
- 2 A. Okay.
- 3 Q. And where it goes from there you don't have any
- 4 control over do you?
- 5 A. In the property room?
- 6 Q. Yes.
- 7 A. No.
- 8 Q. It may go up to the crime lab, might go to the Medical
- 9 Examiner's Office?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. Might go somewhere else?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. The Defense attorney might be able to get an order to
- 14 have it sent somewhere, right?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. You labeled these things with a service number,
- 17 correct?
- A. Well, actually if I can label the item, I will put a
- 19 "J" on it. That's my mark.
- 20 Q. Okay.
- A. And if I can't label an item because of contamination
- 22 reasons, I will try to label the package I put it in I mean,
- 23 I will label the package.
- Q. What I'm getting at, over -- when it gets over to the
- 25 property room, all of those bags over there that you or someone

- 1 else collected, whether Officer Wallace or anybody else that was
- 2 out there, they are going to be able to be located and somebody
- 3 can look at them and tell they all came from the same place.
- 4 A. Yes.
- O. Whether it is the address or service number --
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 O. -- or a variety of things.
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. The numbers that you use aren't necessarily the
- 10 numbers that the crime lab uses, correct?
- 11 A. I'm really not for sure what --
- 12 Q. And they are certainly not the numbers that Ms.
- 13 Callaghan used when she marked these exhibits, right?
- 14 A. No, they will not correspond.
- 15 Q. In other words, State's Exhibit 75 is certainly not
- 16 your Exhibit 75.
- 17 A. Right.
- 18 Q. So it is real important to keep up with all those
- 19 numbers so you can compare them later if you need to, right?
- 20 A. Yes.
- Q. If you don't do that, that could make your work in
- 22 some cases quite meaningless, couldn't it?
- 23 A. Well, I have got -- I have my report and my items were
- 24 1 through 31.
- 25 Q. Right.

Page 52

- A. And once we have to put these items into the record --
- 2 I mean, we definitely have to label each picture. So we have
- 3 got 50 pictures, and already we are at 50. Then when we start
- 4 labeling our 30s, then we are going to be in the 80s, so no
- 5 numbers would match.
- 6 Q. Let me ask it this way. Let's suppose you went to a
- 7 crime scene and you found some blood there and you picked it up
- 8 with one of your procedures, either it was wet and you
- 9 dipped it or it was dry and you put water on it and dipped it,
- 10 and you labeled that with a number, maybe Exhibit 25, but
- 11 somehow you made a mistake in that numbering. That could
- 12 happen, right?
- 13 A. You know, it could happen. It has not happened.
- 4 Q. But would you agree with me that if it did happen or
- 15 if you made a mistake and you didn't catch it, depending on
- 16 where you found some blood, for example, if it was mislabeled,
- 17 which might lead someone to the conclusion it came from
- 18 somewhere else, that could seriously impact your findings.
- 19 Would you agree with that?
- 20 A. If --
- 21 Q. If you did that.
- A. If that happened, it sure could.
- Q. And that's why you can pretty affirmatively state that
- 24 didn't happen in this case, at least as far as you are
- 25 concerned.

CondenseItTM Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Piled: 11/03/17 Page 18 of 64 PageID 4654 Page 55 1 A. Right. O. This knife that you found -- and I forget what exhibit 2 2 -- you know the knife I'm talking about? Q. Okay. You said all the footprints you found in the 3 front and in the bathroom, they were never compared and if they A. Yes. 4 were, there was never a match to anybody's shoes. Q. Did you compare that to other knives in the house, A. That's correct. 5 you know, like over in the steak knife drawer? Q. Was the blood in the entryway -- specifically I'm A. No. 7 talking about the blood that had the footprint on it or what you O. So you can't say that knife didn't come from the house 8 thought was a footprint -- was that dry when you got there? 8 or it did --A. Was it dry. A. Yes. 10 Q. Yes. 10 Q. Can't even say this is similar to other knives that 11 A. No. I would assume that it was only because after we 11 were in the house? A. Yes. 12 covered it with some paper, when you pull paper off to collect 12 13 it, there was nothing like leakage --13 Q. The piggy bank, the stuff she's got over here in the 14 Q. Why did y'all put paper on it? So y'all could walk 14 Court Reporter's office, all that stuff went to the property 15 across it? 15 room, right? 16 A. You can step across most of it, but there were people A. Yes. 16 17 that were beginning to have to come in that were going to have Q. Okay. Some of that stuff had what you thought was 18 to step on this, and we just wanted try to protect the integrity 18 blood on it, right? 19 of it. 19 A. Correct. 20 Q. What about the blood on the same tiles that are not 20 Q. Would you agree with me that when you think something 21 part of the footprint? Did it appear to be dry? 21 is blood, that doesn't necessarily mean it is blood, right? 22 A. It appeared to be dry. A. Correct. 23 O. For kind of the same reason? 23 O. There is a procedure to see -- figure out if it is 24 A. Yes. 24 blood. 25 25 Q. Did you find - first of all, you have probably done A. Correct. Page 54 Page 56 1 hundreds of -- you have been in hundreds of houses where there Q. You don't do that in your crime scene work, right? 1 2 has been a crime committed. 2 A. No. A. Thousands, actually. Q. That's something somebody in the crime lab or the Q. Lots of burglaries? 4 Medical Examiner's office can do and routinely do? A. Yes. A. Correct. 6 Q. Did this house appear to have been burglarized? Q. Fingerprints, you can get them from glass, but you 7 A. No, it did not. 7 can also get them off paper, can't you? 8 Q. Why do you say that? A. You can. A. I didn't see any ransacking. That's about -- you 9 Q. You can get them off of a \$20 bill. 10 know, TV missing, microwave missing --10 A. Yes. 11 Q. TV missing with the cables laying on top, there wasn't 11 Q. Y'all have solved a lot of crimes out of getting 12 any of that? 12 fingerprints off of money. 13 A. Upstairs there appeared not to be any -- there were A. I would imagine so. 13 14 valuables, rings and this kind of things setting out. Nothing 14 Q. The thing about fingerprints, though, if I touch this 15 appeared to be moved. 15 pad and I leave my fingerprints on it and I let it sit there on 16 Q. Did you find even some jewelry in the house? 16 the table and we all leave this room and you come back six 17 A. Yes. 17 months from now and nobody comes in here between now and then, 18 Q. Valuable jewelry? 18 you could pick this up and you could still get a fingerprint

19

20

21

A. Yes.

24 appear that way.

Q. More than just cosmetic jewelry?

A. No, it did not appear that way.

A. It looked more cosmetic, or costume, I mean.

23 came in and took a bunch of property, or that is it didn't

Q. The point is this was not a situation where someone

A. To a point, yes.
Q. Have you ever run into one of those guys who didn't

22 they hang around until somebody wipes them off, right?

Q. Fingerprints are not time-sensitive; in other words,

19 potentially off this paper, right?

25 have fingerprints that was a burglar?

A. Yes, sir.

20

21

Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 General Style Page 19 of 64 Page 10 4655 Page 59 Page 57 A. Probably have because there is many times I can't find 1 A. Yes. Q. And they are taken to the Medical Examiner's office 2 anything. 2 3 still clothed in their own clothing they wore at the time of Q. That would be a pretty good thing to have if you were 4 a crook, wouldn't it? 4 their death. A. Yes, it would. A. Yes. Q. And they are preserving that clothing for the Medical MR. RAY: I believe that's all. Thank you. 6 Pass the witness. 7 Examiner. A. Yes. REDIRECT EXAMINATION 8 9 BY MS. CALLAGHAN: O. And that was done in this case, correct? 9 Q. All of the blood that you collected in this crime 10 A. Yes. 11 scene was from inside the house or inside the garage, right? O. Your evidence that you retrieved was contained within 11 12 large paper bags that were marked on the surface by you, A. Correct. Q. It wasn't from a neighbor's house or out on the lawn, 13 correct? 14 out on the front sidewalk. A. Yes. 14 A. No. Q. And they are kept separately in those bags in the 15 Q. It was all within the victims' home or --16 property room, correct? A. Yes. 17 A. Yes. Q. Now, all the bags that you brought over that contained Q. For example, if an officer found something at a crime 18 19 physical evidence, you examined those bags, correct? 19 scene, even in this case, but at a different location, different A. Yes. 20 crime scene, those are separately, discretely bagged. Q. Both back in the Court Reporter's office and in here. A. Yes. 21 A. Yes. 22 O. They would have nothing to do and would never be Q. And you can recognize when the Medical Examiner's 23 placed in the same bag as yours. 24 office has opened those bags because they reseal it with their 24 A. Yes. 25 tape and --25 Q. Yours contain only the evidence that you collected? Page 60 Page 58 A. Yes. 1 A. That's correct. Q. Other than that, were there any signs that this 2 Q. Now, Defense Counsel asked you a couple of questions 3 evidence had been tampered with in any way? 3 about whether the house appear to be burglarized. From what you 4 said before, it is correct that there were no VCR's, Q. Now, you said there were some people that came in that 5 televisions, anything of that nature that appeared to be 6 had to step on that paper covering the blood spots. 6 missing, correct? A. Yes. 7 A. Correct. Q. Were there people that had to come in and move the O. You were aware, however, that a 1996 Cadillac was 9 body --9 missing. A. Yes. 10 A. Yes. Q. -- for example? 11 Q. So that one large item of evidence or property The bodies were still there when you photographed 12 certainly was stolen? A. That's what I was informed, that there was a car there A. Yes. 14 that was not there then. Q. And then they were removed from there by whom? 15 Q. But you wouldn't know that just from looking at the 16 garage, correct?

10

1

6

7

8

10

12

13

15

16

17

18

20

21

22

23

1

2

4

7

8

11

12

13 them, correct?

14

15

16 A. By the -- after the medical investigator comes out and

17 examines the body and -- we have to take pictures of each side.

18 Then the transport people come out, and they will collect the

19 victims and transport them on a stretcher out of the residence

20 into their vehicles and then to the morgue.

21 Q. So they have special vehicles to transport bodies to

22 the morgue?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. When the bodies are removed, they have their own

25 clothing still on them, correct?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. And were you aware in this case that the victim's

19 purse was missing?

20 A. We did look for that just for identification, and we

21 couldn't find it.

22 Q. Okay. So you were aware that it may be missing.

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. And then there were some signs within the residence

25 of disarray, right?

CondenseItTM

	Conde		
	Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 मिंहूई न	Щ/U,	3/17 Page 20 of 64 Page D 4656 Page 6
1	A. Yes.	1	MR. RAY: Nothing further.
2	Q. For example, the piggy bank was knocked over on the	2	THE COURT: You my step down, sir.
3	floor.	3	Ladies and gentlemen, let's take a stretch break.
4	A. Yes.	4	Please retire to the jury room and remember and follow your
5	Q. And there were some other signs.	5	instructions.
6	A. Yes.	6	(Recess taken)
7	MS. CALLAGHAN: Thank you.	7	(Jury present)
8	Pass the witness, Your Honor.	8	THE COURT: Are both sides ready for the jury?
9	RECROSS-EXAMINATION	9	MS. HARTMANN: State's ready, Your Honor.
	BY MR. RAY:	10	MR. RAY: We are ready, Judge.
111	Q. The piggy bank and the necklace which the jury has	11	THE COURT: Call your next witness, please.
1	seen and the eyeglasses which were found in the hallway the	12	MS. CALLAGHAN: The State will call Officer
ı	eyeglasses and necklace being found in the hallway, all three of	1	Ball.
- 1	those items you determined apparently had blood on them; is that	14	(Witness Sworn)
1	correct?	15	,
16	A. Correct.	16	MARK BALL,
17	Q. When you saw this crime scene, what did it appear like	17	
)	had happened to you? What did you think happened?	18	DIRECT EXAMINATION
19	A. It appeared from my entry point and then seeing the	19	
	blood and the two victims lying in the hall and the bathroom,	20	Q. Would you please state your full name for the ladies
1	that they had been severely I can say mutilated now, but	1	
8	severely killed, if you will.	21 22	A. My name is Mark Ball.
23	•	1	•
1	Q. Would the word rage fit into the be an adjective	23	Q. Do you want to move that microphone up?A. How is that?
3	that could describe it, killed in a rage?	24	•
25	A. No, I really don't think so. Maybe my rage, but	25	Q. All right. How are you employed?
	Page 62		Page 64
1	Q. What did you think? What were you thinking when you	1	A. I'm a police officer for the city of Fort Worth.
2	saw this?	2	Q. What do you do for them?
3	A. I thought it was a pretty sad day when two old ladies	3	A. I am one of the crime scene officers.
4	get mutilated like this.	4	Q. Do you work with Officers Wilson and Johnson?
5	Q. Didn't seem to be much of a reason for it, did there?	5	A. Yes, I do.
6	A. No, it didn't.	6	Q. How many crime scene officers are there total?
7	Q. It didn't you didn't see any kind of anything	7	A. There are 14 of us.
8	that would lead to a self-defense-type deal where two people or	8	Q. How long have you been doing that?
9	three people or four people had gotten in a confrontation with	9	A. I have been a crime scene officer since March of 2000.
10	each other and everybody was defending themselves. It didn't	10	Q. What did you do before March of 2000?
11	appear that way; is that right?	11	A. I was a patrol officer.
12	A. It just looked like they had no defense.	12	Q. Were you dispatched in this case to an address on
13	Q. Okay. What did you think about that?	13	North Main?
14	A. To put it real politely, I thought it stunk.	14	A. Yes, I was.
15	MR. RAY: Thank you.	15	Q. What day and time were you dispatched?
16	REDIRECT EXAMINATION	16	A. April 8 at 8:05 p.m.
17	BY MS. CALLAGHAN:	17	Q. Okay. And what address did you go to?
18	Q. Officer Wilson, from what you saw at the crime scene	18	A. It was 3116 North Main.
19	and what you saw of the victims, is there anything in there that	19	Q. What is at that address?
20	you saw that was worth one 1996 Cadillac and some credit cards?	20	A. That is the El Triangulo Bar.
21	A. I'm sorry. Would you was there what?	21	Q. Can you give the ladies and gentlemen some idea of
22	Q. Was it worth leaving the two victims that way, a 1996	22	what kind of business the El Triangulo Bar is?
23	Cadillac and a bunch of credit cards?	23	A. The El Triangulo Bar is kind of like an old small
24	A. Absolutely not.	24	hole-in-the-wall bar on the north side of Fort Worth.
25	MS. CALLAGHAN: Pass the witness.	25	Q. Was it open when you arrived there at 8:05?
	**************************************		Page 61 - Page 64

Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Cendense 13/17 Page 21 of 64 PageID 4657 Page 65 Page 67 A. I believe so. I'm not for certain. It usually is, 1 O. What is it? 2 but I don't recall if it was open or not. A. That is a photograph I took of the Cadillac at the El 2 Q. You have had business at the El Triangulo Bar before, 3 3 Triangulo Bar. Q. Now, let me show you a series of photographs that have 4 and you know it. A. Yes. 5 not yet been admitted starting with State's Exhibit No. 81 6 through State's Exhibit No. 89 inclusive. Will you take a 6 Q. Did you see many people in or around the bar? 7 7 moment and review those photographs. 8 Q. Were there a lot of cars parked around there? A. (Witness complies) 8 9 A. No. Q. Have you had an opportunity to look at State's Exhibit 10 Q. Who did you meet there when you arrived? 10 81 through 89? 11 A. I meet with Officer McClenny. 11 A. Yes, I have. 12 Q. Did he relate to you why it was you were called out? 12 Q. Are these the photographs that you took on April 8 13 13 after 8:05 p.m. of the 1996 Cadillac that was out at the El A. Yes. 14 Q. Was Officer McClenny standing near or guarding 14 Triangulo Bar? 15 anything when you arrived? 15 A. Yes, they are. 16 A. Yes, he was. 16 O. Are those true and accurate depictions of the way the 17 Q. What was he guarding? 17 car appeared? 18 A. He was guarding a Cadillac, a gold Cadillac. 18 A. Yes. 19 Q. Were you directed to that car? 19 MS. CALLAGHAN: The State would offer State's 20 A. Yes, I was. 20 Exhibits 81 through 89 inclusive subject to tendering them to 21 Q. What is the first thing you did when you were directed 21 Defense for their inspection. 22 to it? 22 (Pause in the proceedings) 23 A. First thing I did is I observed what appeared to be 23 MR. RAY: Did you say 81 through 89? 24 blood on the left back passenger door of the vehicle, the 24 MS. CALLAGHAN: Yes. 25 exterior left-back passenger door. That was obvious when I 25 MR. RAY: No objection. Page 68 Page 66 1 first walked up to it. 1 THE COURT: 81 through 89 are admitted. Q. Did you circle the car and look at it? 2 (State's Exhibit No. 81 through 89 received) 3 A. Yes, I did. MS. CALLAGHAN: If I can ask the officer to step 4 Q. Did you notice anything about any of the windows? 4 down? 5 A. Yes. The right-front passenger window was broken out. 5 THE COURT: You may. 6 Q. Did there appear to be glass in the immediate area? Q. Starting with this half of the jury, we are going to A. Yes. There was glass on the ground next to the 7 start with State's Exhibit 81 and 82. Let's start with 81 8 vehicle and inside of the vehicle. 8 first. 9 Q. Okay. What did you do after you visually examined the 9 MS. CALLAGHAN: If I may inquire, Your Honor, can 10 car? 10 all of the jurors see, or at least this half? 11 A. I completed a series of photographs of the vehicle as 11 Q. What is depicted in State's Exhibit 81? 12 I observed it and --12 A. State's Exhibit 81 is a photograph of the left-back Q. Why did you do that? 13 13 passenger door where I had observed the blood on the door when I 14 A. To document the scene with photographs. 14 was walking up to the vehicle. 15 Q. Was this before you touched the car --15 Q. Now, this is the left-hand side of the car as you are 16 A. Yes, it is. 16 standing there behind it? 17 Q. -- or took anything off of it? 17 A. Correct. 18 A. Yes. 18 Q. So the driver's door is directly in front? 19 MS. CALLAGHAN: Okay. May I approach the 19 20 witness, Your Honor? Q. And the passenger door had a dark stain right here in 20 21 THE COURT: Yes. 21 the door handle where you open the door. Q. Let me show you what has previously been admitted as 22 A. Correct. 23 State's Exhibit No. 80 for identification. Do you recognize 23 Q. What is State's Exhibit 82? 24 that? 24 A. It is a closeup photograph of the stain. 25 A. Yes, I do. 25 Q. Let's move down in this direction and talk to the

use 4:07 cv 00703 Y Document 87 Filed 11/03/17 Page 22 of 64 PageID 465

1 second half of the jury. Can you tell them what State's Exhibit

2 81 is?

3 A. This is picture of the left-back passenger door of the

4 vehicle showing the stain I observed when I approached the

5 vehicle.

6 Q. What about 82?

A. It is a closeup photograph of the stain that is on the

8 door.

9 Q. Okay. Now let's go to State's Exhibit 83 and 84.

10 Starting with this half of the jury, and let's start with the

11 top photograph, State's Exhibit 83.

12 A. State's Exhibit 83 is a photograph of the trunk of the

13 vehicle showing also a stain I observed on the trunk. State's

14 Exhibit 84 is a closeup of the stain on the trunk of the

15 vehicle.

16 Q. Okay. Let's move down and show this half.

17 A. This is a picture of the trunk of the vehicle

18 depicting a stain I observed on the vehicle -- State's Exhibit

19 83 -- excuse me. State's Exhibit 84 is a closeup of the stain.

Q. Now let's go to State's Exhibit 85 and 86 for

21 identification. Starting with 85.

22 A. State's Exhibit 85 is a photograph of the steering

23 wheel of the vehicle. State's Exhibit 86 is a photograph on the

24 back side of the vehicle shooting through the windshield at the

25 stain on the steering wheel.

Page 70

Q. Is this the top or bottom of the steering wheel?

2 A. That would be the top of the steering wheel.

3 Q. As you were looking through the front windshield, you

4 saw the back of the steering wheel?

5 A. Correct.

6 Q. And that's depicted in State's Exhibit No. 86.

A. Correct.

8 Q. Start with 85 --

9 A. 85 is a picture of the steering wheel of the vehicle.

10 86 is a picture of the same steering wheel shot through the

11 windshield onto the back of the steering wheel, the top portion 11

12 of it.

13 Q. And what about State's Exhibit No. 87 and 88?

A. State's Exhibit No. 87 is a picture of the steering

15 column of the vehicle with little stains on the steering column

16 itself.

17 State's Exhibit No. 88 is a photograph of the

18 driver's seatbelt with a stain on the driver's seatbelt.

19 Q. Okay.

20 A. State's Exhibit No. 87 is a picture of the steering

21 column of the vehicle with little stains on the steering

22 column.

Exhibit No. 88 is a photograph of the driver's

24 seatbelt with a stain on the seatbelt.

25 Q. Here?

A. State's Exhibit No. 89 is a photograph again of the

2 driver's seatbelt with another photograph of the stain on the

3 seatbelt itself.

4 State's Exhibit No. 89, once again, a photograph

5 of the driver's seatbelt with a stain on the seatbelt.

Q. Okay. Now, before you sit down, let me ask you one

7 other. Going back to State's Exhibit No. 80, you said that the

8 right-passenger window was broken out.

9 A. Uh-huh.

10 O. Can you point out which window that was on State's

11 Exhibit No. 80?

12 A. On State's Exhibit 80 it's this right here.

13 Q. The other windows appear to be tinted, correct?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. You can identify it by the one that doesn't appear to

16 be tinted.

17 A. Correct pretty clear.

18 O. Okay. So this would be the window that was broken

19 out?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Okay. And there is obviously glass on the pavement.

22 A. Yes, on the pavement right next to the vehicle.

23 Q. Was that the only significant damage you observed to

24 that car?

25 A. Yes, it is.

Page 72

Page 7

Q. Did you make a note when you observed the car

2 initially of the license plate number and the make and model of

3 the car?

4 A. Yes, I did.

Q. What was the license plate number?

6 A. The license plate number -- if I may refer -- I don't

7 remember it. Victor Paul Frank 81 X-ray.

8 Q. VPF?

9 A. Yes. VPF-81X. Sorry.

10 Q. That's okay.

11 A. I'm stuck in police lingo.

12 Q. There is police language and then there is normal-

13 person language.

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Now, after you looked at the car, walked around it and

16 photographed it, what happened next?

17 A. I instructed Officer McClenny to have the vehicle

18 towed to our auto-pound security bay for further processing due

19 to condensation starting to set up on the vehicle.

20 Q. Dew falling?

21 A. It was starting to. It was starting to get on top of

22 the vehicle.

Q. Okay. You don't want any water or fluids or

24 liquids --

25 A. Not -- with the window being busted out, I couldn't

Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 **Cape Case** 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 **Case** 4:07-

Page 73

- 2 Q. You said you instructed Officer McClenny to get it
- 3 taken to the auto pound.
- A. Correct.
- 5 Q. Where is that?
- 6 A. It's a 1301 East North Side Drive.
- 7 Q. What is the auto pound?

1 have it inside the vehicle either.

- 8 A. It is a facility where police impound vehicles for
- 9 various reasons.
- 10 Q. Okay. So this is a police-controlled area?
- 11 A. Yes, it is.
- 12 Q. At times when vehicles are being searched and examined
- 13 by crime scene, are vehicles taken there for that purpose so
- 14 they will be secure during that process?
- 15 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 16 Q. When you got to the auto pound, what did you do?
- 17 A. When I got there Officer McClenny was shutting the
- 18 doors to the security bay when I arrived on the scene, and when
- 19 I -- after it was secured in the bay, I entered the bay and
- 20 opened the driver's door and made observations of what was
- 21 inside the vehicle.
- 22 Q. Did you examine the driver's-seat area?
- 23 A. Yes, I did.
- Q. Were there some items in there in the front seat area?
- A. Yeah. On the front seat I observed what appeared to

- 1 No. 10 were all obtained from the steering wheel of the vehicle.
- 2 Item No. 11 was obtained from the dash. Item No. 12 was
- 3 obtained from the steering column. Item No. 13 from the stereo

Page 75

Page 76

- 4 tuning button, and State's Exhibit No. No. 14 from the stereo
- 5 itself below the tuning button.
- 6 Q. What area did you examine next?
- A. I examined the center-console gear-shift area. I
- 8 observed what appeared to be blood on the top of the gear shift
- 9 and inside of the gear shift slot.
 - Q. Did you recover swabs from those items?
- 11 A. Yes, I did.

10

- 12 Q. What numbers were those, referring to your report?
- 13 A. That would be Item No. 15 and item No. 16.
- 14 Q. What area did you examine next?
- 15 A. The other area I examined was the back-seat area where
- 16 I observed notebooks, a book, sun shade, film negatives and
- 17 other miscellaneous papers.
- 18 Q. In examining those, did you take a look at them?
 - A. Yes, I did.
- 20 Q. Did you become aware of who owned the vehicle at some
- 21 point?

19

- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. Did those items appear to be pertaining to the victim
- 24 and owner of the car?
- 25 A. Yes, they did.

- 1 be blood along with two pens, writing pens, and a lighter in the
- 2 seat itself.
- 3 Q. Did you collect any or all of those items?
- 4 A. Yes, I did.
- 5 Q. What did you collect?
- 6 A. I collected a blue pen from the seat, a pink pen from
- 7 the seat, a lighter; and I also collected swabs from the stain
- 8 in the seat.
- 9 Q. Okay. Referring to your report, which item numbers
- 10 did you collect from that area?
- A. From the driver's seat I collected Items No. 3, 4 and
- 12 5, and items No. 21, 22 and 23.
- 13 Q. Okay. And what area did you examine next?
- 14 A. The area I examined next was the steering wheel -
- 15 dash area of the vehicle, and I observed what appeared to be
- 16 blood on the dash, the steering column, the steering wheel, the
- 17 radio, all along the front-dash area.
- 18 Q. Is that area depicted in some of those crime scene
- 19 photos?
- 20 A. Yes, they are.
- Q. Did you recover samples from the steering wheel and
- 22 from the deck?
- 23 A. Yes.
- Q. Which samples are those referring to?
- 25 A. Samples -- I mean Item No. 6, No. 7, No. 8, No. 9 and

- 1 Q. Did you collect any of those?
- 2 A. No, I did not.
- 3 Q. What area did you examine next?
- 4 A. The next area I examined was the trunk area of the
- 5 vehicle. I opened the trunk and I observed just numerous
- 6 miscellaneous items. Clothing, blankets, car-repair equipment,
- 7 other things inside the trunk.
- 8 Q. Okay. Usual kind of junk people have in their trunk?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Nothing unusual?
- 11 A. Nothing unusual.
- 12 Q. Did you recover any evidence items from there?
- 13 A. No.
- 14 O. Did you recover any swabs from that area?
- 15 A. Not from inside the trunk, no.
- 16 Q. What area did you look at next?
- 17 A. Then I examined the right front passenger seat. I
- 18 observed -- basically what it was was papers, owner manuals for
- 19 the vehicle lying in the seat.
- Q. Okay. Anything there that -- did it all seem to
- 21 pertain to the victim?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. Or to the vehicle itself?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. Anything there unusual?

Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 **Gandens** 17 Page 24 of 64 Page 10 4660

A. No.

- 2 Q. Did you collect anything?
- 3 A. No.
- 4 Q. What did you examine next?
- 5 A. After that part, I stopped the inspection of the
- 6 vehicle and started processing the vehicle for prints.
- 7 Q. Okay. Did you recover a swab from that exterior
- 8 left-back passenger --
- A. Yes.
- 10 Q. That's the bloodstain that you showed us on the
- 11 back-passenger-door door handle?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. And also that bloodstain on the back of the trunk, did
- 14 you recover that?
- 15 A. Yes. Those were both done before the vehicle was
- 16 towed to the auto pound.
- 17 Q. Okay. I'm sorry. Those were --
- 18 A. Those were done before it went to the pound because I
- 19 wanted to recover that -- with the condensation setting up on
- 20 the vehicle, I wanted to recover that so it was not damaged in
- 21 the processing or transporting of the vehicle.
- Q. Okay. Also Item No. 17, a sample from the driver's
- 23 door frame.
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. When did you recover that?

Page 78

- A. It would be the same time as I recovered -- it would
- 2 be right after I recovered the swab from the gear-shift slot.
- 3 Q. At any point did you remove a section of the actual
- 4 seatbelt that actually appears in the photograph?
- 5 A. Yes, I did.
- 6 Q. How did you do that?
- A. I used a carpet-cutting knife, pulled the seatbelt
- 8 out, cut from the base and pulled it down and cut from the top.
- 9 Q. So you literally cut a section of the seatbelt out?
- 10 A. Yes, I did.
- 11 Q. And preserved that?
- 12 A. Yes, I did.
- 13 Q. Why did you do that?
- 14 A. It would keep the evidence in its purest state by
- 15 taking the whole section out. You have all of the evidence
- 16 instead of swabbing it and just having a little.
- 17 Q. Okay. There was obviously blood on the belt, correct?
- 18 A. It appeared to be, yes.
- 19 Q. And you wanted to preserve it as well as possible in
- 20 its original setting.
- A. Correct.
- 22 Q. Okay. Now, once you removed these items, how did you
- 23 preserve them, the blood swabs and seatbelt?
- 24 A. I placed them in packages -- actually the blood swabs
- 25 I have a system set up that I put a plastic covering over them

1 so it doesn't get on your envelope. I put them in the

- 2 envelopes. And then the seatbelt was placed in a paper sack,
- 2 cirvolopos. Tand allori are sourced was placed in a paper such,
- 3 and they are set to the side until I can transport them to where
- 4 I can have them dried -- or where they can sit out to dry.
- 5 Q. Okay. With blood items that are wet, you need to let
- 6 them dry before you submit them, correct?
 - A. Correct.
- 8 Q. Could you step down for a moment?
- 9 A. (Witness complies)
- 10 Q. Did you bring some items of evidence to court this
- 11 morning?
- 12 A. Yes.

16

- 13 O. And did we open those in the Court Reporter's office
- 14 and mark them?
- 15 A. Yes, I we did.
 - Q. Can you tell us what State's Exhibit No. 129 is?
- 17 A. State's Exhibit No. 129 is a paper sack that I had
- 18 placed evidence collected from the vehicle into.
 - O. Okay. State's Exhibit 129, if you want to go ahead
- 20 and put -- State's Exhibit 129, do you recognize that by your
- 21 handwriting on it?
- A. I recognize it by my name being on it and my initials
- 23 and ID on the back of the sack.
- 24 Q. You personally marked that?
- 25 A. Yes, I did.

Page 80

- 1 Q. Now, let's show you what is marked State's Exhibit
- 2 129-A and what is this?
- A. State's Exhibit 129-A is a paper sack which I had
- 4 placed the driver's seatbelt that I had cut out into, and it is
- 5 verified by my initials and ID on the back of the sack.
- 6 Q. The sack itself contains the driver's seatbelt, Item
- 7 No. 19.
- 8 A. Right.
- 9 Q. And then you also marked on the back of it
- 10 A. Correct.
- 11 Q. Now, let me show you what is marked State's Exhibit
- 12 No. B and C for identification. Can you tell the ladies and
- 13 gentlemen what State's Exhibit 129-B is?
- 14 A. State's Exhibit 129-B is the section of the seatbelt I
- 15 had cut out from the vehicle.
- Q. Okay. And we removed that from the inside of State's
- 17 Exhibits 129 and 129-A and placed it in this plastic bag back in
- 18 the Court Reporter's office.
- A. Correct.
- 20 Q. Can you tell us what State's Exhibit 129-C is?
- 21 A. State's Exhibit 129-C is envelopes that I had placed
- 22 swabs that I had collected from the vehicle into.
- 23 Q. All right. Can you tell us what State's Exhibit 129-E
- 24 is?
- 25 A. 129-E is an envelope that contained one of the swabs

Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Const	PSP/03/17 Page 25 of 64 PageID 4661
Page 81	Page 83
1 that I had collected from the vehicle.	1 objection.
2 Q. Okay. Specifically this is Item No. 8, correct?	2 THE COURT: They are admitted for the record.
3 A. Correct.	3 (State's Exhibit No. 129, 129-A, 129-C
4 Q. And this came from the steering wheel.	4 and 129-F received)
5 A. Correct.	5 Ms. CALLAGHAN: For the record then, Your Honor,
6 Q. And the bloody section behind the steering wheel	6 State's Exhibit 129-C contains Items 2, 3, Item 4, 5, 11, 1, 12,
7 appears in one of the photographs.	7 13, 14, 15, 16, 17 and Item 18, control.
8 A. Correct.	8 DIRECT EXAMINATION CONTINUED
9 Q. And then can you tell me what State's Exhibit 129-F	9 BY MS. CALLAGHAN:
10 is?	Q. And these are all samples of blood and control samples
A. State's Exhibit 129-F is the packages of the four	11 that you took from the interior of the car?
12 other swabs I had collected from the steering wheel.	12 A. Correct.
Q. And do you recognize 129-E and F because of your	Q. And that's contained within 129-C?
14 writing on the envelopes and the way they are packaged?	14 A. Correct.
15 A. Yes. All of them have my initials and ID on the back	15 MS. CALLAGHAN: At this time, Your Honor, the
16 of the package.	16 State would offer 129-B and 129-E for all purposes.
Q. Did you recover 129-E and 129-F this morning from the	17 MR. RAY: No objection to 129-B. No objection to
18 Tarrant County Medical Examiner's office?	18 129-E.
19 A. Yes.	THE COURT: They are admitted.
Q. Did you bring them back for the purpose of introducing	(State's Exhibit No. 129-B, 129-E received)
21 them here at trial?	21 Ms. CALLAGHAN: If I may publish them by walking
22 A. Yes, I did. 23 MS. CALLAGHAN: At this time. Your Honor, the	22 in front of the jury with them, Your Honor.
MS. CALLAGHAN: At this time, Your Honor, the State would offer State's Exhibit 129, 129-A, 129-C, and 129-F	23 THE COURT: You may. 24 Q. Now, Officer, 129-E contains the sample that was taken
25 for the record only.	Q. Now, Officer, 129-E contains the sample that was taken from the steering wheel, the back portion that you see in the
25 for the record only.	123 HOM the Steering wheel, the back portion that you see in the
D 02	The state of the s
Page 82	Page 84
1 MR. RAY: Can I see those for just a second,	Page 84 1 photograph through the window.
1 MR. RAY: Can I see those for just a second, 2 please?	Page 84 1 photograph through the window. 2 A. Yes.
1 MR. RAY: Can I see those for just a second, 2 please? 3 MS. CALLAGHAN: Yes.	Page 84 1 photograph through the window. 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. And State's Exhibit No. 129-B is the actual section of
1 MR. RAY: Can I see those for just a second, 2 please? 3 MS. CALLAGHAN: Yes. 4 MR. RAY: Could I have just a second, Judge?	Page 84 1 photograph through the window. 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. And State's Exhibit No. 129-B is the actual section of 4 the seat belt that you collected?
1 MR. RAY: Can I see those for just a second, 2 please? 3 MS. CALLAGHAN: Yes. 4 MR. RAY: Could I have just a second, Judge? 5 THE COURT: You may.	Page 84 1 photograph through the window. 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. And State's Exhibit No. 129-B is the actual section of 4 the seat belt that you collected? 5 A. Correct.
1 MR. RAY: Can I see those for just a second, 2 please? 3 MS. CALLAGHAN: Yes. 4 MR. RAY: Could I have just a second, Judge? 5 THE COURT: You may. 6 (Pause in the proceedings)	Page 84 1 photograph through the window. 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. And State's Exhibit No. 129-B is the actual section of 4 the seat belt that you collected? 5 A. Correct. 6 Q. Now, you stated that there were some other items that
1 MR. RAY: Can I see those for just a second, 2 please? 3 MS. CALLAGHAN: Yes. 4 MR. RAY: Could I have just a second, Judge? 5 THE COURT: You may. 6 (Pause in the proceedings) 7 MR. RAY: Can I ask a couple of questions?	Page 84 1 photograph through the window. 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. And State's Exhibit No. 129-B is the actual section of 4 the seat belt that you collected? 5 A. Correct. 6 Q. Now, you stated that there were some other items that 7 you recovered, I believe, a purple cloth, a lighter, a blue pin
1 MR. RAY: Can I see those for just a second, 2 please? 3 MS. CALLAGHAN: Yes. 4 MR. RAY: Could I have just a second, Judge? 5 THE COURT: You may. 6 (Pause in the proceedings) 7 MR. RAY: Can I ask a couple of questions? 8 THE COURT: Yes.	Page 84 1 photograph through the window. 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. And State's Exhibit No. 129-B is the actual section of 4 the seat belt that you collected? 5 A. Correct. 6 Q. Now, you stated that there were some other items that 7 you recovered, I believe, a purple cloth, a lighter, a blue pin 8 and pink pen from the driver's seat; is that correct?
1 MR. RAY: Can I see those for just a second, 2 please? 3 MS. CALLAGHAN: Yes. 4 MR. RAY: Could I have just a second, Judge? 5 THE COURT: You may. 6 (Pause in the proceedings) 7 MR. RAY: Can I ask a couple of questions?	Page 84 1 photograph through the window. 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. And State's Exhibit No. 129-B is the actual section of 4 the seat belt that you collected? 5 A. Correct. 6 Q. Now, you stated that there were some other items that 7 you recovered, I believe, a purple cloth, a lighter, a blue pin 8 and pink pen from the driver's seat; is that correct? 9 A. The red lighter and blue pen and pink pen was from the
1 MR. RAY: Can I see those for just a second, 2 please? 3 MS. CALLAGHAN: Yes. 4 MR. RAY: Could I have just a second, Judge? 5 THE COURT: You may. 6 (Pause in the proceedings) 7 MR. RAY: Can I ask a couple of questions? 8 THE COURT: Yes. 9 VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION 10 BY MR. RAY:	Page 84 1 photograph through the window. 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. And State's Exhibit No. 129-B is the actual section of 4 the seat belt that you collected? 5 A. Correct. 6 Q. Now, you stated that there were some other items that 7 you recovered, I believe, a purple cloth, a lighter, a blue pin 8 and pink pen from the driver's seat; is that correct? 9 A. The red lighter and blue pen and pink pen was from the 10 driver's seat. The purple cloth was from the driver floorboard.
1 MR. RAY: Can I see those for just a second, 2 please? 3 MS. CALLAGHAN: Yes. 4 MR. RAY: Could I have just a second, Judge? 5 THE COURT: You may. 6 (Pause in the proceedings) 7 MR. RAY: Can I ask a couple of questions? 8 THE COURT: Yes. 9 VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION 10 BY MR. RAY:	Page 84 1 photograph through the window. 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. And State's Exhibit No. 129-B is the actual section of 4 the seat belt that you collected? 5 A. Correct. 6 Q. Now, you stated that there were some other items that 7 you recovered, I believe, a purple cloth, a lighter, a blue pin 8 and pink pen from the driver's seat; is that correct? 9 A. The red lighter and blue pen and pink pen was from the
1 MR. RAY: Can I see those for just a second, 2 please? 3 MS. CALLAGHAN: Yes. 4 MR. RAY: Could I have just a second, Judge? 5 THE COURT: You may. 6 (Pause in the proceedings) 7 MR. RAY: Can I ask a couple of questions? 8 THE COURT: Yes. 9 VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION 10 BY MR. RAY: 11 Q. Officer Ball if you can come over here? 12 A. Yes, sir.	Page 84 1 photograph through the window. 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. And State's Exhibit No. 129-B is the actual section of 4 the seat belt that you collected? 5 A. Correct. 6 Q. Now, you stated that there were some other items that 7 you recovered, I believe, a purple cloth, a lighter, a blue pin 8 and pink pen from the driver's seat; is that correct? 9 A. The red lighter and blue pen and pink pen was from the 10 driver's seat. The purple cloth was from the driver floorboard. 11 Q. You say the bag 129-D, it contains all of these items?
1 MR. RAY: Can I see those for just a second, 2 please? 3 MS. CALLAGHAN: Yes. 4 MR. RAY: Could I have just a second, Judge? 5 THE COURT: You may. 6 (Pause in the proceedings) 7 MR. RAY: Can I ask a couple of questions? 8 THE COURT: Yes. 9 VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION 10 BY MR. RAY: 11 Q. Officer Ball if you can come over here? 12 A. Yes, sir.	Page 84 1 photograph through the window. 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. And State's Exhibit No. 129-B is the actual section of 4 the seat belt that you collected? 5 A. Correct. 6 Q. Now, you stated that there were some other items that 7 you recovered, I believe, a purple cloth, a lighter, a blue pin 8 and pink pen from the driver's seat; is that correct? 9 A. The red lighter and blue pen and pink pen was from the 10 driver's seat. The purple cloth was from the driver floorboard. 11 Q. You say the bag 129-D, it contains all of these items? 12 A. Correct. 13 Q. At this time the State would offer 129-D for the
1 MR. RAY: Can I see those for just a second, 2 please? 3 MS. CALLAGHAN: Yes. 4 MR. RAY: Could I have just a second, Judge? 5 THE COURT: You may. 6 (Pause in the proceedings) 7 MR. RAY: Can I ask a couple of questions? 8 THE COURT: Yes. 9 VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION 10 BY MR. RAY: 11 Q. Officer Ball if you can come over here? 12 A. Yes, sir. 13 Q. Did 129-C come out of 129?	Page 84 1 photograph through the window. 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. And State's Exhibit No. 129-B is the actual section of 4 the seat belt that you collected? 5 A. Correct. 6 Q. Now, you stated that there were some other items that 7 you recovered, I believe, a purple cloth, a lighter, a blue pin 8 and pink pen from the driver's seat; is that correct? 9 A. The red lighter and blue pen and pink pen was from the 10 driver's seat. The purple cloth was from the driver floorboard. 11 Q. You say the bag 129-D, it contains all of these items? 12 A. Correct. 13 Q. At this time the State would offer 129-D for the 14 record only.
1 MR. RAY: Can I see those for just a second, 2 please? 3 MS. CALLAGHAN: Yes. 4 MR. RAY: Could I have just a second, Judge? 5 THE COURT: You may. 6 (Pause in the proceedings) 7 MR. RAY: Can I ask a couple of questions? 8 THE COURT: Yes. 9 VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION 10 BY MR. RAY: 11 Q. Officer Ball if you can come over here? 12 A. Yes, sir. 13 Q. Did 129-C come out of 129? 14 A. Yes.	Page 84 1 photograph through the window. 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. And State's Exhibit No. 129-B is the actual section of 4 the seat belt that you collected? 5 A. Correct. 6 Q. Now, you stated that there were some other items that 7 you recovered, I believe, a purple cloth, a lighter, a blue pin 8 and pink pen from the driver's seat; is that correct? 9 A. The red lighter and blue pen and pink pen was from the 10 driver's seat. The purple cloth was from the driver floorboard. 11 Q. You say the bag 129-D, it contains all of these items? 12 A. Correct. 13 Q. At this time the State would offer 129-D for the 14 record only.
1 MR. RAY: Can I see those for just a second, 2 please? 3 MS. CALLAGHAN: Yes. 4 MR. RAY: Could I have just a second, Judge? 5 THE COURT: You may. 6 (Pause in the proceedings) 7 MR. RAY: Can I ask a couple of questions? 8 THE COURT: Yes. 9 VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION 10 BY MR. RAY: 11 Q. Officer Ball if you can come over here? 12 A. Yes, sir. 13 Q. Did 129-C come out of 129? 14 A. Yes. 15 Q. And likewise, did 129-F?	Page 84 1 photograph through the window. 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. And State's Exhibit No. 129-B is the actual section of 4 the seat belt that you collected? 5 A. Correct. 6 Q. Now, you stated that there were some other items that 7 you recovered, I believe, a purple cloth, a lighter, a blue pin 8 and pink pen from the driver's seat; is that correct? 9 A. The red lighter and blue pen and pink pen was from the 10 driver's seat. The purple cloth was from the driver floorboard. 11 Q. You say the bag 129-D, it contains all of these items? 12 A. Correct. 13 Q. At this time the State would offer 129-D for the 14 record only. 15 A. Okay.
1 MR. RAY: Can I see those for just a second, 2 please? 3 MS. CALLAGHAN: Yes. 4 MR. RAY: Could I have just a second, Judge? 5 THE COURT: You may. 6 (Pause in the proceedings) 7 MR. RAY: Can I ask a couple of questions? 8 THE COURT: Yes. 9 VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION 10 BY MR. RAY: 11 Q. Officer Ball if you can come over here? 12 A. Yes, sir. 13 Q. Did 129-C come out of 129? 14 A. Yes. 15 Q. And likewise, did 129-F? 16 A. Yes.	Page 84 1 photograph through the window. 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. And State's Exhibit No. 129-B is the actual section of 4 the seat belt that you collected? 5 A. Correct. 6 Q. Now, you stated that there were some other items that 7 you recovered, I believe, a purple cloth, a lighter, a blue pin 8 and pink pen from the driver's seat; is that correct? 9 A. The red lighter and blue pen and pink pen was from the 10 driver's seat. The purple cloth was from the driver floorboard. 11 Q. You say the bag 129-D, it contains all of these items? 12 A. Correct. 13 Q. At this time the State would offer 129-D for the 14 record only. 15 A. Okay. 16 MR. RAY: No objection for the record.
1 MR. RAY: Can I see those for just a second, 2 please? 3 MS. CALLAGHAN: Yes. 4 MR. RAY: Could I have just a second, Judge? 5 THE COURT: You may. 6 (Pause in the proceedings) 7 MR. RAY: Can I ask a couple of questions? 8 THE COURT: Yes. 9 VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION 10 BY MR. RAY: 11 Q. Officer Ball if you can come over here? 12 A. Yes, sir. 13 Q. Did 129-C come out of 129? 14 A. Yes. 15 Q. And likewise, did 129-F? 16 A. Yes. 17 Q. Come out of 129?	Page 84 1 photograph through the window. 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. And State's Exhibit No. 129-B is the actual section of 4 the seat belt that you collected? 5 A. Correct. 6 Q. Now, you stated that there were some other items that 7 you recovered, I believe, a purple cloth, a lighter, a blue pin 8 and pink pen from the driver's seat; is that correct? 9 A. The red lighter and blue pen and pink pen was from the 10 driver's seat. The purple cloth was from the driver floorboard. 11 Q. You say the bag 129-D, it contains all of these items? 12 A. Correct. 13 Q. At this time the State would offer 129-D for the 14 record only. 15 A. Okay. 16 MR. RAY: No objection for the record. 17 THE COURT: Admitted.
1 MR. RAY: Can I see those for just a second, 2 please? 3 MS. CALLAGHAN: Yes. 4 MR. RAY: Could I have just a second, Judge? 5 THE COURT: You may. 6 (Pause in the proceedings) 7 MR. RAY: Can I ask a couple of questions? 8 THE COURT: Yes. 9 VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION 10 BY MR. RAY: 11 Q. Officer Ball if you can come over here? 12 A. Yes, sir. 13 Q. Did 129-C come out of 129? 14 A. Yes. 15 Q. And likewise, did 129-F? 16 A. Yes. 17 Q. Come out of 129? 18 A. Yes.	Page 84 1 photograph through the window. 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. And State's Exhibit No. 129-B is the actual section of 4 the seat belt that you collected? 5 A. Correct. 6 Q. Now, you stated that there were some other items that 7 you recovered, I believe, a purple cloth, a lighter, a blue pin 8 and pink pen from the driver's seat; is that correct? 9 A. The red lighter and blue pen and pink pen was from the 10 driver's seat. The purple cloth was from the driver floorboard. 11 Q. You say the bag 129-D, it contains all of these items? 12 A. Correct. 13 Q. At this time the State would offer 129-D for the 14 record only. 15 A. Okay. 16 MR. RAY: No objection for the record. 17 THE COURT: Admitted. 18 (State's Exhibit No. 129-D received)
1 MR. RAY: Can I see those for just a second, 2 please? 3 MS. CALLAGHAN: Yes. 4 MR. RAY: Could I have just a second, Judge? 5 THE COURT: You may. 6 (Pause in the proceedings) 7 MR. RAY: Can I ask a couple of questions? 8 THE COURT: Yes. 9 VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION 10 BY MR. RAY: 11 Q. Officer Ball if you can come over here? 12 A. Yes, sir. 13 Q. Did 129-C come out of 129? 14 A. Yes. 15 Q. And likewise, did 129-F? 16 A. Yes. 17 Q. Come out of 129? 18 A. Yes. 19 Q. And then 129-A also came out of there, or was this	Page 84 1 photograph through the window. 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. And State's Exhibit No. 129-B is the actual section of 4 the seat belt that you collected? 5 A. Correct. 6 Q. Now, you stated that there were some other items that 7 you recovered, I believe, a purple cloth, a lighter, a blue pin 8 and pink pen from the driver's seat; is that correct? 9 A. The red lighter and blue pen and pink pen was from the 10 driver's seat. The purple cloth was from the driver floorboard. 11 Q. You say the bag 129-D, it contains all of these items? 12 A. Correct. 13 Q. At this time the State would offer 129-D for the 14 record only. 15 A. Okay. 16 MR. RAY: No objection for the record. 17 THE COURT: Admitted. 18 (State's Exhibit No. 129-D received) 19 Q. Now, except for the blood swabs that you took from
MR. RAY: Can I see those for just a second, please? MS. CALLAGHAN: Yes. MR. RAY: Could I have just a second, Judge? THE COURT: You may. (Pause in the proceedings) MR. RAY: Can I ask a couple of questions? THE COURT: Yes. VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION BY MR. RAY: Q. Officer Ball if you can come over here? A. Yes, sir. Q. Did 129-C come out of 129? A. Yes. Q. And likewise, did 129-F? A. Yes. Q. Come out of 129? A. Yes. Q. And then 129-A also came out of there, or was this please of the proceedings.	Page 84 1 photograph through the window. 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. And State's Exhibit No. 129-B is the actual section of 4 the seat belt that you collected? 5 A. Correct. 6 Q. Now, you stated that there were some other items that 7 you recovered, I believe, a purple cloth, a lighter, a blue pin 8 and pink pen from the driver's seat; is that correct? 9 A. The red lighter and blue pen and pink pen was from the 10 driver's seat. The purple cloth was from the driver floorboard. 11 Q. You say the bag 129-D, it contains all of these items? 12 A. Correct. 13 Q. At this time the State would offer 129-D for the 14 record only. 15 A. Okay. 16 MR. RAY: No objection for the record. 17 THE COURT: Admitted. 18 (State's Exhibit No. 129-D received) 19 Q. Now, except for the blood swabs that you took from 20 the outside of the car, okay, the outside door handle and the
1 MR. RAY: Can I see those for just a second, 2 please? 3 MS. CALLAGHAN: Yes. 4 MR. RAY: Could I have just a second, Judge? 5 THE COURT: You may. 6 (Pause in the proceedings) 7 MR. RAY: Can I ask a couple of questions? 8 THE COURT: Yes. 9 VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION 10 BY MR. RAY: 11 Q. Officer Ball if you can come over here? 12 A. Yes, sir. 13 Q. Did 129-C come out of 129? 14 A. Yes. 15 Q. And likewise, did 129-F? 16 A. Yes. 17 Q. Come out of 129? 18 A. Yes. 19 Q. And then 129-A also came out of there, or was this separate? 21 A. This was packaged inside of that.	Page 84 1 photograph through the window. 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. And State's Exhibit No. 129-B is the actual section of 4 the seat belt that you collected? 5 A. Correct. 6 Q. Now, you stated that there were some other items that 7 you recovered, I believe, a purple cloth, a lighter, a blue pin 8 and pink pen from the driver's seat; is that correct? 9 A. The red lighter and blue pen and pink pen was from the 10 driver's seat. The purple cloth was from the driver floorboard. 11 Q. You say the bag 129-D, it contains all of these items? 12 A. Correct. 13 Q. At this time the State would offer 129-D for the 14 record only. 15 A. Okay. 16 MR. RAY: No objection for the record. 17 THE COURT: Admitted. 18 (State's Exhibit No. 129-D received) 19 Q. Now, except for the blood swabs that you took from 20 the outside of the car, okay, the outside door handle and the 21 trunk, all of the other blood, where was that found in the car?
1 MR. RAY: Can I see those for just a second, 2 please? 3 MS. CALLAGHAN: Yes. 4 MR. RAY: Could I have just a second, Judge? 5 THE COURT: You may. 6 (Pause in the proceedings) 7 MR. RAY: Can I ask a couple of questions? 8 THE COURT: Yes. 9 VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION 10 BY MR. RAY: 11 Q. Officer Ball if you can come over here? 12 A. Yes, sir. 13 Q. Did 129-C come out of 129? 14 A. Yes. 15 Q. And likewise, did 129-F? 16 A. Yes. 17 Q. Come out of 129? 18 A. Yes. 19 Q. And then 129-A also came out of there, or was this separate? 21 A. This was packaged inside of that. 22 MR. RAY: Judge, I don't have any objection. I	Page 84 1 photograph through the window. 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. And State's Exhibit No. 129-B is the actual section of 4 the seat belt that you collected? 5 A. Correct. 6 Q. Now, you stated that there were some other items that 7 you recovered, I believe, a purple cloth, a lighter, a blue pin 8 and pink pen from the driver's seat; is that correct? 9 A. The red lighter and blue pen and pink pen was from the 10 driver's seat. The purple cloth was from the driver floorboard. 11 Q. You say the bag 129-D, it contains all of these items? 12 A. Correct. 13 Q. At this time the State would offer 129-D for the 14 record only. 15 A. Okay. 16 MR. RAY: No objection for the record. 17 THE COURT: Admitted. 18 (State's Exhibit No. 129-D received) 19 Q. Now, except for the blood swabs that you took from 20 the outside of the car, okay, the outside door handle and the 21 trunk, all of the other blood, where was that found in the car? 22 A. All the other blood was located in the driver's seat

			TM
	Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Cend	'nS	6/03/17 Page 26 of 64 PageID 4662
	Page 85		Page 87
1	A. Correct.	1	on top.
2	Q. But it was all centering behind the driver's seat	2	MR. RAY: Could I approach the witness?
3	behind the steering wheel.	3	THE COURT: Yes.
4	A. Correct.	4	Q. This item here, State's 129 admitted for the record
5	Q. You said that you processed the vehicle for prints?	5	only, is that an item you retrieved from the property room
6	A. Correct.	6	today?
7	Q. Basically how do you do that?	7	A. An item I retrieved last night.
8	A. The exterior of the car is processed for prints using	8	Q. Okay. And it's got your name on it, doesn't it?
9		9	A. Right, when I checked it out for court.
10	used for different items. It depends on what specific item you	10	Q. You always do that?
1	are processing.	11	A. Yes.
12	Q. Were you able to obtain any usable fingerprints from	12	Q. When I say you always do that, you wrote your name and
13	the car?	13	other stuff on there, did you not?
14	A. No, I was not.	14	A. Yeah, I wrote the date, time when I checked it out.
15	·	15	Q. Why did you do that?
16		16	
17	Q. You don't necessarily expect to find fingerprints?	17	
18	• •	18	
19		į į	took it out and brought it to court."
	secure it?	20	A. Correct.
21	A. I secured it in our blood-drying room and packaging	21	Q. Just like Ms. Callaghan asked you.
	room.	22	A. Right.
23	Q. Once it dried, was it submitted into property?	23	Q. If you didn't do that, you might not know when you did
24	A. Yes, it was.	24	
25		25	A. Correct.
F		1	
١.	Page 86	١.	Page 88
	maintained by the Fort Worth Police Department?	1	Q. Kind of supports your story, what you said, right?
2	A. Correct.	2	A. Correct.
3	Q. People can't walk in willy-nilly and take it out.	3	MR. RAY: I'll pass the witness. Thank you,
4	A. No.	4	Officer Ball.
5	Q. You have to be a police officer to get it.	5	REDIRECT EXAMINATION
6	A. Correct.	6	BY MS. CALLAGHAN:
7	Q. Or be operating with a Court order.	7	Q. When you obtain evidence from the property room, you
8	A. Correct.	8	are aware that sometimes the Medical Examiner's office or the
9	MS. CALLAGHAN: Thank you, Officer Ball.	9	lab has examined it.
10	Pass the witness, Your Honor.	10	A. Correct.
111	CROSS-EXAMINATION	11	Q. And you are able to recognize their seal and where
l	BY MR. RAY:	12	they have closed bags after they have reviewed evidence,
13	Q. Officer Ball, there were some items that you went and	13	correct?
14	got and brought over here today; is that correct?	14	A. Correct.
15	A. That's correct.	15	Q. Other than that, do these bags show any kind of
16	Q. When you go get something from the property room, do	16	tampering from any other source?
	they just hand it to you? Do you just say, "Hey, I'm Officer	17	A. No.
	Ball"?	18	Q. Except from the Medical Examiner's office opening them
19	A. No, you have to sign it out.	19	to examine them?
20	Q. I notice there is some writing on there that appears	20	A. Correct.
21	to be your name. Did you write your name on some of	21	MS. CALLAGHAN: Pass the witness.
22	MR. RAY: Could I approach the witness?	22	MR. RAY: Nothing further.
23	THE COURT: Yes.	23	THE COURT: You may step down, sir.
24	MS. CALLAGHAN: The items admitted for the record	24	MS. HARTMANN: The State calls Detective John
25	only are down in the box; the items for all purposes are sitting	25	McCaskill.

Page 27 of 64 PageID Page 91 (Conference at the bench) 1 had been set up around the periphery of the residence or the (Witness Sworn) 2 parking lot there; and about the same time I arrived, one of the 3 Whereupon, 3 crime scene officers arrived also. I believe Officer Wallace 4 and Officer Wilson arrived at pretty close to the same time I JOHN MCCASKILL, 5 having been first duly sworn, testified as follows: 5 did. DIRECT EXAMINATION Q. All right. And was the entrance and exits -- was the 7 BY MS. HARTMANN: 7 entrance into the house being maintained by a Fort Worth police Q. Would you introduce yourself to the members of the 8 officer? A. Yes. 9 jury? 9 A. My name is John McCaskill. 10 Q. What is the purpose of that person maintaining or Q. How are you employed? 11 standing guard at the entrance of the crime scene? A. I am a detective with the Fort Worth Police A. To make sure no unauthorized persons exit or enter the 13 Department. 13 residence, and it is mainly to maintain evidence. Q. How long have you been a Fort Worth Police Department Q. So prevent evidence from being contaminated or 14 15 detective? 15 destroyed --A. For 17 years. 16 A. Yes, ma'am, that's correct. 17 Q. How long in total have you been with the Fort Worth Q. -- or lost? 18 Police Department? 18 A. Yes, ma'am. A. For 21 years. 19 Q. And based upon your years as a homicide detective, let Q. And which Division are you currently assigned to work 20 me ask you this. I'm not going to ask you for an exact number 21 as a detective? 21 because I don't know if you can give me that, but approximately A. I am assigned to the homicide unit. 22 how many homicide crime scenes have you been present at and Q. As a homicide detective with the Fort Worth Police 23 investigated? 24 Department, what are your specific duties? 24 A. I've probably had about 25 or so cases that were A. We investigate murders and we also investigate 25 actually assigned to me, but I have responded to assist on other Page 90 Page 92 1 suspicious deaths that might occur within the city limits of 1 homicides with other detectives and I would -- several dozen if 2 not maybe into the low hundreds. Q. And how long have you specifically been in the Q. And in your observation and understanding of how the 4 crime scene had been maintained, you as an investigating A. A little over three years. 5 detective, were you satisfied with that? Q. Are you a certified peace officer? A. Yes, I was. A. Yes, ma'am. Q. When you got to the house itself, did you actually go Q. I want to direct your attention back to the date of 8 inside the house? 9 April 8, 2003, and ask if you were so employed as a homicide A. Not immediately, but shortly after arrival, I did, 10 yes.

2 Fort Worth.

1

2

10

11

12

14

16

17

19

20

22

23

25

- 4 homicide unit?
- 5
- 6

- 10 detective on this date.
- 11 A. Yes, ma'am, I was.
- 12 Q. Did you receive a call or were you requested to go to
- 13 an address of 2716 Scott Avenue here in Fort Worth?
- 14 A. Yes, ma'am, I was.
- 15 Q. Is that an address and location in Fort Worth, Tarrant
- 16 County, Texas?
- 17 A. Yes, ma'am, it is.
- 18 Q. Was there a house at that address?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. Approximately what time did you get to that address?
- 21 A. I actually arrived at about 7:40 p.m.
- 22 Q. When you arrived at the house at 2716 Scott, what was
- 23 going on at that point?
- A. There was a lot of police activity there. There were 24
- 25 several uniformed police officers there, some crime scene tape

- 11 Q. What did you do once you arrived?
- 12 A. I spoke with some of the responding officers and I
- 13 wanted to get some details about what their actions were when
- 14 they arrived and to get some information about what they knew
- 15 about the homicide or homicides.
- Q. And once you got that preliminary information, what
- 17 did you do next?
- 18 A. I then went into the residence along with officers
- 19 Wallace and Wilson.
- Q. Why did Officer Wallace and Wilson accompany you into 20
- 21 the house?
- A. That's crime scene officers and that's a personal
- 23 policy that I like to go in if possible at the same time crime
- 24 scene officers do. It doesn't always work that way in reality,
- 25 but in this case it did.

Page 93

1 Q. So crime scene didn't go in before you did?

2 A. I don't recall that they did, no.

3 Q. When you went into the home, where was the first place

4 that you went?

A. We went through the front door which led into a living

6 room type of area. There was a hallway that led to a restroom

7 and a bedroom that was off of that, and then also there was

8 dining room that was adjacent to that living room.

9 Q. Were you able to notice -- immediately upon entering

10 the house and seeing these rooms, did you notice anything that

11 appeared to be blood upon your immediate entrance?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Where were you seeing signs of that?

14 A. There were several large droplets of blood that were

15 on the entryway that was just inside the front door of the

16 residence.

17 Q. All right. And as you continued on into the house and

18 went into the dining room area, did you see anything in addition

19 to the -- to what you had seen in the entryway?

20 A. Yes. There were quite a few more large droplets of

21 blood in the living room -- I'm sorry, in the dining room; and

22 there appeared to be a trail of blood drops that led into the

23 kitchen of the residence, which was on the other side of the

24 dining room.

Q. All right. And did you find a location where the two

1 at least one of the victims?

2 A. I don't specifically recall at that point, no.

Q. All right. Would it be fair to say that the scene was

4 significantly bloody, that there was a lot of blood surrounding

Page 95

Page 96

5 the two bodies?

A. Yes, ma'am, most definitely.

Q. All right. The blood, or what you believed to be

8 blood, evidence that was in the entryway, the kitchen, the

9 dining room, did that have any significance to you as a homicide

10 detective after looking at the location of the bodies and the

11 location of what appeared to be other blood elswhere in the

12 house?

13 A. Yes, it did.

14 Q. And what significance did it have to you?

15 A. After observing the scene in the totality of it as I

16 observed it, I did not believe that those blood drops could have

17 originated from either of the two victims. At that point I

18 believed that those blood drops belonged to a suspect.

19 Q. Why did you form that opinion?

20 A. Well, the blood droplets led away from the bodies.

21 No. 1 led to the front door of the residence. There was the

22 blood drops at the entryway, then led away from the bodies

23 through the dining room into the kitchen to a drawer. There was

24 a smear of blood on the front of that drawer.

And then we opened the drawer and there were some

Page 94

25

1 victims, Pearl, R.D. Magouirk and Patricia Syren were located?

A. Yes.

2

3 Q. And where were they located?

4 A. They were in the hallway that led from the living room

5 to a bedroom, and it was just outside of a bathroom on one side;

6 and then there was another entry that went from that hallway

7 into the dining room that was just opposite the bathroom door.

8 Q. Okay. And was there a significant amount of blood

9 surrounding the location of their two bodies?

10 A. Yes, ma'am.

Q. Were you able to look at the bodies of Patricia Syren

12 and Pearl R.D. Magouirk and see any signs of obvious injury?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. And what specific signs of obvious injury did you

15 notice?

16 A. Well, there was a large amount of blood, and we

17 couldn't immediately tell the exact nature of all the injuries,

18 but it was obvious that their throats had been cut at that

19 point. And it wasn't until later when the Medical Examiner's

20 office arrived that I was able to observe some stab wounds to

21 the torso of both these ladies.

Q. All right. And when you say torso, are you talking

23 about the chest down to the abdomen?

24 A. Yes, ma'am.

Q. Were you ever able to notice any wounds on the back of

1 towels located inside that drawer. The blood trail or blood

2 droplets stopped at that point.

Q. Was there also what appeared to be blood located in a

4 detached garage at the back of the property at 2716 Scott?

A. Yes, ma'am, it was.

Q. Was that blood -- well, let me ask you this. Was

7 there a vehicle in that detached garage at the time you were in

8 there?

9 A. No.

10 Q. Was there anything on the floor of that garage that in

11 your common life experience you formed an opinion about as far

12 as stains?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. What was that?

15 A. There were several large droplets of blood that were

16 on the floor that would have been in about the same position

17 where the driver door would have been had there been a vehicle

18 there.

19 And I came to believe that because there were

20 some oil or grease stains in the garage that seemed to indicate

21 that the vehicle was pulled -- typically parked in the garage

22 facing forward. And the location of the drops in relation to

23 that made me believe that it was near where the driver's door

24 would have been.

25 Q. And then the -- noting what appeared to be blood drops

Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Candenself $^{\text{TM}}_{3/17}$ Page 29 of 64

Page 97

1 there in the garage near where a driver's side door may have

- 2 been at one time, did that factor in as well into your
- 3 determination that that blood may not have come from the
- 4 victims?
- 5 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 6 Q. Did you form a belief about who that blood might have
- 7 been from?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. What type of belief did you form?
- 10 A. Well, I believed that was -- that it probably
- 11 originated from the suspect in this offense.
- 12 Q. Did you form any type of opinion as to whether or not
- 13 the suspect involved in this offense may have been injured?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Did you notice an answering machine there in the
- 16 house?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. Where was that answering machine located?
- 19 A. It was in the hallway where the victims were located.
- 20 Q. Was there anything of significance about the answering
- 21 machine that, just by looking at it, drew your attention to it?
- 22 A. Yes, ma'am. There was a flashing light that I
- 23 believed was an indicator that there were some messages on the
- 24 answering machine.
- 25 Q. Did you, in fact, listen to the messages on the

1 the fraud detection service. It wasn't until later that other

Page 99

Page 100

- 2 detectives in our office actually spoke with Morgan Stanley.
- O. All right. Were you able to learn during the course
- 4 of your investigation that one of the victims, Patricia Syren,
- 5 had a credit card, a Master Card, through Morgan Stanley?
- A. Yes, ma'am.
 - Q. Were you also through your investigation able to
- 8 determine or receive information about where Patricia Syren's
- 9 Morgan Stanley credit card or Master Card had been used from
- 10 Sunday April 6 up until the current date of April 8 and April 9,
- 11 2003?

13

- 12 A. Yes, ma'am.
 - Q. Was that information helpful to you in attempting to
- 14 focus a direction in which to move the investigation?
- 15 A. Yes, ma'am, it was.
- 16 Q. Did you, in fact, continue your investigation of this
- 17 case outside the city limits of Fort Worth?
- 18
- 19 Q. And what city did you go to or continue your
- 20 investigation?
- 21 A. We drove to Galveston.
- 22 Q. Why Galveston as opposed to any other city here in the
- 23 state of Texas?
- A. I was advised that particular credit card that
- 25 belonged to Ms. Syren had been used most recently in Galveston,

Page 98

- 1 particularly at about 6:40 p.m. on the evening of the 8th, which
- 2 was the same night that we were out there at the house, and then
- 3 also to rent a motel room down there the previous night.
- Q. All right. Were you also able to determine -- well,
- 5 let me ask you this. Did it appear from the bodies and the -- I
- 6 guess the condition of the blood evidence, did it appear that
- 7 Patricia Syren and Pearl R.D. Magouirk had been dead for a day
- 8 or two?
- 9 A. Yes.
- Q. Were you interested as well in the charges that were
- 11 made on April 6, 2003, and April 7, 2003?
- 12 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 13 Q. Were leads followed up in regards to charges made on
- 14 those two days?
- 15 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 16 Q. Were there charges made on that credit card here in .
- 17 Fort Worth?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. When you went to Galveston, were you accompanied by
- 20 anybody?
- 21 A. Yes, ma'am, my partner Detective Matt Hardy.
- 22 Q. Did you notify the police department in Galveston that
- 23 you were on your way down?
- 24 A. Yes.

25

Q. What day, in fact, did you and Detective Hardy travel

1 answering machine?

- A. Yes, I did.
- 3 Q. Were there any messages from -- or was there a message
- 4 from Officer McClenny?
- 5 A. Yes.
- Q. Were there any messages from a person named April 6
- 7 Syren?
- 8 A. Yes.
- Q. Were there any messages from a fraud detection agency
- 10 affiliated with a credit card company?
- 11 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 12 Q. Were you, in fact, able to view some of the
- 13 information on the answering machine to contact the appropriate
- 14 credit card company for the investigation of your case?
- 15 A. Yes, ma'am. I actually called -- there was a 1-800
- 16 number left on the answering machine, and I called that number
- 17 and was able to speak with an individual who actually
- 18 represented the fraud detection agency.
- 19 Q. All right. And that fraud detection agency, were they
- 20 affiliated with or connected to the Morgan Stanley Master Card
- 21 Company?
- 22 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 23 Q. And were you able to speak with the Morgan Stanley
- 24 Master Card personnel over the phone?
- 25 A. The person I actually spoke with that night worked for

Page 30 of 64 1 to Galveston? 1 speak with you. A. We left on the morning of the 9th. 2 A. Yes, ma'am. Q. And that would be Wednesday? 3 MR. RAY: Objection to leading. A. Yes, ma'am. 4 THE COURT: Overruled. Q. So Tuesday evening sometime after 7:00 p.m. you are 5 MR. RAY: Thank you. 6 actually at the house investigating the death, and then 6 THE WITNESS: Yes, ma'am, I was. 7 Wednesday morning you go to Galveston. Q. When you were notified by a Galveston police officer A. That's correct. 8 that the Defendant wanted to speak with you, what did you do at Q. All right. When you go to the city of Galveston, 9 that point? 10 where did you go first? 10 A. I asked if we could be provided with an interview A. To the Galveston Police Department. 11 room, and we were. It was actually located upstairs on the Q. When you got to the Galveston Police Department, did 12 second floor of the Galveston Police Department. 13 you meet with an individual by the name of Billy Jack Q. All right. And did you, in fact, go to that 14 Crutsinger? 14 particular room? A. Yes, ma'am. 15 A. Yes, ma'am. Q. Do you see anybody here in the courtroom today that 16 Q. Was Mr. Crutsinger taken to that room? 17 you recognize to be Billy Jack Crutsinger? 17 A. Yes, he was. A. Yes, ma'am, I do. 18 O. When you met with Mr. Crutsinger, did you advise him Q. Can you tell us where that person is located and 19 of his Miranda Warnings? 20 something they are wearing? 20 A. Yes, ma'am, I did. 21 A. Sitting at the far right of the tables as I face them, Q. Can you tell the members of the jury specifically what 22 and he's wearing pinkish long-sleeve dress shirt, and it looks 22 those Miranda Warnings were that you spoke -- or gave to the 23 like blue or grayish-blue pants. 23 Defendant, Mr. Crutsinger? Q. Just for clarification, if I'm Person 1, continuing on 24 A. Yes, ma'am. Would you like for me to read them 25 down the line, what number of person would that person be? 25 verbatim. Page 104 Page 102 A. Five. Q. Absolutely. MS. HARTMANN: At this time may the record A. You have the right to remain silent and not make any 3 reflect that Detective McCaskill has identified the Defendant? 3 statement at all, and any statement you make may be used as THE COURT: It will. 4 evidence against you at your trial. Any statement you make may Q. When you met with Mr. Crutsinger, did you introduce 5 be used as evidence against you in court. 6 yourself? You have the right to have a lawyer present to A. Yes. 7 advise you prior to and during any questioning. If you are Q. Did you tell him what your name was? 8 unable to employ a lawyer, you have the right to have a lawyer A. Yes, I did. 9 appointed to advise you prior to and during any questioning. Q. Did you tell him what your job title was? 10 You have to right to terminate the interview at A. Yes. I told him I was a detective with the Fort Worth 11 any time. 12 police. 12 Q. And when you advised Mr. Crutsinger of his Miranda Q. And once you initially introduced yourself to Mr. 13 Warnings, did Mr. Crutsinger indicate to you that he understood 14 Crutsinger, did you then leave Mr. Crutsinger and go speak with 14 those warnings? some police personnel outside --15 A. Yes, he did. MR. MOORE: Excuse me. Your Honor, we're going 16 Q. Did he have any questions regarding them? 17 to have to object to her leading the witness. 17 A. No, ma'am. THE COURT: Overruled. 18 Q. Did he ever ask to speak with a lawyer? Q. After you introduced yourself to the Defendant, Mr. 19 A. No, ma'am. 20 Crutsinger, did you stay there or did you go someplace else at 20 Q. Did he ever at that point tell you that he no longer

21 wished to speak with you?

A. No, ma'am.

Q. Could you tell the members of the jury what Mr.

24 Crutsinger's demeanor was when you met with him on April 9,

22

23

25 2003?

2

3

4

11

12

15

16

19

1

2

7

8

9

10

11

13

15

16

18

19

22

24

23 some Galveston officers.

A. No, I stepped out of the room and went and talked to

Q. All right. At any time were you notified by a

25 Galveston officer that the Defendant, Mr. Crutsinger, wanted to

Case 4:07-cy-00703-Y Document 87 $\mathbf{Gase} \mathbf{4:07-cy-00703-Y}$ Page 31 of 64 PageID 4667 Page 105 Page 107 A. He seemed to be from time to time emotional, upset. 1 A. No, ma'am. 2 At other times he appeared to be very calm and matter of fact. 2 O. Did he have any questions for you when you advised him 3 His demeanor actually varied back and forth several times. 3 of his Miranda rights on the oral recording? Q. All right. Did he appear to continue to want to be 4 A. No. 5 voluntarily present with you and talk with you? 5 Q. Did he ever invoke any of those rights at any time? A. Yes, ma'am. A. No. ma'am. 6 Q. Did you speak with the Defendant about your O. Did the Defendant, Mr. Crutsinger, sign that Miranda 8 investigation into the murders of Patricia Syren and Pearl R.D. 8 card? 9 Magouirk? 9 A. Yes, he did. A. Yes, ma'am. 10 O. In your opinion, did the Defendant knowingly, Q. After talking with Mr. Crutsinger, did you ask him if 11 intelligently and voluntarily waive his rights and agree to talk 12 he would be willing to give you a tape-recorded or oral 12 with you? 13 statement? 13 A. Yes, ma'am. A. Yes, ma'am. 14 Q. Did the Defendant appear intoxicated to you? Q. Did he indicate that he would want to do that? 15 A. No, ma'am. 16 Q. Did he appear high? Q. Did you, in fact, have a tape recording device with 17 A. No. 18 you there in Galveston? 18 Q. Did he appear to be under the influence of anything? A. Yes, ma'am. 19 A. No, ma'am. Q. And a tape? 20 Q. Was Mr. Crutsinger promised anything in exchange for A. Yes, ma'am. 21 talking with you? Q. Did you, in fact, record an oral statement from Mr. 22 A. No, ma'am. 23 Crutsinger? 23 Q. Was Mr. Crutsinger threatened by either you or A. Yes, I did. 24 Detective Hardy in order to get the statement? Q. Who was present at the time of that statement? A. No, ma'am. Page 106 Page 108 A. Detective Hardy, myself and Mr. Crutsinger. Q. Was Mr. Crutsinger denied the use of any type of Q. When you began to take the oral statement, did you 2 bathroom facilities? 3 Mirandize Mr. Crutsinger again for a second time? A. No. 3 A. Yes, ma'am. Q. Was Mr. Crutsinger denied refreshments, such as water? Q. Again, if you would for the jury, what rights did you 5 A. No, ma'am. 6 read to Mr. Crutsinger? Q. So to be clear on your testimony, Detective, the A. The Miranda warnings which I read to you a second ago. 7 Defendant was Mirandized at least three separate times by you? Q. The exact same ones? 8 A. Well, twice. A. Yes, ma'am. 9 Q. Okay. Once orally when you first met with him. Q. Are those Miranda warnings actually heard on that tape 10 A. No. No, ma'am, I --11 recording of the Defendant's statement? 11 Q. In the interview room. A. Yes, ma'am, they are. A. In the interview room, yes. When I first met with him 12 Q. Did you in addition ask the Defendant to sign a 13 earlier, I just introduced myself, and that was it. 14 Miranda card? 14 Q. Is that the point where you provided the written A. Yes. 15 Miranda card, or was that at the time of the tape recording? Q. Tell the members of the jury what a Miranda card is. 16 A. That was earlier when he first stepped into the A. It is just a preprinted form that has the Miranda 17 interview room. 18 warnings actually written on them. And we would provide that --18 Q. Okay. So you gave him the card? 19 after their being read, we would provide them to an individual 19 A. Yes, ma'am. 20 and asked that they read over them and if they understand them 20 Q. You orally advised him of his Miranda rights? 21 and agree to them, to then sign and date the form. 21 A. Yes, ma'am. Q. The Miranda card that you Provided to this Defendant, 22 Q. And then you advised him of his Miranda rights during 23 did you give him an opportunity to read those? 23 the oral recording of his statement?

24

10

11

14

15

16

17

19

20

21

22

24

25

1

2

5

7

8

9

10

12

15

16

17

22

24

25

A. Yes.

Q. Did he have any questions for you?

A. Yes, ma'am. I considered the first time to be one

25 time. I'm sorry if I misunderstood.

1 Q. That's okay. Is the Defendant's waiver of his Miranda 2 rights heard on that oral recording? 3 A. Yes. 4 MS. HARTMANN: May I approach the witness? 5 THE COURT: Yes. 6 Q. Let me ask you this, Detective. Do you recall what 7 Mr. Crutsinger was wearing as far as his shirt at the time that 8 you interviewed him? 9 A. Yes, ma'am. 10 Q. What was he wearing? 11 A. He was wearing a white Joe's Crab Shack t-shirt. 12 Q. What condition did it appear to be in? 13 A. It looked brand new to me. 14 Q. I'm going to show you what's been previously marked 15 for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and 16 ask you to take a look at those, please? 17 A. (Witness complies) Yes, ma'am. 19 they purport to depict? 11 THE COURT: No. 103 is admitted. 2 (State's Exhibit No. 103 received) 3 MS. HARTMANN: Permission to publish? 4 THE COURT: You may. 5 Q. Where did you observe where was this injury of Defendant? 7 A. It was on his right forefinger. 8 Q. Were you also asked to bring with you today, 9 Detective, the original Miranda sheet that the Defendant of given to read and sign? 11 A. Yes, ma'am. 12 Q. I'm showing you what's been marked for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify used to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that you have to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that you have to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that you have to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that you have to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that you have to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that you have to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that you have to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that you have the purport to depict? 16 Q. Does that contain the exact same rights that you have the purport to depict? 18 A. Yes, ma'am. 19 Q. Has the Defendant signed State's No. 130?	٠.
Page 109 1 Q. That's okay. Is the Defendant's waiver of his Miranda 2 rights heard on that oral recording? 3 A. Yes. 4 MS. HARTMANN: May I approach the witness? 5 THE COURT: Yes. 6 Q. Let me ask you this, 'Detective. Do you recall what 7 Mr. Crutsinger was wearing as far as his shirt at the time that 8 you interviewed him? 9 A. Yes, ma'am. 10 Q. What was he wearing? 11 A. He was wearing a white Joe's Crab Shack t-shirt. 12 Q. What condition did it appear to be in? 13 A. It looked brand new to me. 14 Q. I'm going to show you what's been previously marked 15 for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and 16 ask you to take a look at those, please? 17 A. (Witness complies) Yes, ma'am. 18 Q. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict what 19 they purport to depict? 1 THE COURT: No. 103 is admitted. 2 (State's Exhibit No. 103 received) 3 MS. HARTMANN: Permission to publish? 4 THE COURT: No. 103 is admitted. 2 (State's Exhibit No. 103 received) 4 THE COURT: No. 103 is admitted. 2 (State's Exhibit No. 103 received) 5 MS. HARTMANN: Permission to publish? 4 THE COURT: No. 103 is admitted. 2 (State's Exhibit No. 103 received) 5 MS. HARTMANN: Permission to publish? 4 THE COURT: No. 103 is admitted. 2 (State's Exhibit No. 103 received) 5 MS. HARTMANN: Permission to publish? 4 THE COURT: No. 103 is admitted. 2 (State's Exhibit No. 103 received) 5 MS. HARTMANN: Permission to publish? 4 THE COURT: Sould is admitted. 2 (State's Exhibit No. 103 received) 5 MS. HARTMANN: Permission to publish? 4 THE COURT: Sould is admitted. 2 (State's Exhibit No. 103 received) 5 Q. Where did you observe where was this injury of Defendant? 7 A. It was on his right forefinger. 8 Q. Were you also asked to bring with you today, 9 Detective, the original Miranda sheet that the Defendant is given to read and sign? 11 A. Yes, ma'am. 12 Q. I'm showing you what's been marked for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify a purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify a purposes as State's Exhi	<u> </u>
2 rights heard on that oral recording? 3 A. Yes. 4 Ms. HARTMANN: May I approach the witness? 5 THE COURT: Yes, 6 Q. Let me ask you this, Detective. Do you recall what 7 Mr. Crutsinger was wearing as far as his shirt at the time that 8 you interviewed him? 9 A. Yes, ma'am. 10 Q. What was he wearing? 11 A. He was wearing a white Joe's Crab Shack t-shirt. 12 Q. What condition did it appear to be in? 13 A. It looked brand new to me. 14 Q. I'm going to show you what's been previously marked 15 for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and 16 ask you to take a look at those, please? 17 A. (Witness complies) Yes, ma'am. 19 they purport to depict? 2 (State's Exhibit No. 103 received) 3 Ms. HARTMANN: Permission to publish? 4 THE COURT: You may. 5 Q. Where did you observe — where was this injury of Defendant? 7 A. It was on his right forefinger. 8 Q. Were you also asked to bring with you today, 9 Detective, the original Miranda sheet that the Defendant 10 given to read and sign? 11 A. Yes, ma'am. 12 Q. I'm showing you what's been marked for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and 104 and 105 ask you to take a look at those, please? 10 Q. Does that contain the exact same rights that you had 105 fairly and accurately depict what 105 used to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular 106 Q. Does that contain the exact same rights that you had 106 ask you to take a look at those, please? 10 Q. Does that contain the exact same rights that you had 106 ask you to take a look at those, please? 11 A. (Witness complies) Yes, ma'am. 12 Q. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict what 119 Q. Has the Defendant signed State's No. 130?	e 111
3 MS. HARTMANN: Permission to publish? 4 MS. HARTMANN: May I approach the witness? 5 THE COURT: Yes, 6 Q. Let me ask you this, 'Detective. Do you recall what 7 Mr. Crutsinger was wearing as far as his shirt at the time that 8 you interviewed him? 9 A. Yes, ma'am. 10 Q. What was he wearing? 11 A. He was wearing a white Joe's Crab Shack t-shirt. 12 Q. What condition did it appear to be in? 13 A. It looked brand new to me. 14 Q. I'm going to show you what's been previously marked 15 for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and 16 ask you to take a look at those, please? 17 A. (Witness complies) Yes, ma'am. 18 Q. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict what 19 they purport to depict? 3 MS. HARTMANN: Permission to publish? 4 THE COURT: You may. 5 Q. Where did you observe where was this injury of Defendant? 7 A. It was on his right forefinger. 8 Q. Were you also asked to bring with you today, 9 Detective, the original Miranda sheet that the Defendant in given to read and sign? 11 A. Yes, ma'am. 12 Q. I'm showing you what's been marked for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and in the country of the purpose as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and in the exact same rights that you in the exact same rights that you interviewed him? 14 A. Yes, That's the original Miranda warning sheet that the Defendant in the exact same rights that you interviewed him? 15 Q. Does that contain the exact same rights that you interviewed him? 16 Q. Does that contain the exact same rights that you interviewed him? 17 previously read or explained to the jury? 18 A. Yes, ma'am. 19 Q. Has the Defendant signed State's No. 130?	
4 MS. HARTMANN: May I approach the witness? 5 THE COURT: Yes, 6 Q. Let me ask you this, Detective. Do you recall what 7 Mr. Crutsinger was wearing as far as his shirt at the time that 8 you interviewed him? 9 A. Yes, ma'am. 10 Q. What was he wearing? 11 A. He was wearing a white Joe's Crab Shack t-shirt. 12 Q. What condition did it appear to be in? 13 A. It looked brand new to me. 14 Q. I'm going to show you what's been previously marked 15 for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and 16 ask you to take a look at those, please? 17 A. (Witness complies) Yes, ma'am. 18 Q. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict what 19 they purport to depict? 4 THE COURT: You may. 5 Q. Where did you observe where was this injury of Defendant? 7 A. It was on his right forefinger. 8 Q. Were you also asked to bring with you today, 9 Detective, the original Miranda sheet that the Defendant of given to read and sign? 11 A. Yes, ma'am. 12 Q. I'm showing you what's been marked for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and 105 used to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular of Defendant signed State's No. 130?	
5 THE COURT: Yes, 6 Q. Let me ask you this, 'Detective. Do you recall what 7 Mr. Crutsinger was wearing as far as his shirt at the time that 8 you interviewed him? 9 A. Yes, ma'am. 10 Q. What was he wearing? 11 A. He was wearing a white Joe's Crab Shack t-shirt. 12 Q. What condition did it appear to be in? 13 A. It looked brand new to me. 14 Q. I'm going to show you what's been previously marked 15 for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and 16 ask you to take a look at those, please? 17 A. (Witness complies) Yes, ma'am. 18 Q. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict what 19 they purport to depict? 5 Q. Where did you observe where was this injury of the dependant? 6 Defendant? 7 A. It was on his right forefinger. 8 Q. Were you also asked to bring with you today, 9 Detective, the original Miranda sheet that the Defendant in given to read and sign? 11 A. Yes, ma'am. 12 Q. I'm showing you what's been marked for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and in the dependant in the exact same rights that you have the purport to depict? 8 Q. Were you also asked to bring with you today, 9 Detective, the original Miranda sheet that the Defendant in the purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify in the purposes as State's Exhibits No. 130. Can you identify in the purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and in the purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and in the purposes as State's Exhibits that you have the purpose of his rights that you have the purp	
6 Q. Let me ask you this, Detective. Do you recall what 7 Mr. Crutsinger was wearing as far as his shirt at the time that 8 you interviewed him? 9 A. Yes, ma'am. 10 Q. What was he wearing? 11 A. He was wearing a white Joe's Crab Shack t-shirt. 12 Q. What condition did it appear to be in? 13 A. It looked brand new to me. 14 Q. I'm going to show you what's been previously marked 15 for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and 16 ask you to take a look at those, please? 17 A. (Witness complies) Yes, ma'am. 18 Q. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict what 19 they purport to depict? 6 Defendant? 7 A. It was on his right forefinger. 8 Q. Were you also asked to bring with you today, 9 Detective, the original Miranda sheet that the Defendant 10 given to read and sign? 11 A. Yes, ma'am. 12 Q. I'm showing you what's been marked for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and 15 used to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular to the jury? 16 Q. Does that contain the exact same rights that you have they purport to depict? 18 A. Yes, ma'am. 19 they purport to depict? 19 Q. Has the Defendant? 7 A. It was on his right forefinger. 8 Q. Were you also asked to bring with you today, 9 Detective, the original Miranda sheet that the Defendant 10 given to read and sign? 11 A. Yes, ma'am. 12 Q. I'm showing you what's been marked for identification purposes as State's Exhibits No. 130. Can you identify 14 A. Yes. That's the original Miranda warning sheet to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular to accurately depict what 17 previously read or explained to the jury? 18 A. Yes, ma'am. 19 Q. Has the Defendant?	
7 Mr. Crutsinger was wearing as far as his shirt at the time that 8 you interviewed him? 9 A. Yes, ma'am. 10 Q. What was he wearing? 11 A. He was wearing a white Joe's Crab Shack t-shirt. 12 Q. What condition did it appear to be in? 13 A. It looked brand new to me. 14 Q. I'm going to show you what's been previously marked 15 for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and 16 ask you to take a look at those, please? 17 A. It was on his right forefinger. 8 Q. Were you also asked to bring with you today, 9 Detective, the original Miranda sheet that the Defendant 10 given to read and sign? 11 A. Yes, ma'am. 12 Q. I'm showing you what's been marked for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and 15 used to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular to the jury? 16 Q. Does that contain the exact same rights that you hat you hat's been previously read or explained to the jury? 18 A. Yes, ma'am. 19 they purport to depict? 19 Q. Has the Defendant signed State's No. 130?	n the
7 Mr. Crutsinger was wearing as far as his shirt at the time that 8 you interviewed him? 9 A. Yes, ma'am. 10 Q. What was he wearing? 11 A. He was wearing a white Joe's Crab Shack t-shirt. 12 Q. What condition did it appear to be in? 13 A. It looked brand new to me. 14 Q. I'm going to show you what's been previously marked 15 for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and 16 ask you to take a look at those, please? 17 A. (Witness complies) Yes, ma'am. 18 Q. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict what 19 they purport to depict? 7 A. It was on his right forefinger. 8 Q. Were you also asked to bring with you today, 9 Detective, the original Miranda sheet that the Defendant 10 given to read and sign? 11 A. Yes, ma'am. 12 Q. I'm showing you what's been marked for identific 13 purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify 14 A. Yes. That's the original Miranda warning sheet to 15 used to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular 15 used to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that you hat 17 previously read or explained to the jury? 18 A. Yes, ma'am. 19 they purport to depict? 19 Q. Has the Defendant signed State's No. 130?	
9 A. Yes, ma'am. 10 Q. What was he wearing? 11 A. He was wearing a white Joe's Crab Shack t-shirt. 12 Q. What condition did it appear to be in? 13 A. It looked brand new to me. 14 Q. I'm going to show you what's been previously marked 15 for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and 16 ask you to take a look at those, please? 17 A. (Witness complies) Yes, ma'am. 18 Q. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict what 19 they purport to depict? 9 Detective, the original Miranda sheet that the Defendant in given to read and sign? 11 A. Yes, ma'am. 12 Q. I'm showing you what's been marked for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify a last to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular in the exact same rights that you have to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights have the previously read or explained to the jury?	
Q. What was he wearing? A. He was wearing a white Joe's Crab Shack t-shirt. Q. What condition did it appear to be in? A. It looked brand new to me. Q. I'm going to show you what's been previously marked for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and A. (Witness complies) Yes, ma'am. Q. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict what the purport to depict? 10 given to read and sign? A. Yes, ma'am. 12 Q. I'm showing you what's been marked for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify and used to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular to ask you to take a look at those, please? A. (Witness complies) Yes, ma'am. 12 Q. I'm showing you what's been marked for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify and used to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular to accurately depict what the previously read or explained to the jury? 13 A. Yes, ma'am. 14 A. Yes, ma'am. 15 Used to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular to accurately depict what the previously read or explained to the jury? 16 A. Yes, ma'am. 17 previously read or explained to the jury? 18 A. Yes, ma'am.	
Q. What was he wearing? A. He was wearing a white Joe's Crab Shack t-shirt. Q. What condition did it appear to be in? A. It looked brand new to me. Q. I'm going to show you what's been previously marked for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and A. (Witness complies) Yes, ma'am. Q. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict what the purport to depict? 10 given to read and sign? A. Yes, ma'am. 12 Q. I'm showing you what's been marked for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify and used to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular to ask you to take a look at those, please? A. (Witness complies) Yes, ma'am. 12 Q. I'm showing you what's been marked for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify and used to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular to accurately depict what the previously read or explained to the jury? 13 A. Yes, ma'am. 14 A. Yes, ma'am. 15 Used to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular to accurately depict what the previously read or explained to the jury? 16 A. Yes, ma'am. 17 previously read or explained to the jury? 18 A. Yes, ma'am.	was
A. He was wearing a white Joe's Crab Shack t-shirt. Q. What condition did it appear to be in? A. It looked brand new to me. Q. I'm going to show you what's been previously marked G. I'm going to show you what's been previously marked G. I'm going to show you what's been previously marked G. I'm going to show you what's been previously marked A. Yes. That's the original Miranda warning sheet to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular to ask you to take a look at those, please? A. (Witness complies) Yes, ma'am. Q. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict what He was wearing a white Joe's Crab Shack t-shirt. A. Yes, ma'am. D. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict what He was wearing a white Joe's Crab Shack t-shirt. A. Yes, ma'am. D. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict what He was wearing a white Joe's Crab Shack t-shirt. A. Yes, ma'am. D. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict what He was wearing a white Joe's Crab Shack t-shirt. D. Urm showing you what's been marked for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify A. Yes. That's the original Miranda warning sheet to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular to accurate the previously read or explained to the jury? R. Yes, ma'am. D. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict what He was wearing a white Joe's Crab Shack to accurate the purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify A. Yes. That's the original Miranda warning sheet to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular to accurate the purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify A. Yes, ma'am. D. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict what D. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict what D. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict what D. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict what D. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict what D. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict what D. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict w	
Q. What condition did it appear to be in? A. It looked brand new to me. Q. I'm going to show you what's been previously marked for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify for identification	
A. It looked brand new to me. 13 purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify 14 Q. I'm going to show you what's been previously marked 15 for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and 16 ask you to take a look at those, please? 17 A. (Witness complies) Yes, ma'am. 18 Q. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict what 19 they purport to depict? 13 purposes as State's Exhibit No. 130. Can you identify 14 A. Yes. That's the original Miranda warning sheet to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular to general to the jury? 16 Q. Does that contain the exact same rights that you have a previously read or explained to the jury? 18 A. Yes, ma'am. 19 they purport to depict? 19 Q. Has the Defendant signed State's No. 130?	cation
Q. I'm going to show you what's been previously marked for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and for ask you to take a look at those, please? A. (Witness complies) Yes, ma'am. Q. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict what for they purport to depict? A. Yes. That's the original Miranda warning sheet to the jury that particular to used to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights	
15 for identification purposes as State's Exhibits 102 and 104 and 16 ask you to take a look at those, please? 17 A. (Witness complies) Yes, ma'am. 18 Q. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict what 19 they purport to depict? 18 Used to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular for the purport to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular for the purport to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular for the purport to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular for the purport to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular for the purport to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular for the purport to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular for the purport to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular for the purport to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular for the purport to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular for the purport to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular for the purport to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular for the purport for the purport to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular for the purport for the purport to advise Mr. Crutsinger of his rights that particular for the purport for the pu	
16 ask you to take a look at those, please? 17 A. (Witness complies) Yes, ma'am. 18 Q. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict what 19 they purport to depict? 10 Q. Does that contain the exact same rights that you have the purport of t	
17 A. (Witness complies) Yes, ma'am. 18 Q. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict what 19 they purport to depict? 17 previously read or explained to the jury? 18 A. Yes, ma'am. 19 Q. Has the Defendant signed State's No. 130?	-
18 Q. Do those exhibits fairly and accurately depict what 19 they purport to depict? 18 A. Yes, ma'am. 19 Q. Has the Defendant signed State's No. 130?	avc
19 they purport to depict? 19 Q. Has the Defendant signed State's No. 130?	
100 A \$7:	
20 A. Yes, ma'am.	
21 MS. HARTMANN: Your Honor, at this time the State 21 Q. Is it dated?	
22 would offer State's 102 and 104.	
23 MR. MOORE: No objection. 23 Q. Is there a time?	
24 THE COURT: 102 and 104 are admitted. 24 A. Yes.	
25 (State's Exhibit No. 102 and 104 received) 25 Q. What time?	
Page 110	112
1 Q. And do these fairly and accurately depict the way Mr. 1 A. 13:14 hours, which would 1:14 p.m.	
2 Crutsinger appeared at the time that you interviewed him? 2 Q. On what date?	ļ
3 A. Yes, ma'am. 3 A. April 9, 2003.	
4 MS. HARTMANN: Permission to publish to the jury? 4 Q. All right. And is your signature also on State's	
5 THE COURT: You may. 5 Exhibit 130?	
6 Q. While you were with Mr. Crutsinger, did you also look 6 A. Yes, ma'am.	
7 to see if he had any injuries? 7 Q. Have there been any alterations, changes or deleti-	ns
8 A. Yes. 8 other than the State's Exhibit sticker?	
9 Q. Did you notice any type of injury on Mr. Crutsinger? 9 A. No, ma'am.	
10 A. Yes, ma'am. 10 Ms. HARTMANN: State would offer State's Ext	ibit
11 Q. What type of injury did you notice? 11 130.	
12 A. He had a laceration to his right forefinger. 12 MR. MOORE: No objection.	İ
13 Q. And was a photograph taken of that? 13 THE COURT: 130 is admitted.	
14 A. Yes, ma'am. 14 (State's Exhibit No. 130 received)	
15 Q. By you? 15 Q. Were you also asked to bring the tape recording of	tha
	unc
1	
17 100, 111 111	1
purposes as State's Exhibit No. 103. Do you recognize that? 18 Q. Could you get that out, please? 19 A. Yes, ma'am. 19 A. (Witness complies)	
Q. Does it fairly and accurately depict what it purports Q. I'm showing you what's been marked for identified	auon
21 to depict? 21 purposes as State's 131, ask if you recognize that.	
22 A. Yes, I do.	- 1
MS. HARTMANN: The State would offer State's 23 Q. How do you recognize it?	, 1
24 Exhibit 103. 24 A. That's the original tape that I recorded the statement of the statem	nt
25 MR. MOORE: No objection. 25 from Mr. Crutsinger on that day.	l

Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Galers 17 Page 33 of 64 PageID 4669 Page 113 Page 115 Q. Have you had an opportunity prior to coming into court MS. HARTMANN: Your Honor, at this time we offer 1 2 today to listen to that tape? 2 State's 101. A. Yes, ma'am. MR. RAY: No objection. 3 Q. After listening to it, does it fairly and accurately 4 THE COURT: 101 is admitted. 5 depict the conversation that you recorded between yourself, the 5 (State's Exhibit No. 101 received) 6 Defendant, Mr. Crutsinger, and Detective Hardy back on April 9 MS. HARTMANN: May I publish? 6 7 of 2003 there in Galveston? THE COURT: You may. A. Yes, ma'am. O. Does State's 101 show the answering machine? 8 Q. Have there been any alterations, changes, additions or 9 A. Yes, ma'am. 10 deletions made to that exhibit? O. And is there a little No. 9 in the window? 10 11 A. No. ma'am. 11 A. I believe so. 12 12 Q. Okay. I will walk it over to you in just a second. MS. HARTMANN: At the time the State would offer 13 State's Exhibit 131. Is there a window that indicates how many 13 14 14 messages were waiting on that machine? MR. MOORE: Judge, we would object to State's 15 Exhibit 131 based on the prior proceeding that was had in this 15 A. I believe so, yes. Q. And this is the answering machine you testified to 16 court. 16 17 THE COURT: overruled, 131 is admitted. 17 that was in Pat Syren and Pearl R.D. Magouirk's house? 18 18 (State's Exhibit No. 131 received) A. Yes, ma'am. 19 Q. And that you listened to? MR. RAY: Judge, may we have a running objection 19 20 so we don't have to --20 A. Yes, ma'am. 21 THE COURT: You may. 21 O. Is there a 9? 22 22 A. Yes, there is. MS. HARTMANN: Permission to publish? 23 23 Q. All right. Okay. I think before we broke for lunch, THE COURT: You may. 24 24 we had published the Defendant's orally recorded statement to Q. Detective, while we are getting the boom-box set up 25 here to put the tape in, let me ask you this. Can you identify 25 you down in Galveston. Page 114 Page 116 1 all the voices that appear on State's 131? 1 A. Yes, ma'am. A. Yes, ma'am. 2 Q. In that statement does the Defendant admit to killing Q. Were your batteries old in the tape-recording device? 3 Patricia Syren? A. Well, I don't know that they were old, but it recorded 4 A. Yes, ma'am. 5 a little bit fast for some reason. It may be because they were 5 Q. Does he admit to killing Pearl R.D. Magouirk? 6 a little bit low. 6 A. Yes, ma'am. (Tape played to the jury) 7 Q. Does he admit to doing that by cutting their throat THE COURT: Ladies and gentlemen of the jury, we 8 and stabbing them? 9 are going to break for the lunch hour until 1:30. Please 9 A. Yes, ma'am. 10 remember and follow your instructions, and the bailiffs will 10 Q. Does he admit to using Patricia Syren's credit card? 11 meet you as usual. Have a good lunch. 11 12 (Lunch recess taken) 12 Q. And taking money out of her purse? 13 (Recess for lunch) 13 A. Yes, ma'am. 14 (Afternoon Session:) 14 Q. As well as taking the purse itself? 15 (Jury present) 15 A. That's correct. 16 THE COURT: You may proceed. 16 O. Does he admit to purchasing a pair of shoes up here in 17 MS. HARTMANN: May I approach the witness? 17 Fort Worth --18 THE COURT: Yes. 18 MR. MOORE: Your Honor, I am going to have to 19 Q. Let me show you what's been marked for identification 19 object not only to the leading nature of the questions, but the 20 purposes as State's Exhibit 101 and ask you if you recognize 20 tape is in evidence itself, and it is not relevant to go over it 21 that. 21 with this detective. 22 A. Yes, ma'am, I do. 22 THE COURT: Overruled. Q. Does State's 101 fairly and accurately depict what it 23 MR. RAY: Plus, Your Honor, it is his editorial 24 purports to depict? 24 comment about what was meant. The statement speaks for itself. A. Yes, ma'am. 25 THE COURT: Overruled.

MR. RAY: Thank you. 1 at a Mexican bar --Q. Did he admit to you that he used Patricia Syren's 2 A. Yes, ma'am. 3 credit card to purchase things here in Fort Worth? O. -- on Main Street? A. Yes, ma'am, A. Yes, ma'am. Q. Were you able follow up on this information here in Q. At some point during the interview, did Detective 6 Fort Worth? 6 Hardy step out and give Mr. Crutsinger a glass of water? A. Yes. Q. As a result, did you meet with a young lady by the O. Was that at the Defendant's request? Did he ask for 9 name of Loretta Angram? 9 water? A. Yes, I did. 10 A. Yes, ma'am. Q. Where did Loretta Angram work or did she work back at Q. Did you at several points in your conversation with 11 12 that time? 12 Mr. Crutsinger give him an opportunity to give you any 13 additional information that he wanted to? A. At the time I believe she was working at the Factory 14 Brand Shoes located in Tandy Outlet Mall just basically right 14 A. Yes. 15 across the street from this building. 15 Q. Did you offer him an opportunity to add anything he 16 wanted to before you stopped the tape? Q. And you went and visited with her? A. Yes. 17 A. Yes, ma'am. MS. HARTMANN: May I approach the witness? 18 Q. And were we able to hear on that tape or is it present 19 on that tape that you notified the Defendant he was being tape THE COURT: Yes. Q. Did I ask you the bring some items with you here today 20 recorded? 21 to court? 21 A. Yes. A. Yes, ma'am. 22 O. In fact, was there a discussion about having to turn Q. Can you pull out that envelope that you had with you 23 the tape off and make sure it was working correctly before you 24 earlier? 24 proceeded. 25 A. (Witness complies) A. Yes, ma'am. Page 120 Page 118 O. You told this jury earlier that the Defendant was Q. I am showing you what's been marked for identification 2 willing to speak with you. Did that demeanor continue 2 purposes as State's Exhibit 132. Do you recognize it? 3 throughout the duration of your conversations with him? A. Yes, I do. Q. Is State's Exhibit No. 132 an item that you collected A. Yes, ma'am, it did. 5 after visiting with Loretta Angram at the Factory Brand Shoe Q. Did he periodically thank you during the course of 6 Store in Fort Worth Outlet Square? 6 your conversation with him for the water and giving him the A. Yes. 7 opportunity to add anything he wanted to? Q. Did the Defendant admit to you that he had used 8 A. Yes. 9 Patricia Syren's credit card to rent a motel down in Galveston? O. Did you also ask or request of Mr. Crutsinger's 10 consent to take some buccal swabs? A. Yes, ma'am. A. Yes, I did. Q. Did the Defendant admit he'd used Patricia Syren's 11 12 credit card to purchase a Joe's Crab Shack T-shirt? 12 Q. And buccal is b-u-c-c-a-l? A. Yes, ma'am, I believe so. 13 A. I believe that's how it spelled. Q. Was he, in fact, wearing a Joe's Crab Shack T-shirt? Q. Did that refer to epithelial cells on the inside of 14 A. Yes. 15 the cheek portion of the mouth? Q. And he was able to tell you that he had taken A. Yes, ma'am, it does. 16 17 Patricia's Syren's Cadillac vehicle? 17 Q. When you ask for a person's consent to take an item A. Yes, ma'am. 18 like that, do you document that consent in a written form? Q. Was he able to tell you where he had disposed of the 19 A. Yes, ma'am. 20 keys to that Cadillac? 20 Q. Did you do so with Mr. Crutsinger? A. Yes. 21 A. Yes, ma'am. Q. Were you able to notify some police officers up here 22 Q. What was the purpose in asking Mr. Crutsinger if he 23 in Fort Worth about places to search for those keys? 23 would be willing to give you a sample of, in essence, his DNA?

24

1

2

11

13

16

17

18

19

20

22

23

25

3

8

10

11

13

14

15

16

18

19

21

22

24

25

A. Yes, I was.

Q. Did he tell you he had left the vehicle, the Cadillac,

A. Because I was of the belief that the person

25 responsible for this offense had been injured and bled on the

Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 GandensoH3/17 Page 35 of 64 PageID 4671 Page 123 Page 121 1 scene, the reason for doing that was so that qualified persons 1 person to make such intrusion and to withdraw a sufficient 2 quantity of my buccal cheek cells and/or blood and/or hair with 2 could make a DNA comparison, and they would be able to tell us 3 with a pretty great amount of certainty if that person had 3 which to perform any necessary analysis. 4 actually contributed the blood that was on the scene. I give my written permission for a buccal cheek 5 swab test and/or blood and/or hair test to the above officer Q. And you previously testified to the jury that you 6 noticed a fresh injury on Mr. Crutsinger? 6 voluntarily and without any threats or promises of any kind. At A. Yes, ma'am. 7 13:30 hours on 4-9 of '03 at Galveston Police Department, 8 Q. Or what, appeared to be a fresh injury? 8 Galveston, Texas. 9 Q. All right. And the document mentioned permission for A. Yes, ma'am. 10 Q. I am showing you what's been marked for identification 10 intrusive procedures. When we are talking about collecting 11 purposes as State's Exhibit No. 133. Do you recognize that? 11 buccal swabs, are we talking about any type of drawing of blood? 12 A. Yes, I do. 12 A. No. 13 Q. Have there been any alterations, changes or deletions 13 O. What are we talking about? 14 made to that document other than the placing of the State's A. Basically to collect those, it's a long Q-Tip probably 15 exhibit sticker in the corner? 15 about six inches long. And the subject of the test actually --16 A. No, ma'am. 16 we prefer they actually swab the inside of their own cheek. 17 17 Q. Is this the original consent form that you used with So in this particular case, as in every case 18 Mr. Crutsinger back on April 9 of this year? 18 where I have ever collected these type of samples, we just hand 19 A. Yes, that is the original. 19 the swab to the individual and they swab the inside of each 20 20 cheek about 12 to 15 times. MS. HARTMANN: The State would offer State's 133. 21 21 MR. MOORE: No objection. And then a second swab is provided, and they'll 22 MR. RAY: Well, excuse me, Judge. We make the 22 swab the inside of the other check about 12 to 15 times. 23 same objection that we made outside the presence of the jury. 23 O. All right. And is that, in fact, the way it took 24 THE COURT: Noted and overruled. 24 place with Mr. Crutsinger? 25 MR. RAY: Thank you. Can we have a running A. Yes, ma'am. Page 124 Page 122 1 objection? Q. Did you wear anything to prevent any of your skin THE COURT: You may. 2 cells from getting onto the Q-Tip or the swabs? 3 A. Yes, ma'am. I just wore Latex gloves. (State's Exhibit No. 133 received) Q. Did the Defendant sign State's Exhibit No. 133? O. Did Mr. Crutsinger, in fact, swab the insides of his A. Yes, ma'am. 5 cheeks with two swabs? Q. Who else signed on State's 133? 6 A. Yes, ma'am. A. Detective Hardy. Q. What did you do with them at that point? Q. And does it show you as the person doing the A. At that point I had Mr. Crutsinger place the swab 9 itself into an envelope that I held open, and then he repeated 9 collecting? 10 A. That's correct. 10 the procedure with the other swab and placed that swab back into Q. And did you read State's 133 to Mr. Crutsinger, or did 11 the envelope, and then they are allowed to air dry for about a 12 you give it to him to read to himself? 12 half hour, and then they are sealed up. A. I gave to it him and asked him to read it to himself O. Where do these swabs come from? Did you stick your 14 and asked him if he understood it. 14 head out the door and say does anyone have any Q-Tips or --15 Q. Did he indicate he did? 15 A. We typically carry three or four of these kits in the 16 A. Yes, ma'am. 16 vehicles with us. Q. Could you publish the top paragraph of State's 133 by 17 Q. When you talk about the kits, are these -- describe 18 orally reading that? 18 how these swabs are packaged prior to your presenting them to

20

19 someone to start swabbing their cheek?

A. Actually the whole kit is in an envelope which

22 then the swabs themselves are sealed in a paper-type envelope

23 that is sealed up. We have to break that seal and then allow

Q. Is that what was done with Mr. Crutsinger?

24 the subject of the test to take the swab out themselves.

21 contains the permission form, instructions for us to do; and

19

20

A. Yes, ma'am.

"I, Billy J. Crutsinger, having been informed by

21 Detective J.T. McCaskill of my Constitutional right not to have

22 an intrusion made into my body for the purpose of conducting a

23 buccal (cheek) swab test, blood test, or hair comparison,

24 knowing my lawful right to refuse to consent to such an

25 intrusion, I willingly give my permission to any qualified

Page 121 - Page 124

Page 36 of 64 Page 127 1 A. Yes, ma'am. Q. Is it required by law enforcement and the scientific 2 community that anytime a bag or envelope with evidence is 2 Q. So you have a sterile kit that you then open, and the 3 opened, when it is resealed, there has to be some type of 3 person who is taking the swab -- or the person that's providing 4 the sample takes the swab out themselves, swabs their mouth and 4 notation at the point of sealing? 5 puts them back in the envelope. A. That's the standard that I've been taught. I'm 6 assuming that is required or we wouldn't be doing it. A. That's correct. MS. HARTMANN: The State would offer State's 7 Q. And you were wearing Latex gloves? 8 A. Yes, ma'am, I was. 8 Exhibit 134. 9 MR. RAY: Can I see it? Can we have just a MS. HARTMANN: May I approach the witness? 10 second? 10 THE COURT: Yes. 11 Q. Did you bring with you today the envelope in which the 11 THE COURT: Yes. 12 swabs from April 9 of 2003 were packaged? MR. RAY: Subject to them being able to tie it 12 13 A. Yes, I did. 13 up, we don't have any objection. 14 14 THE COURT: 134 is conditionally admitted. Q. Could you hand that to me, please? 15 15 (State's Exhibit No. 134 conditionally received) (Pause in the proceedings) 16 MR. MOORE: Well, for the record, we would also Q. I'm going to show you what's been marked for 16 17 identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 134. Do you 17 object to the admission of that based on the prior ruling of the 18 recognize it? 18 Court at the prior hearing. 19 19 A. Yes, I do. THE COURT: Overruled. 20 20 MR. RAY: May we have a running objection to that Q. How do you recognize State's 134? 21 21 also? A. That is the original cheek-swab kit that was used on 22 that day, on April 9. 22 THE COURT: You may. 23 Q. All right. 23 Q. Did the Defendant also admit to you during his 24 statement that he had taken a bus --A. Or the envelope that it was packaged in. 24 25 25 A. Yes. Q. So that envelope was down with you in Galveston, and Page 128 Page 126 1 that's where the buccal swabs were placed? 1 Q. -- down to Galveston 2 A. That's correct. 2 And that prior to leaving for Galveston, he had 3 Q. Once the swabs were dried, did you seal it up? 3 stayed at the Cowboy Motel? 4 A. Yes. A. Yes, the Cowboy Inn or Cowboy Motel. I'm not sure. 5 Q. How did you seal it? 5 Q. Did he also tell you that the clothes that he had been 6 A. I sealed it with tape and put my initials over the 6 wearing at the time of killing Patricia Syren and Pearl 7 seal and my ID number. 7 Magouirk, those clothes had been disposed of in a dumpster at 8 Q. Your initials would be? 8 the Cowboy Inn? 9 A. JTM 1895 is my ID number. A. Yes. 10 Q. Are you -- let me ask you this. When you sealed it 10 Q. Did you relay that information up here to Fort Worth 11 up, what did you do with it at that point? 11 to officers up here? 12 A. I kept it in my possession until it was submitted into 12 A. Yes. 13 evidence at the Fort Worth Police property room. 13 Q. Were you all ever able to -- strike that. 14 Q. All right. And are you familiar as a homicide 14 At some point did you return back here to Fort 15 investigator -- in working with evidence and Tarrant County 15 Worth? 16 Medical Examiner's Office, are you familiar with the tape they 16 A. Yes, ma'am. 17 use when they retrieve evidence for testing purposes and then Q. Did you also have a chance to visit the Razoo 18 seal it back up? 18 Restaurant located here in downtown Fort Worth? 19 A. Yes, ma'am. 19 A. Yes, I did. 20 Q. Do you recognize any such tape on State's 134? 20 Q. Did you meet with a young woman by the name of Denise 21 A. Yes, I do. 21 Schrader? 22 Q. Other than the tape from the Tarrant County Medical 22 A. Yes, I did. 23 Examiner's Office, does it appear in any way that the envelope 23 Q. And was that meeting pursuant to your investigation of 24 has been tampered with or opened by anyone else? 24 this homicide case? 25 A. No, ma'am. 25 A. Yes, it was.

Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 8-CondenseIt 103/17 Page 37 Page 129 Page 131 1 MS. HARTMANN: May I approach the witness? THE COURT: Yes. 2 THE COURT: Yes. 2 O. I'm showing you what's been marked for identification Q. All right. I'm showing you what's been marked for 3 purposes as State's Exhibit No. 136. Do you recognize that? 4 identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 135. Do you A. Yes, I do. 5 recognize that? O. Is that the packaging from the second set of buccal A. Yes, I do. 6 swabs that you took from the Defendant, Billy Jack Crutsinger? Q. Is that an item that you retrieved from that Razoo's 7 A. Yes, ma'am. 8 here in downtown Fort Worth? Q. Does it as well show your initials and ID? A. Yes, it is. A. Yes. 10 Q. After having a conversation with Denise Schrader and 10 Q. And was that -- when were your initials and 11 the management there at Razoo's? 11 identification number put on that exhibit? 12 A. Yes, ma'am. 12 A. When they were sealed at the Medical Examiner's office 13 Q. All right. Now, directing your attention to the date 13 that morning. 14 of August 26 of this year. 14 Q. All right. And does State's Exhibit No. 136 also show 15 A. Yes, ma'am. 15 signs that the Tarrant County Medical Examiner has opened and 16 Q. Are you with me? 16 then resealed that item? 17 A. Yes, ma'am, I am. 17 A. Yes. 18 Q. Did you execute a search warrant to obtain additional 18 MS. HARTMANN: Your Honor, at this time we'd 19 DNA from the Defendant, Billy Jack Crutsinger? 19 offer State's 136. 20 A. Yes, ma'am. 20 MR. RAY: Same objection -- well, actually it's a 21 Q. And did you, in fact, execute that search warrant? 21 different objection, different hearing; but we object to it on 22 A. Yes, I did. 22 that basis. 23 Q. Did you take additional buccal swab samples from the 23 THE COURT: Overruled. 136 is admitted. 24 Defendant on that date? 24 (State's Exhibit No. 136 received) A. Yes, ma'am. 25 MR. RAY: Can we have a running objection? Page 132 Page 130 Q. Was the procedure that you have already described to 1 THE COURT: You may. 2 the jury that was done down in Galveston, was that same 2 MS. HARTMANN: Can I have just a moment, Your 3 procedure done here in Fort Worth? 3 Honor? A. Yes, it was. THE COURT: Yes. Q. And once you took the buccal swabs from the Defendant, 5 (Pause in the proceedings) 6 did you package them up in the same manner as you previously 6 MS. HARTMANN: May I approach the witness? 7 described? 7 THE COURT: Yes. 8 A. Yes, I did. 8 Q. Detective I'm going to show you what's already been Q. Did you seal those items up in an envelope? admitted into evidence as State's Exhibit No. 9 and ask you to 10 A. Yes, I did. 10 take a look at that, please. 11 Q. What did you do once you had sealed those additional 11 A. Yes, ma'am. 12 buccal swabs? 12 Q. That's an aerial photograph, is it not? 13 A. I drove them directly to the Medical Examiner's Office 13 A. That's correct. 14 that same morning. 14 Q. Are you able to locate on State's 9 the location of 15 Q. And turned them over to personnel there? 15 Pat and R.D.'s house? 16 16 A. I don't know that I can point the exact house out to 17 Q. Do you know specifically who it was you turned them 17 you, but it is in this area right in here. 18 over to? Was it one of the evidence custodians? 18 Q. And are you able to see in State's 9 Interstate 30? 19 A. I believe so, yes. 19 20 Q. Was it sealed? 20 Q. Are you able to see the Beach Street area? 21 A. It was actually sealed there at the ME's office. 21 A. Yes, ma'am. 22 Q. Did you bring that original packaging with you here 22 Q. Can you -- why don't you show me first --23 today? 23 A. This is Interstate 30 and this is Beach Street running 24 A. Yes, I did. 24 north and south. 25 MS. HARTMANN: May I approach the witness? Q. Okay. So is this 30?

Page 38 of 64 A. Yes, ma'am. 1 be assigned, yes. Q. And then you said Beach Street is this street here? O. All right. And you responded over here to the scene A. Yes, ma'am. 3 of this offense about 4:40 p.m. on April 8 of this year, Q. Running this way? 4 correct? A. Yes, ma'am. 5 A. Yes, sir. Q. Okay. Beach Street and I-30, is that within walking Q. Already some officers there, had the crime scene 7 distance of 2716 Scott Avenue? secured, correct? A. Yes, ma'am. A. Yes, sir. Q. And they do what is typical. They start canvassing MS. HARTMANN: We pass the witness at this time, 10 Your Honor: 10 the neighborhood to see if anybody was a witness to anything, 11 correct? **CROSS-EXAMINATION** A. Yes, sir. 12 BY MR. MOORE: 12 Q. Detective McCaskill, you are what they call the lead 13 Q. That's normal police procedure, isn't it? 14 detective on this case, correct? 14 A. Yes, sir. A. Yes, sir. 15 Q. You look around the house to see if maybe the 16 perpetrator is still there, correct? Q. You have been with the Fort Worth Police Department 17 for 21 years and 17 years of that as a detective, correct? 17 A. Yes, sir. A. Yes, sir. 18 Q. And no one was in this house, correct? Q. And the way that offenses usually are -- kind of play 19 A. That's correct. 20 out is that somebody discovers that an offense has been Q. Canvass the neighborhood and -- did you talk to Robert 20 21 committed, correct? 21 Greer? A. Yes, sir, that's correct. 22 A. Yes, sir. Q. And they call 911 and the police -- patrol officers Q. And did he give you a description of somebody he may 23 24 are sent out to the scene, correct? 24 have seen over at that house? A. Yes, sir, that's correct. A. Actually I briefly spoke with him at the -- out there 25 Page 134 Page 136 Q. And they assess the situation and they talk to 1 at the scene, and he went to our offices downtown and Detective 2 witnesses and protect the crime scene; and then if it is serious 2 Hardy, I think, actually interviewed and took a statement from 3 enough, they call in someone like you, correct? 3 him. A. Yes, sir. 4 Q. Did you ever read that statement that he gave? Q. Because you have had a lot more experience in dealing A. Yes, sir. with these kind of things than a patrol officer. Q. When did you read that? A. Not always, but typically more than likely. A. It was shortly after this occurred. It would have Q. Well, 90 percent of the time. 8 been back in April. A. Yes, sir. Q. After you got back from Galveston? Q. Like some of these officers that responded to this 10 A. Yes, sir. And I may have scanned it briefly before we 11 scene were less than two years on the police force, correct? 11 left. A. That would probably be correct. 12 Q. Okay. But needless to say, you weren't there at the Q. And you are kind of responsible for overseeing the 13 house when the credit card company called, correct? 14 A. No, sir. A. Once I arrive on the scene, it becomes my 15 Q. Who was at the house?

1

2

11

13

15

16

18

19

22

23

25

- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10
- 12
- 13
- 14 entire investigation?
- 15
- 16 responsibility at that point.
- 17 Q. How is that assigned with the Fort Worth Police
- 18 Department. Were you just at home that night or --
- A. I was on my way home. I was on call. We typically
- 20 rotate a callback responsibility, and it's usually one night a
- 21 week and about every tenth weekend. And that Tuesday night was
- 22 my night on call.
- 23 Q. Okay. So whatever happens that Tuesday night is your
- 24 baby.
- 25 A. Yes, sir, if it falls within what we are supposed to

- 16 A. That was -- the message was left on the answering
- 17 machine.
- 18 Q. Okay.
- 19 A. I don't know exactly when the call came in. The call
- 20 did not come in while we were there.
- 21 Q. Do you have any idea when the call came in?
- 22 A. No, sir, I don't.
- 23 Q. When were you made aware of that call?
- A. I was made aware of the call when I listened to the
- 25 messages on the answering machine, which is on the evening of

Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Cendense 1.53/17 Page 39 of 64 PageID 4675

Page 137

1 the 8th.

- 2 Q. Okay. And I guess that's -- you got a picture of that
- 3 answering machine in evidence. Was it blinking?
- A. It wasn't blinking when I saw it. The photograph --
- 5 in all likelihood, after I listened to the messages, the light
- 6 quit blinking when I listened to messages.
- 7 Q. Safe to say you were the first person to listen to
- 8 those messages?
- 9 A. Yes, as far as I know, I was.
- 10 Q. Because it would quit blinking after that, wouldn't
- 11 it?
- 12 A. Yes, sir.
- 13 Q. So you knew on April 8 that the lady's credit card was
- 14 being used in Galveston, Texas?
- 15 A. Yes, sir.
- 16 Q. And up until that point in time, you didn't have one
- 17 single lead on who committed this offense, did you?
- 18 A. No, sir, I did not.
- 19 Q. Didn't have anyone who was able or could give you a
- 20 description, did you?
- 21 A. No.
- 22 Q. But actually, you did know at that point in time where
- 23 the vehicle was recovered, correct?
- A. I found out while I was there on the scene that it was
- 25 recovered on North Main, yes.

Page 138

- Q. Okay. And so on the morning of April 9, you head down
- 2 to Galveston, correct?
- 3 A. Yes, sir.
- 4 Q. At that point in time, where did you know that credit
- 5 card had been used?
- A. When I actually left for Galveston, I was only aware
- 7 at that time that it had been used at a liquor store and a hotel
- 8 in Galveston. I didn't become aware until later that it had
- 9 been used several times in Fort Worth.
- 10 Q. So when you headed to Galveston, you were not aware of
- 11 Razoo's or the Factory Shoe Outlet, that the credit card had
- 12 been used there?
- 13 A. That's correct.
- 14 Q. Just the liquor store and the motel in Galveston.
- 15 A. Yes, sir.
- 16 Q. And you called the Galveston Police Department
- 17 yourself?
- 18 A. Yes. I had several phone conversations with them.
- 19 Q. To let them know that there is somebody down there
- 20 using a credit card that came out of a double homicide in Fort
- 21 Worth?
- 22 A. The initial call to Galveston was made by my
- 23 supervisor, Sergeant David Thornton, who stayed back in the
- 24 on-site office while I was on the scene, and he began to
- 25 coordinate a few things with Galveston on the telephone while I

- 1 was still on the scene. I later had some phone conversations
- 2 with Galveston.
- O. But would it be fair to say that the only information
- 4 that was conveyed to the Galveston Police Department at that
- 5 time was just the fact that there was a credit card being used?
- 6 A. I was able to get the name of the motel that was used -
- 7 and -- and that was provided to Galveston.
- 8 Q. But you couldn't provide Galveston -- that Galveston
- 9 Police Department with any kind of a description of the person
- 10 that may be using that credit card?
- 11 A. That's correct.
- 12 O. You didn't know whether it was a male or female or
- 13 black, white or what?
- 14 A. At that point I did not know.
- 15 Q. Okay. So you head down to Galveston about 8:00
- 16 o'clock in the morning on the 9th, and it takes you until about
- 17 12:38 to get there at the Galveston Police Department?
- 18 A. Yes, sir, that would be correct.
 - Q. And by the time you get there at 12:38, the Galveston
- 20 Police Department has already arrested Billy Jack Crutsinger,
- 21 correct?

19

- 22 A. Yes, sir.
- O. Okay. He was at the Galveston Police Department when
- 24 you arrived?
- 25 A. Yes, he was.

Page 140

- Q. And you were in contact with the Galveston Police
- 2 Department on your ride down from Fort Worth to Galveston,
- 3 correct?
- 4 A. Only a couple of times. I called them when we left
- 5 about 8:00 o'clock or shortly afterwards, and I don't recall
- 6 that I had any more contact with them until about 12:20. As we
- 7 were getting into Galveston I was contacted by a lieutenant with
- 8 the Galveston police.
- 9 O. About what time was that?
- 10 A. About 12:20.
- 11 Q. About 12:20?
- 12 A. Yes, sir.
- 13 Q. You were on the outskirts of Galveston. Did he tell
- 14 you he had just arrested a suspect?
- 15 ms. Hartmann: Objection to hearsay.
- 16 THE COURT: sustained.
- 17 Q. Okay. Did -- well, when you got to the Galveston
- 18 Police Department, Mr. Crutsinger was arrested and you went in
- 19 and talked to him, correct?
- 20 A. Yes, sir.
 - Q. And you didn't have any information from any source
- 22 about the circumstances and the facts surrounding his arrest in
- 23 Galveston, did you?
- 24 A. Not immediately, no.
- 25 Q. You weren't involved with his arrest in Galveston,

Page 40 of 64 A. Yes, sir. 1 were you? 1 2 Q. But yet on August 26 of this -- last month, you A. No. sir, I was not. Q. That was all the Galveston Police Department, correct? 3 created a search warrant to get the very same exact swab from Mr. Crutsinger, correct? A. Yes, sir. A. Yes, sir. Q. And there were many officers involved in that arrest. A. There were several that were involved in that whole 6 MR. MOORE: May we approach? 7 investigation. I don't know how many were actually present when 7 (Outside the hearing of the jury) 8 THE COURT: Is this about the matter we talked 8 Mr. Crutsinger was taken into custody. 9 about earlier? Q. Okay. And when you went in to see Mr. Crutsinger, 10 that's the first time you had ever laid eyes on him, wasn't it? 10 MR. MOORE: Yes, sir. A. Yes, sir. 11 (In the hearing of the jury) Q. Did he have a red ball cap on? 12 THE COURT: Ladies and gentlemen of the jury, A. I don't recall seeing any caps or anything. 13 13 there is a matter I have to take up outside your presence. Q. Did he have -- well, let me just ask you this. You 14 Would you please retire to the jury room and remember and follow 15 had learned of a description of a person using that credit card 15 your instructions. 16 in Galveston, hadn't you? 16 (Jury not present) 17 A. I had been given some information over the telephone MR. MOORE: Judge, at this time, we feel that we 18 by one of the Galveston officers that they had gotten from 18 are entitled to inquire of this detective the reason that he 19 somebody. I'm not -- still to this day not certain where that 19 executed a second -- or got another search warrant and collected 20 information came from. 20 the same exact sample that he collected in Galveston that has Q. But that description that was given to you by the 21 been tested and as far as he knows is a valid test and it was a 22 Galveston Police Department did not fit the description of Billy 22 good sample. 23 Jack Crutsinger, did it? 23 The State brought it up. They asked him about 24 it. And to not allow us to go into it would give a false A. There was a subject as being described as quite a bit 25 younger. 25 impression to this jury or make them wonder to the detriment of Page 144 Page 142 1 Q. Didn't fit him, did it? 1 my client. 2 A. No. 2 THE COURT: They never asked why he did it; they Q. And I believe you testified that at 12:38, you are at 3 just asked if he did it. 4 the Galveston Police Department, and what time do you first make MR. RAY: Well, Judge, as the Court is aware, 5 contact with Billy Jack Crutsinger? 5 there is an issue over whether or not the Defendant was legally A. It would have been within five minutes of our arrival. 6 arrested that we hashed out, without going back through all that Q. Okay. And you took the swab from his cheek shortly 7 again. And depending on how the evidence plays out, the Court 8 thereafter? 8 may or may not give a charge on that issue. A. A little bit later, yes. If the jury is given the charge and if the jury Q. And are you trained -- does the Fort Worth Police 10 finds that the arrest was invalid or improper or illegal, 11 Department train you in how to take a sample like that and 11 whatever you want to call it, potentially they would be 12 package it up so it is not contaminated? 12 instructed to not consider any of that evidence, which would A. Yes, sir. 13 include Detective McCaskill's first buccal swab of the Defendant Q. And did you follow the proper procedures on April 9 14 in Galveston.

- 9
- 10

- 13

11

14

21

24

- 14
- 15 when you took that swab?
- 16 A. Yes, sir.
- 17 Q. And that swab was taken to the Tarrant County Medical
- 18 Examiner's Office, correct?
- 19 A. Eventually. It went to our property control or
- 20 property room, and then it was later taken to the Medical
- 21 Examiner's office.
- 22 Q. To your knowledge, was it tested?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. And to your knowledge was that a valid test that was
- 25 done on that?

- 15 Then the jury is going to have to look to the
- 16 second buccal swab to see whether or not they can consider that,
- 17 which is a completely unrelated reason; and it calls into
- 18 question the validity of that swab as far as the search warrant
- 19 issue.
- 20 It is an admission by the State -- just like if
- 21 the Defendant -- he's a party to the lawsuit and they are a
- 22 party to the lawsuit. It's an admission of a party opponent.
- 23 THE COURT: He's not a party opponent.
- 24 MR. RAY: He's not, but they are, and they are
- 25 the ones that gave him the reason, as you'll remember from the

Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 8-Condense 1:03/17 Page 41 of 64 Page D 467 Page 147 Page 145 1 testimony in the Motion to Suppress hearing that we had one day 1 opening statement. 2 last week. Their reason --2 MR. RAY: Okay. 3 THE COURT: So what you are seeking to offer is 3 THE COURT: If there is a factual issue, then 4 not his reason for going into it, but the State's reason for --4 they are entitled to have the jury instructed on that under MR. RAY: That's right. 5 38.23. 6 MR. MOORE: Well, he was instructed by the State MS. HARTMANN: But the jury doesn't determine 6 7 to do it. He wasn't going to do it on his own -probable cause. 8 THE COURT: That's not what you said to start 8 THE COURT: If there's a factual issue as to 9 with. probable cause, then the jury will determine whether or not the 10 MR. RAY: It's what he testified to last week. 10 arrest was illegal and whether or not the seizure of any 11 THE COURT: Okay. 11 evidence from the Defendant was illegal. 12 12 MS. HARTMANN: It is not relevant to any fact MS. HARTMANN: Well, then would we be entitled to 13 issue in this case. I mean, if we go into that, then I am 13 go into the circumstances surrounding the fact that there was a 14 assuming we can go into what the Court's final ruling was. It court ruling that was -- had not yet been handed down? 15 just opens up a whole can of worms. It is allowing inadmissible 15 THE COURT: Yeah, I think you can go into that. 16 hearsay in. It is prejudicial in effect, which is the absolute 16 MS. HARTMANN: All right. 17 intent of the Defense. 17 THE COURT: Anything else? 18 THE COURT: It's not hearsay. 18 MR. RAY: I just want to make sure we understand 19 MS. HARTMANN: Him testifying to a statement that 19 the ruling. Are you going to allow us to ask him why he got the 20 I made? 20 subsequent search warrant? 21 21 THE COURT: Right. THE COURT: I am. 22 MS. HARTMANN: How is that not hearsay? 22 MR. RAY: And then I'm assuming --23 THE COURT: Because you are a party opponent. 23 THE COURT: If the answer is what was proffered 24 MR. MOORE: And if I may, she said there's not 24 to me a minute ago, which is that there was a statement by a 25 a -- it doesn't go to any fact issue. There could be a big fact 25 party opponent is what you are seeking to offer --Page 148 Page 146 1 issue as to whether or not this was an illegal arrest, and then 1 MR. RAY: That's correct. 2 this would definitely go to that. 2 MR. MOORE: Well, just to make it clear, Ms. 3 THE COURT: Well, is it going to be or not? 3 Hartmann asked if she could get into the pending Court ruling. MR. RAY: I believe there is going to be an 4 Are you going to allow them to go into what the Court's ruling 5 issue. We can represent to you I believe there is. was? Which we would object to. MS. HARTMANN: There is an additional issue. THE COURT: The fact of the matter is it was done 6 7 which is they are trying to attack the probable cause of this 7 when there was a pending ruling. The ruling had not been made, warrant. That's already been decided. That's a legal issue. 8 so what the ruling was is not relevant to this inquiry. The THE COURT: Well, it has been decided by me, but 9 ruling hadn't been made at that time. 10 under 38.23 if the arrest was illegal, they have the right to 10 (Jury present) 11 have the jury charged on that, so they have a right to show 11 THE COURT: You may proceed. 12 whether or not the arrest was illegal; and there was no probable 12 MR. MOORE: Thank you. 13 cause for the arrest, then the arrest was illegal. 13 Q. Detective McCaskill, I believe we were talking about 14 MS. HARTMANN: Well, I'm not talking about the 14 the two buccal swabs that you obtained from Mr. Crutsinger 15 arrest; I'm talking about them attacking the warrant itself for 15 before we had a break. Is that your recollection? 16 the DNA. And there has been a legal determination about that --16 A. Yes, it is. 17 THE COURT: There has been a legal determination, 17 Q. And you testified that you got the first swab at the 18 but if there were factual issues raised, then they would be 18 Galveston Police Department on April 9 shortly after his arrest, 19 entitled to have the jury instructed on that. 19 correct? 20 MR. RAY: Judge, maybe I am not being clear. We 20 A. Yes, sir. 21 anticipate -- and I will represent to the Court that we are 21 Q. And then on August 26 of this year, you drafted out a 22 going to offer evidence that the Defendant's arrest was illegal, 22 search warrant to get a buccal swab from Mr. Crutsinger again, 23 and we are also going to offer evidence that the search warrant 23 correct? 24 that Judge Sharen Wilson issued --24 A. Yes, sir. 25 THE COURT: That's what I understood from your 25 Q. And who requested you to get that search warrant to

Page 42 of 1 about 1:15? 1 obtain another swab from Mr. Crutsinger? 2 A. I believe that's correct, sir. A. Ms. Hartmann and Ms. Callaghan. 3 Q. Okay. Why did they request you to get another swab? 3 O. Okay. A. No, sir. I'm sorry. It was not. It was turned on A. It was my understanding that a question had been 5 around 1:45. 5 brought up about the legality of Mr. Crutsinger's arrest. O. 1:45. So you had talked to him for approximately an Q. Okay. 7 hour before you turned on the tape recorder? A. And I believe it was a precautionary measure to try to A. No, sir, about 30 minutes. 8 address that subject even though it was my understanding that 9 because the --Q. 30 minutes? Okay. Ms. Hartmann asked you if he was 10 high or anything like that. Do you remember that? 10 Q. It was a precautionary measure. 11 MS. HARTMANN: Objection to Counsel interrupting 11 A. Yes, sir, I do. 12 and not letting --Q. In your opinion had he been drinking alcohol? 12 13 THE COURT: Sustained. 13 A. Yes, sir. 14 Q. What do you base that opinion on? MR. MOORE: Object to his narrative answer. 14 15 THE COURT: Overruled. 15 A. I smelled it. 16 MS. HARTMANN: I'm going to object and ask that 16 O. Okay. Did you ask him if he had been drinking? 17 counsel let the witness finish his answer. 17 A. I don't recall that I did, no. 18 Q. Okay. When you -- as a lead detective on a homicide 18 MR. RAY: His answer is nonresponsive too, Judge. 19 THE COURT: Have you finished your answer? 19 case like this, you generate several documents, correct? 20 THE WITNESS: I understood that it was a 20 A. Yes, sir. 21 precautionary measure because the question had been brought up O. One of them is the probably, I guess, your case notes 21 22 that you take while you are out on the scene initially. and had not been answered at that time. 23 23 Q. A question about the legality of the arrest, correct? A. Yes. 24 24 Q. And did you take some of those? 25 Q. And you know as a police officer of 21 years, you are 25 A. Yes. Page 152 Page 150 1 taught basic criminal procedure in the academy, aren't you? O. Then did you reduce that to writing -- not reduce it 2 A. Yes, sir. 2 to writing. It is put down in a typed report, correct? Q. And you are taught about the penal code in the 3 A. Yes, sir. 4 academy. 4 Q. And you call that the -- what do you call that? 5 A. Yes, sir. 5 I just call it the case details. Q. The penal code contains the laws that our legislature Q. Okay. And then when you arrived back from Galveston, 7 you actually generated an arrest warrant and an arrest warrant 7 passes, correct? 8 A. Yes, sir. 8 affidavit, didn't you? 9 Q. And it is pretty axiomatic that police officers, to A. Yes, sir. 10 arrest somebody on the street, have to have probable cause to 10 O. And the arrest warrant affidavit, just like a search 11 arrest, don't they? 11 warrant affidavit, is a means for you to go to a Judge like this 12 A. Yes, sir. 12 Judge and say, "I have got enough probable cause for you to 13 Q. You can't just be walking down the street as a police 13 issue this search or arrest warrant," correct? 14 officer and arrest somebody for just walking down the street, 14 A. Yes, sir. 15 can you? 15 Q. And you swore to it and you say, "I swear everything 16 A. No, sir. 16 in here is true and correct," right? Q. There has to be something that that person is doing to 17 A. Yes, sir. 18 indicate to the police officer that he's violating the law. 18 Q. And that's what you did with the search warrant on 19 correct? 19 August 26, correct? 20 A. Yes, sir. 20 A. Yes, sir. 21 Q. When you interviewed Mr. Crutsinger down in Galveston 21 Q. Went over to Judge Sharen Wilson across the hall and 22 on April 9, how long did you talk to him before you turned the 22 had her read it and sign it, correct? 23 tape recorder on? 23 A. Yes, sir. 24 Q. And you had an arrest warrant when you got back from A. Probably around a half hour. 24 25 Q. Okay. And the tape recorder was turned on, I believe, 25 Galveston, correct?

	Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Condition	19 \$4	903/17 Page 43 of 64 PageID 4679
	Page 153		Page 155
1	A. Well, I obtained the warrant after I got back, yes.	1	MR. MOORE: That this whole issue was raised by
2	Q. And it had an affidavit attached to it?	2	the Defense. Well, I guess that's a legal opinion again.
3	A. Yes, it did.	3	MS. HARTMANN: Well, if you can ask him to make
4	Q. And your case report?	4	legal opinions
5	A. I didn't have the case report until much later, but I	5	MR. RAY: I don't think it is up to her or
6	had the facts.	6	anybody else to comment on our strategy by a rule
7	Q. Your case report would accurately reflect the facts	7	THE COURT: Which rule?
8	that you gathered about this offense, correct?	8	MS. HARTMANN: How about admission of a party
9	A. Yes, sir.	9	opponent?
10	Q. Any other documentation besides what we talked about	10	MR. MOORE: In filing the Motion to Suppress?
11	that you generated during this investigation?	11	MS. HARTMANN: Yes.
12	A. That I generated?	12	MR. RAY: I'm not a party to the lawsuit.
13	Q. Yes.	13	MS. HARTMANN: Well, I'm not either, but that
14	A. I don't recall any.	14	didn't stop
15	MR. MOORE: Thank you, Detective. I'll pass the	15	THE COURT: You all are.
16	witness.	16	I don't think there is any kind of false
17	REDIRECT EXAMINATION	17	impression or I don't think there has been a question
18	BY MS. HARTMANN:	18	raised. I am not going to let you go into it.
19	Q. Judge Sharen Wilson signed the search warrant?	19	(In the hearing of the jury)
20	A. Yes, ma'am.	20	Q. You were asked questions, Detective McCaskill, about
21	Q. And she's a Criminal District Court Judge of Criminal	21	the Defendant and smelling alcohol on his breath.
22	District Court No. 1 on the other side of this building.	22	A. Yes, ma'am.
23	A. Yes, ma'am.	23	Q. How long have you been a peace officer?
24	Q. She's been on the bench for how long? Do you know?	24	A. 21 years.
25	A. I recall that she was a prosecutor when I first became	25	Q. And in that time period, have you dealt with few or
	Page 154		Page 156
1	a detective in '86, and it was shortly after that that she	1	many intoxicated individuals?
2	became a District Court Judge; so I would say 16 years, but I	2	A. Many.
3	don't know if that's entirely accurate.	3	Q. Did Mr. Crutsinger fall into the category of being an
4	Q. So she's been on the bench for some 16 years in a	4	intoxicated individual?
5	District Court.	5	A. No.
6	A. As far as I know, yes.	6	Q. Do you think if he had been intoxicated, it would be
7	Q. And at the time that you obtained that search warrant,	7	clearly evident on that oral statement that's been recorded?
8	was it your understanding that there there were some Court	8	A. Yes, I believe so.
9	rulings that had not yet been made?	9	Q. Was it your understanding, Detective McCaskill, that
10	A. Yes, ma'am.	10	the Defendant wanted to speak with you?
11	Q. And that that search warrant was obtained in an	11	A. Yes, ma'am.
1	abundance of caution?	12	
13	A. Yes, ma'am.	13	back to that room?
14		14	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
1	here.	15	
16	A. Yes, ma'am.	16	
17	MS. HARTMANN: May we approach the bench?	17	<u> </u>
18	THE COURT: Yes.		to the effect of, "I kept telling myself just go ahead and tell
19	(Outside the hearing of the jury)	t .	the police what you did"?
20	MS. HARTMANN: Since the Defense has raised the	20	
171	issue, I think I am entitled to ask the detective if this whole	21	Q. "And get it behind you"?
22	issue was raised by the Defense and that's why the action was	22	•
22 23	issue was raised by the Defense and that's why the action was being taken.	23	Q. "Go to the FBI"?
22	issue was raised by the Defense and that's why the action was	1	Q. "Go to the FBI"? A. Yes, ma'am.

1 cases express a wish to talk to the police, are you going to 1 murder, suspicious deaths, suicides. 2 talk to them? O. How long have you been doing this? 3 A. Absolutely. 3 A. Two years. Q. What did you do before that? Q. Are you going to tell them no? 5 A. No. A. The two years prior to that, I was a crime scene Q. Are you going to refuse to talk to someone if they 7 want to talk with you? O. And you worked in the Crime Scene Search unit? 8 A. No, ma'am. A. Yes, ma'am. 9 9 Q. How long you did you work in Crime Scene Search unit? MS, HARTMANN: Pass the witness. 10 RECROSS-EXAMINATION 10 A. Almost two years. 11 BY MR. MOORE: Q. So you received the training that crime scene officers 11 12 Q. But the truth of the matter is that he was in custody 12 receive and actually participated in obtaining and preserving 13 in the Galveston Police Department, correct, when you talked to 13 evidence from crime scenes for two years before you became a 14 him? 14 homicide detective. 15 A. Yes, sir. A. Yes, ma'am. Q. He was -- and just so we are clear, you didn't have 16 16 O. Were you on duty April 9, 2003? 17 him under arrest for anything, did you? 17 A. Yes, ma'am. 18 18 A. No, sir. Q. Were you dispatched to an address on North Main? 19 Q. You didn't have enough probable cause as we were 19 A. My sergeant asked me to go there, yes. 20 talking about to get an arrest warrant for anybody at that point 20 Q. Do you recall what address you went to? 21 in time, did you? 21 A. I don't know the exact address. It was the Cowboy Inn 22 A. No. 22 in the 3100 block of North Main. 23 23 MR. MOORE: Thank you, Detective. Q. Why did you go there? 24 That's all I have, Your Honor. 24 A. My sergeant advised me that there could be some 25 MS. HARTMANN: We have nothing further at this 25 clothing in a dumpster. Page 160 Page 158 1 time. 1 Q. And what time did you arrive? 2 THE COURT: You may step down, sir. A. It probably was about 3:30 because he notified me at MS. CALLAGHAN: At this time, Your Honor, the 3 3:10. 4 State would ask the Court to take judicial notice of date of 4 Q. He notified you about 3:10, so you would have gotten 5 return of the indictment in this case, that being June 19 of 5 there about 3:30? 6 2003. A. Yes, ma'am. THE COURT: I will take judicial notice that the 7 Q. It took you about 20 minutes to get out there. 8 indictment in this case was presented on June 19, 2003. 8 A. Yes, ma'am. MS. CALLAGHAN: At this time, Your Honor, the Q. What's the very first thing you did when you arrived 10 State would call Officer Johnson. 10 at the Cowboy Inn motel? 11 (Witness sworn) 11 A. At the time I got there, my partner, Detective 12 Whereupon, 12 Carroll, was already on the scene. He had spoken to the manager 13 CHERYL JOHNSON, 13 and gotten consent for us to go through the dumpster. He 14 having been first duly sworn, testified as follows: 14 advised that it had been approximately a week since the trash 15 DIRECT EXAMINATION 15 had been picked up. 16 BY MS. CALLAGHAN: Q. So you felt like items from the previous week might 16 17 Q. Would you please state your name for the ladies and 17 still be in there. 18 gentlemen of the jury? 18 A. Yes, ma'am. 19 A. Cheryl Johnson. 19 Q. Did you go to the dumpster and look? 20 Q. And how are you employed? 20 A. Yes, ma'am. 21 A. I am a homicide detective with the Fort Worth Police 21 Q. Did you photograph it? 22 Department. 22 A. Yes, ma'am. 23 Q. What do you do as a homicide detective? 23 MS. CALLAGHAN: Approach the witness, Your Honor? 24 A. Normally when we are called out to a homicide, we 24 Q. Let me show you what is marked State's Exhibits 106, 25 investigate the case. We also assist other Defendants on any 25 107, 108, 109, 110, 111 and 112 for identification in this

Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y. Document 8-Condense 1:03/17. Page 45 of 64. PageID 4681.

Page 161

1 cause. If you will take a moment and review those.

2 A. (Witness complies)

Q. Okay. Are these true and accurate depictions of the

4 way the Cowboy Inn motel, the dumpster and the contents of the

5 dumpster appeared on April 9, 2003, when you went out there?

6 A. Yes.

MS. CALLAGHAN: At the time the State would offer

8 State's Exhibits, 106 through 112 for all purposes and tender

9 them to Defense Counsel for their inspection.

10 MR. RAY: No objection.

THE COURT: 106 through 112 are admitted.

12 (State's Exhibit No. 106 - 112 received)

MS. CALLAGHAN: Thank you. If I may publish them

14 to the jury, Your Honor?

15 THE COURT: You may.

16 Q. Do you want to step down?

17 A. (Witness complies)

18 Q. Okay. Let's start with this half of the jury, and if

19 you can tell them what State's Exhibit 106 is.

A. This is the outside of the Cowboy Inn from the front

21 of the building along the side. This is another photograph.

22 This is north of this photograph where the dumpster was on the

23 north edge of the Cowboy Inn.

A. (Witness complies)

Q. There are three photographs in State's Exhibit 106.

25 Can you point to where the dumpster is depicted in these three

O. Okav.

2 A. As we moved the very top area of the trash out of the

3 way, we found a clump of clothing, and this is a closer

4 photograph of that clothing, how we found it.

Q. And then let's explain to the jury 110 and 111

6 starting with the top one first.

A. All right. Once we collected that first clump of

8 clothing, I began to move the trash around, and I could see the

9 denim. At this point this is the photograph as we saw the denim

10 and this is the cutting that we pulled out for a closer

11 photograph of those.

12 Q. To explain 110, there was a pair of denim cutoffs that

13 you found in the dumpster, correct?

14 A. Yes, ma'am.

15 O. And then there were two sections that were cut from

16 the legs of a pair of jeans.

17 A. Yes, ma'am.

18 Q. Okay.

19 A. This photograph is showing the denim cutoffs that we

20 found, and then farther down we found two cutoffs --

21 O. You found sections of legs of denim jeans --

22 A. Yes, ma'am.

Q. But these were the pants.

A. Those were the pants, and these were the legs that

25 were cut off.

Page 162

1 photographs?

Q. That's the center of the lowest picture, correct?

4 A. Yes, ma'am.

3

Q. And to this half of the jury, could you explain --

A. This is the outside of the Cowboy Inn showing a sign

7 in front of the building. This is a little farther north, the

8 same view, and this is the north end of the building, the side

9 where the dumpster is located.

10 Q. Okay. Let's go ahead and take a look at State's

11 Exhibit 107, which contains two photographs. If you could

12 explain this exhibit starting with the top photograph.

A. Both of these photographs are actually photographs of

14 the dumpster before we began moving things around. This is how

15 it appeared as we approached it.

Q. Okay.

17 A. Both of those are photographs of the dumpster, how we

18 saw it before we disturbed anything inside the dumpster, how we

19 saw it.

Q. All right. Let's at this time show the jury 108 and

21 109 starting with State's Exhibit 108 first.

A. As we began to move things around in the top of the

23 dumpster, this is the first view of what we found, which was

24 some clothing wadded up together. Here is a closer-up

25 photograph of that clothing as we found it.

Page 164

Page 163

Q. And finally if you could go ahead and explain to the

2 jury 112, which contains four photographs, starting, as you face

3 the photograph, with the top left.

4 A. These photographs are from our blood drying room.

5 Anytime there is material or evidence with blood, it has to be

6 dried before we can submit that. So this is the table in the

7 blood drying room. And there is the shirt that's been laid out

8 to dry, the towel, the denim cutoffs and the denim shirt.

Q. Okay.

10 A. This is the blood drying room, and each one of these

11 are tables. The shirt, the towel and the denim cutoffs and the

12 denim shirt.

13 Q. Now, after you photographed the contents of the

14 dumpster, did you recover the clothing and items that were

15 contained inside the dumpster?

16 A. Yes, ma'am.

Q. And how did you package them?

18 A. They were taken in brown paper bags, each item in a

19 separate bag. At that point they were secured in my trunk and

20 taken up to the office and the blood drying room.

Q. Did you permit those items to dry in the blood drying

22 room?

17

23 A. Yes, ma'am.

24 Q. Did you then package them?

25 A. Yes, ma'am.

Page 46 of 64 Page 167 O. You can see that the denim shirt was sleeveless; the Q. How did you pack them? A. Once again, in brown paper bags; then I would seal 2 sleeves had been cut off. 3 them with tape and initial with my initials and ID number. A. Yes. 3 Q. Were they then submitted to the property room? O. It appears to have stains on a considerable portion of A. Yes, ma'am. 5 the front. Q. Did I ask you to bring over the items of evidence that A. Yes. 7 you recovered from the property room this morning? Q. In fact, State's 124-A you can see the stains on the 8 pocket and the -- what do you call that? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. And did you do so? A. I don't know. A. Yes. 10 O. All right. So you can see stains on the front then? Q. Could you step down for a minute? A. Yes, ma'am. 11 A. (Witness complies) 12 Q. Okay. Thank you. Go down and show the rest of the Q. Let me show you first what is marked State's Exhibit 13 jury. 14 124 for identification in this cause. Do you recognize that A. All right. Here is a picture from my side. It is the 14 15 bag? 15 right as you are looking at it. Denim shirt, the same denim A. Yes, ma'am. 16 shirt. Q. And what is it? 17 Q. Okay. Now let's go to State's Exhibit No. 125. Do A. It is a package that I sealed the denim shirt in. 18 you recognize this? Q. How do you recognize this bag? 19 A. Yes, ma'am, it is a package where I submitted the A. Because when it is folded down, it would have my 20 cutoff jeans. 21 initials and my ID number. 21 Q. How do you recognize this bag? Q. Your Fort Worth Police Department ID number is on 22 A. Through my initials. 23 there? 23 Q. That appear on the bag? A. Yes. 24 A. Yes, ma'am. Q. If you could go ahead and reach in and pull out the 25 Q. Could you reach in and pull out the contents. Page 168 Page 166 1 contents of State's Exhibit 124. 1 A. (Witness complies). A. (Witness complies) Q. Now, let me show you what is marked State's Exhibit Q. Earlier today in the court reporter's office, did we 3 125-A for identification. Are these the cutoff jeans that you 4 go ahead and open State's Exhibit 124 and remove the contents? 4 recovered from the dumpster April 9, 2003? A. Yes, ma'am. A. Yes, ma'am. 5 Q. Is State's Exhibit 124-A the contents of 124? The same cutoffs that you secured in the bag marked A. Yes, ma'am. 7 State's Exhibit 125? 8 A. Yes. Q. Except for obvious areas where the bag was opened by 10 the Tarrant County Medical Examiner's office, does the bag 11 appear to have been tampered with in any way? 12 A. No. 13 Q. Does the bag, State's Exhibit 125, appear to be 14 tampered with? 15 MS. CALLAGHAN: Your Honor, the State will offer A. No. MS. CALLAGHAN: We offer 125 for the record only 16

- 6 7 Q. So this is the denim shirt that you recovered from the 9 dumpster on April 9, 2003. 10 A. Yes. 11 Q. Other than obvious marks where testing from the 12 Tarrant County Medical Examiner's office was done, does the bag
- 13 or contents appear to have been in any way being tampered with? 14 A. No.
- 15 16 124 for the record and 124-A for all purposes.
- 17 THE COURT: 124 is admitted for the record; 124-A 18 for all purposes.
- 19 (State's Exhibit No. 124, 124-A received)
- 20 MS. HARTMANN: If I may publish by walking in
- 21 front of them with it?

1

2

5

9

10

11

12

13

16

17

18

19

20

22

24

25

2

- 22 THE COURT: You may.
- Q. Referring back to State's Exhibit 112, can you point
- 24 out where the denim shirt is pictured in that exhibit? A. The bottom there.

- 17 and 125-A for all purposes.
- 18 THE COURT: 125-A is admitted; 125 for the record
- 19 only.
- 20 (State's Exhibit No. 125, 125-A received)
- 21 MS. CALLAGHAN: If I may publish it to the jury?
- 22 THE COURT: You may.
- 23 Q. Referring to State's Exhibit 112 again, which pictures
- 24 the evidence --
- A. It would be right there. 25

Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Cendense It™ Page 169 O. And that's in the lower left-hand corner. 1 that they were found in the same dumpster, the two leg cuttings 2 A. Yes. 2 that you recovered, you had no other indication that they 3 belonged to the same pair of pants, correct? 3 Q. You can see that the jeans appear also to have a 4 considerable number of stains on the --A. No, I did not. A. Yes. O. And they are, obviously looking at them, different Q. And you can see that in State's Exhibit 125? 6 colors from the denim pants themselves. A. Yes, a photograph of the cutoff jeans, the lower left 7 A. Yes. 8 of the photograph --8 O. Did you make an attempt out there in that area around Q. These stains that appear on the clothing, both the 9 the Cowboy Motel to locate some car keys? 10 denim shirt and denim cutoffs, these stains are why you had to 10 A. Yes, ma'am, we did. 11 leave it in the drying room to dry, correct? 11 O. And what buildings did you go to? 12 A. Yes, ma'am. 12 A. We went to three buildings: the Car Care car wash, 13 13 the Auto Tire City, which is at 3221 North Main; and the Instant MS. CALLAGHAN: One moment, please, Your Honor. 14 Q. Now, you brought a number of other items over today; 14 Loan at 3025 North Main. And the Car Care is just south of the 15 is that correct? 15 Cowboy Inn, but there were no numbers that I noticed to give an A. Yes, ma'am. 16 16 exact address. 17 Q. And that would include -- if you want to step over 17 Q. Can you step down for just a moment? 18 here? 18 A. (Witness complies) 19 A. (Witness complies) 19 O. Now, referring with this half of the jury to State's 20 Q. Some white socks, which are in a bag marked State's 20 Exhibit 115, which has previously been admitted, is this one of 21 Exhibit 126; is that correct? 21 the doors that you examined in order to find the keys? 22 A. Yes, ma'am. 22 A. Yes, ma'am. 23 Q. And these were also recovered from the inside of the 23 Q. What end of the building did you go up in order to get 24 dumpster. 24 on top of the building? 25 A. Yes. 25 A. The right top of the building right above the bay and Page 172 Page 170 Q. Did you also bring State's Exhibit No. 127, which 1 searched the area of the actual building. 2 contain a gray t-shirt which was recovered from the inside of Q. But you did not search the area above the overhang; is 3 the dumpster? 3 that correct? A. Yes. 4 A. Correct. Q. Did you bring State's Exhibit 128, which contains a O. Not here. 6 white towel recovered from the inside of the dumpster? 6 A. No. A. Yes. Q. And you have no knowledge of whether keys were Q. And finally, did you bring State's Exhibit No. 129, 8 eventually discovered there. 9 which contains the pieces of denim cutting from the legs of the A. No, I don't. We took the ladder up above the bay and 10 pair of pants? 10 searched the rooftop of the building? A. Yes. 11 Q. But you-all did not search the overhang? 12 Q. Did you also recover these from the dumpster? 12 A. No. 13 13 Q. And you have no knowledge of whether or not keys were 14 Q. Did you package them each in the bags that they are 14 eventually recovered on this overhang. 15 presently in? 15 A. Correct. 16 A. Yes, ma'am, I did. 16 Q. Okay. Thank you. So you did not find any keys on any 17 MS. CALLAGHAN: At this time the State would 17 of the other buildings? 18 offer State's Exhibit 126 through 129 for the record only. 18 A. No, we did not. 19 MR. RAY: You said 126 through 129? 19 MS. CALLAGHAN: Thank you very much. 20 MS. CALLAGHAN: Yes. 20 I'll pass the witness. 21 MR. RAY: No objection. 21 CROSS-EXAMINATION THE COURT: They are admitted for the record 22 BY MR. RAY: 23 only. 23 Q. Officer Johnson, all these sacks, which I believe are 24 (State's Exhibit No. 126 - 129 received) 24 State's Exhibit 124 through 129 --25 Q. Now, just to clarify one thing, other than the fact A. Yes, sir.

Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Gandenset 3/17 Page 48 of 64 Page D 4684 Page 175 Page 173 Q. -- have I got the numbers right? Seems like that's O. I think you showed the jury some photographs of what 2 what they -- the ones she showed you. 2 you call your drying room. A. The ones she showed me, yes. A. Yes, sir. 3 Q. When you bagged up things in those individuals bags, 4 O. Is the drying room just a secure area that's got paper 5 did those bags just go to the property room like they were, or 5 laid out on the tables that you lay stuff on it for it to dry? 6 were they contained in something else? A. No, sir. A. They were actually contained in a box. 7 Q. Tell me what the drying room is. MR. RAY: Can I approach the witness? 8 MS. CALLAGHAN: Your Honor, before the witness 9 goes on, could we move the box? Because I can't see her at all, THE COURT: Yes. Q. Is this the box? And I want you to look at it and 10 and I'm not sure the jury can. 11 tell me if it is. Feel free to look around there. 11 Q. Go ahead and finish. A. Yes, sir. A. The drying room is a secure room. It has key access MR. RAY: And if I could, Mr. Court Reporter, 13 but also security-code access. The room has multiple metal 14 could I have a sticker? 14 tables. Prior to any evidence being dried on those tables, we Okay. I'm going to put my little bitty sticker 15 wash the tables with bleach and water and then lay down fresh 16 on this big box. Defendant's Exhibit 2. That's on this box; is 16 butcher paper and then lay the items on there to dry. And once 17 that correct? 17 they are packaged, we remove the butcher and wash the tables A. Yes, sir. 18 with bleach and water. MR. RAY: First of all, I will offer the box. 19 Q. I can't go over to the drying room, can I? 20 Madam Prosecutor, I will offer Defense Exhibit 2, this box. 20 A. No. MS. CALLAGHAN: That's fine for the record only. O. If I go over there and say, "Hey, I want to look in THE COURT: For all purposes or for the record 22 the drying room," they're not going to let me in there. It's a 23 only? 23 secure area. 24 MR. RAY: I want it for all purposes. Maybe I A. Right. 25 wasn't clear for the prosecutor. 25 Q. Of that 40 hours, how long were these things spent in Page 176 Page 174 MS. CALLAGHAN: The State has no objection. 1 the drying room? A. It would have been from the time I took them up there, THE COURT: Defense 2 is admitted. (Defendant's Exhibit No. 2 received) 3 which was probably about 4:30 or 5:00 o'clock on the 9th; and Q. In regards to Defendant's Exhibit 2 -- you can 4 they would have been packaged about 8:00 a.m. on the 11th. Q. Were all of these items wet or just some of them? 6 A. They were all wet. These other sacks, for instance, 129, that would Q. If you had had some items that weren't wet, would they 8 have gone straight to the property room, or would they have A. Yes, sir. 9 maybe waited until you got everything dried out? Q. As well as the other sacks that you had, right? 10 A. You can do it either way. A lot of times I will

1

2

3

5 probably answer this without me standing here in front of 6 everybody.

8 have been inside of that.

8

9

10

12

13

15

18

19

21

22

24

11 A. Yes, sir.

12 Q. What did you do with that box?

13 A. This box was submitted to the property room with the 14 evidence.

Q. And about how long did it take to get to the property 15 16 room after you went out to the dumpster? In other words, from 17 the time you got the evidence out of the dumpster and finished

18 looking around out there, how long was it after that before all

19 this stuff got packaged up and stuck in that box and given to

20 the property room?

23

21 A. Okay. It was submitted to the property room on the

22 11th at 9:20, so approximately 40 hours, maybe.

Q. And what was it that took so long -- why 40 hours?

24 A. It is because the clothing was still wet and it needed

25 to totally dry before it was submitted.

11 submit them.

12 Q. Sometimes you submit them; sometimes you don't, just

13 depending on the situation?

14 A. Yes, sir.

15 Q. But if everything was dry, you wouldn't have gone

16 through the step of going to the drying room, correct?

17 A. No. sir.

18 Q. That's a correct statement?

19 A. That's correct.

20 Q. So just as an example, if I get arrested and I have

21 got a gun, maybe, in my car that the police want to confiscate;

22 you come out and confiscate the gun, it goes in a bag or a box,

23 and it goes straight to the property room.

24 A. Yes, sir.

25 Q. And the only time constraint is just however long it 4:07-cy-00703-Y Document 8 Condense It 103/17 Page 49 of 64 Page 179

Page 177

1 took for you to get off your shift -- you turn it in at the end

- 2 of your shift; is that correct?
- 3 A. Normally you would package it and submit it right
- 4 then.
- 5 Q. Okay. So it is conceivable that if you were called to
- 6 a scene and you picked up some items and maybe not very many
- 7 items -- you picked up some items and you packaged them, they
- 8 could get to the property room within an hour.
- A. Yes, sir.
- 10 Q. Is there a reason that you do that?
- 11 A. To preserve the integrity and the chain of custody.
- 12 Q. You are not supposed to have stuff just laying around
- 13 in your car, right?
- 14 A. Correct.
- 15 Q. I mean longer than is necessary.
- 16 A. Yes, sir.
- 17 Q. And if you seal up something, do you seal it up right
- 18 when you get it, or do you maybe just get one of those bags and
- 19 throw the shirt in it and stick it in the back of the van until
- 20 you get down to the police department?
- 21 A. It would depend. I did not seal these prior to taking
- 22 them to the police department.
- 23 Q. But these were wet.
- 24 A. Right.
- 25 Q. Back to my example. If you had something that was
- Page 178
- 1 dry, would you need -- are you supposed to seal that
- 2 immediately?
- 3 A. We normally do not seal it until we got down to our
- 4 evidence room.
- Q. So if I go to some crime scene van right now, might
- 6 there be stuff unsealed just laying around in the back of it?
- 7 Is that possible?
- 8 A. It's possible if they're still at the scene of the
- 9 crime, yes.
- Q. Well, is it possible for a crime scene officer to go
- 11 to more than one crime scene with open bags and boxes in the
- 12 back of his truck?
- 13 A. It normally doesn't happen, but I guess it's possible.
- 14 Q. If you don't seal it until you get downtown, it's
- 15 certainly possible, is it not?
- 16 A. It is possible. Normally we would make one call, take
- 17 the evidence down.
- 18 Q. I understand. But what I am hearing you say -- and
- 19 maybe I just need to ask you directly. Is there a rule or a law
- 20 or procedure or general order or whatever you want to call it
- 21 that says that at the time you pick up a piece of evidence,
- 22 assuming it's not wet and has to go to the drying room -- if you
- 23 pick up a piece of evidence, that you have to seal it right on
- 24 the spot? Anything that says that?
- A. Not that I'm aware of.

- O. It would just make better sense to do it that way,
- 2 though, for contamination purposes, correct?
- A. Depending on the situation. I hate to give a definite 3
- 4 answer. Every situation is different.
- O. Can you tell from looking at the box -- and maybe you
- 6 need to look around at it if you need to or it may be in your
- 7 notes. Can you tell who turned that in to the property room?
- A. It's not on the box.
- Q. There is a document that supports when you turned it
- 10 in, correct?
- 11 A. Yes, sir.
- 12 Q. You don't just put things in the box and throw it in
- 13 the property room. You fill out a form, and there is somebody
- 14 there to sign for it. If not, you turn it in to the --
- 15 A. Yes, sir.
- 16 Q. But for whatever reason might keep you from getting it
- 17 to the property room, you are not supposed to drive around for
- 18 two or three days --
- 19 A. No. sir.
- Q. That's -- that goes back to the contamination problem 20
- 21 or it may get lost -- you may lose it.
- 22 A. Yes, sir.
- 23 MR. RAY: I'll pass the witness. Thank you.
- 24 REDIRECT EXAMINATION
- 25 BY MS. CALLAGHAN:

Page 180

- O. Officer Johnson, a crime scene search unit van
- 2 contains a lot of items that you need to recover and preserve
- 3 evidence, correct?
- A. Yes, ma'am.
- Q. But it is not a full facility in the same way that
- 6 your office or property room is, correct?
- 7 A. No, it is not.
- Q. So customarily do you retrieve the evidence, put it in
- 9 the crime scene search unit van and then carry it down to the
- 10 police department where it is then further processed and
- 11 packaged in the facilities you have in the police department --
- A. Yes, ma'am. 12
- 13 Q. In terms of submitting things to the property room, is
- 14 the property room open 24 hours?
- A. No ma'am. 15

17

- 16 Q. What are its general hours?
 - A. I believe it is 6:0 a.m. to 10:00 p.m. It's day shift
- 18 and evening shift, but not midnights.
- Q. All right. If someone brings in evidence at an hour 19
- 20 other than that which they are open, what is the procedure for
- 21 preserving the evidence until the property room is open?
- A. Okay. For officers -- in our captain's office we have 22
- 23 lockers where evidence can be submitted and kept secure. The
- 24 crime scene office for crime scene officers is also secured with
- 25 a lock and a key pad to secure the evidence.

	~ ·		and a substance — to the particle of the control o
Case	Cond	ans ans	1703/16 Faue 30 01 04 Faue 11 4000
	Page 181	T -	Page 183
	u have temporary holding facilities where	1	
Į.	wait for a period of time before actually going to	2	
3 the property	room.	3	
4 A. Yes.		4	A. Yes, she did.
i .	nding on what hour it was given and the	5	
3	s going on.	6	that specifically addressed the period of April, 2003?
7 A. Yes, r	na'am.	7	A. Yes, I did.
	S. CALLAGHAN: Thank you very much. Pass the	8	MS. HARTMANN: May I approach the witness?
9 witness.	•	9	THE COURT: Yes.
1	RERAY: I don't have anything further.	10	
l .	HE COURT: You may step down, ma'am.	11	identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 138. Do you
I	HE COURT: Ladies and gentlemen, let's take a	12	5
3	. Please retire to the jury room and remember and	13	A. Yes, ma'am.
14 follow your i	nstructions.	14	Q. Are these the records that pertain to Patricia Syren's
1	decess taken)	15	Morgan Stanley credit card account?
	ury not present)	16	A. Yes, ma'am, for the month of April.
i	HE COURT: Are both sides for the for the jury?	17	Q. All right. Now that you have had a chance to look at
1	S. CALLAGHAN: With the Court's permission, I	18	
1	replace the number on State's Exhibit 129, which	19	Exhibit No. 138, does that actually belong to somebody else?
1	cutting that was recovered by Detective Johnson,	20	A. No, that is a mistake.
21 with the num	ber "137."	21	Q. Do you have the records belonging to Patricia Syren's
· 1	R. RAY: Okay,	1	Morgan Stanley credit card account?
1	S. CALLAGHAN: And if I may notify the jury of	23	A. Yes, ma'am, I do.
24 that?		24	Q. I'm showing you what's been marked for identification
25 M	R. RAY: That's fine	25	purposes as State's Exhibit No. 139. Are those the records that
	Page 182		Page 184
1 (J	ury present)	1	pertain to Patricia Syren?
2 M	S. CALLAGHAN: Your Honor, for the record, it	2	A. Yes, they are.
3 appears that	there are two items inadvertently labeled State's	3	Q. Who resided at 2716 Scott Avenue here in Fort Worth?
1	so the denim cuttings recovered by Detective	4	A. Correct.
ľ	e been relabeled 137.	5	Q. State's Exhibit No. 139, are those records that are
1.	S. HARTMANN: The State calls Randy Fuller.	6	kept in the regular course of Morgan Stanley's business?
1	Vitness Sworn)	7	A. Yes, ma'am.
8 Whereupon,		8	Q. Do they document activity on Ms. Syren's account at or
9	RANDY FULLER,	9	about the time that the activity actually takes place?
	first duly sworn, testified as follows:	10	A. Yes, ma'am, they do, beginning here and one here.
	DIRECT EXAMINATION	11	Q. And these records cover a period from April 6 through
12 BY MS. HARTN			April 8
)	d you state your name, please?	13	A. Correct.
14 A. Randy		14	Q as far as debit card charges?
Ī -	are you employed?	15	A. Correct.
	organ Stanley.	16	Q. Are these a fair and accurate copy of the record that
i .	loes the company Morgan Stanley have credit cards	1	Morgan Stanley maintains?
-	e to individuals?	18	A. Yes, ma'am.
1	do. They are debit cards based on the person's	19	MS. HARTMANN: The State would offer State's
1	organ Stanley.	{	139.
1	ou the custodian of records for various Morgan	21	MR. RAY: Can I have just a second, Judge?
1	e card accounts?	22	THE COURT: Yes.
23 A. Yes.		23	(Pause in the proceedings)
24 Q. Were 25 with you here	you, in fact, requested to bring some records	24	MR. MOORE: Can I ask him one question, Your
			Honor?

Page 185 Page 187 1 THE COURT: Yes. 1 or at least if they do, I don't know how to read them. 2 VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION 2 Q. Okay. 3 BY MR. MOORE: A. It just gives a reference number, which the business Q. There actually appears to be some ink on this State's 4 establishment gets back saying that the credit card is good, 5 Exhibit 139. Is that -- did you put that on there? 5 just a little more detail. A. I did. Q. State's Exhibit 139, Mr. Moore asked you about some-7 Q. For what purpose? 7 purple writing that's on here, and you said that you put that on 8 A. Just for my notes here today. 8 here? 9 Q. Okay., 9 A. I did. 10 A. Actually I would be more than happy to provide the 10 O. Does that include the actual Master Card debit number? 11 Court with clean, unmarked copies. 11 A. It does. 12 MR. MOORE: We don't have any objection. 12 MS. HARTMANN: We'll pass the witness. 13 THE COURT: 139 is admitted. 13 CROSS-EXAMINATION 14 (State's Exhibit No. 139 received) 14 BY MR. MOORE: DIRECT EXAMINATION CONTINUED 15 Q. Mr. Fuller, you testified that your records won't tell 16 BY MS. HARTMANN: 16 the time that the transaction was made? 17 Q. State's Exhibit 139, does it detail or give the 17 A. The records I have with me today will not tell that. 18 information of a transaction date when there was an activity Q. Do you have some records at Morgan Stanley that would? 18 19 with the debit card? 19 A. I would have to get those from the credit card 20 A. Yes, ma'am. 20 company, but, yes, they are easily obtainable. 21 O. Is there -- what is a transaction date? What is that 21 Q. What -- how does the credit card company -- if there 22 documenting? 22 is some suspicious activity on a credit card, how do you red 23 A. That would be the date that the charge was incurred. 23 flag that? 24 Q. Is there a column for "Date Paid"? 24 A. The credit card company, or Morgan Stanley's active 25 A. Yes, ma'am. 25 asset department, monitors accounts. So if anything comes Page 188 Page 186 Q. What does that mean? 1 through that looks unusual -- and that's actually pretty A. That would be the date that Morgan Stanley actually 2 often -- then the credit card company will make a phone call to 3 paid the money out for the charge. 3 the client directly. And they will use all phone numbers that Q. All right. And is there a column for "Description"? 4 they have records of, whether it be home, business or cell; and A. Yes, ma'am. 5 they will make every effort and attempt to reach that customer 6 Q. What would fall into the column labeled "Description"? 6 to verify the charges. A. That would tell us what business establishment the Q. Is that fairly -- a fairly new service that y'all 8 charge was made at. 8 provide? Q. All right. And then also a column for "Location," and A. It started, I believe, in 1999 that we started that, 10 what is that referring to? 10 and it's a very good service. A. That would simply tell us what city and state that the 11 MR. MOORE: I agree. Pass the witness. 12 business location was at. 12 MS. HARTMANN: Just a few more additional 13 Q. All right. And also a column for "Amount." Would 13 questions, Your Honor. 14 that be the amount of the debit? 14 REDIRECT EXAMINATION 15 A. Yes, ma'am. 15 BY MS. HARTMANN: 16 Q. And also a final column that says "Merchant Category," 16 O. By looking at State's Exhibit No. 139, is there a 17 and what falls into that category? 17 charge on April 6 of this year? 18 A. For the purposes of our clients' annual statement, the 18 A. Yes, ma'am. 19 charges are broken down into various categories, such as 19 Q. All right. And what is the description? 20 restaurants, clothing. It helps them at the end of the year to A. Kentucky Fried Chicken. And then there the letter 21 tell them where the charges are, where the money has been used. 21 D-301-036, which I understand to be -- to tell us what exact KFC Q. All right. Do you also have records which are more 22 that's at. 23 detailed in nature such that you can tell what time of day the 23 Q. All right. On April 4, the first charge is to where? 24 debit card is actually used? 24 A. Greyhound line -- Greyhound Bus Lines. A. These records do not show that, the exact time of day; 25 Q. That's a transportation business?

Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Condense 13/17 Page 51 of 64 PageID 4687

1 A. Correct. A. I'm sorry? Q. Could you tell the members of the jury what your name 2 Q. As well as on April 4, is there a charge for Razoo's 2 3 Cajun cafe? 3 is? A. Yes, ma'am there is. 4 A. Harvey Turner. Q. Mr. Turner, you are obviously wearing jail clothing. Q. Is there a charge on April 8 for a Joe's Crab in 5 6 Galveston? 6 A. Yes, ma'am, there is. O. Were you benched back from a state jail facility to 7 8 Q. Is there a charge on April 7 for Factory Brand Shoes? 8 come to court to testify today? A. Yes, ma'am, there is. 9 A. Yes. 10 Q. And those are just a few of the charges; there is 10 O. What -- which particular state jail were you benched 11 actually more than that. 11 back from? A. Correct. 12 A. The John L. Lindsey Unit in Jacksboro, Texas. 13 Q. And that first one is a Kentucky Fried Chicken. 13 Q. Can you tell the members of the jury what type of 14 A. That's correct. 14 sentence you are doing? 15 Q. On April 6. A. I am doing a six months' sentence for delivery of a 16 A. Correct. 16 controlled substance. 17 MS. HARTMANN: Pass the witness. 17 O. Is that a state jail felony offense? 18 18 **RECROSS-EXAMINATION** A. Yes, it is. 19 BY MR. RAY: 19 Q. How far into your sentence are you? 20 A. Four months. I have two months remaining. Q. Let me ask you a quick question. Actually, there 20 21 is -- there is 12 transactions in Galveston, Texas, on March 8, O. All right. I want to talk to you about a weekend back 21 22 correct? 22 in April of this year here in Fort Worth. All right? In the 23 A. Actually it is showing April 8. 23 early part of April, the weekend of the 4th, 5th and 6th of 24 Q. I'm sorry, April 8. 24 April of this year, were you staying at the Cowboy Inn motel? 25 A. Yes, sir. 25 A. Yes, I was. Page 190 Page 192 1 Q. Thank you. O. What city is the Cowboy Inn Motel in? 2 A. Yes, sir. 2 A. Fort Worth, Texas. 3 MR. MOORE: We'll pass the witness. 3 Q. Do you know what street it is on? 4 MS. HARTMANN: We have nothing further. A. Main Street. 3100 North Main Street. 5 THE COURT: You may step down, sir. Q. All right. And did you meet anyone while you were 6 MS. HARTMANN: The State calls Harvey Turner. 6 there at the Cowboy Inn Motel that you knew to have the name of 7 MR. RAY: Judge, can we approach just briefly? 7 Billy Jack? THE COURT: Yes. 8 A. Did I meet someone? 9 (Outside the hearing of the jury) Q. That's correct. 10 MR. RAY: Maybe she knows the answer to this. Do 10 A. Yes, ma'am. 11 you want to inquire if he has a pending case. 11 Q. Did you become familiar with somebody? 12 MS. HARTMANN: We benched him back from the --12 A. We conversed, yes. 13 MR. RAY: Okay. Never mind. 13 Q. All right. And what part of that weekend was the 14 (In the hearing of the jury) 14 first time that you saw this person named Billy Jack? 15 (Witness Sworn) 15 A. The first time I saw him was that Friday afternoon, 16 MS. HARTMANN: May I approach the witness for 16 Friday evening, early evening. 17 just a brief moment? 17 Q. Where were you located when you saw him? 18 THE COURT: Yes. 18 A. I was at the car wash next door. 19 Whereupon, 19 Q. What were you doing at the car wash? 20 20 HARVEY TURNER, A. I was more or less sitting on the back reading a 21 having been first duly sworn, testified as follows: 21 newspaper when I saw him come up into the parking lot. 22 DIRECT EXAMINATION 22 Q. Do you see anybody in the courtroom that you would 23 BY MS. HARTMANN: recognize to be that person that is named Billy Jack? 24 Q. Could you introduce yourself to the members of the 24 A. Yes, ma'am. 25 jury? 25 Q. Can you tell us where that person is located and

Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 8 Condense 1/03/17 Page 53 of 64 Page ID 4689 Page 193 Page 195 1 describe something they are wearing? A. Yes, I saw him. A. I guess that's a lavender shirt. 2 O. Okay. And the times that you saw the Defendant, did Q. Okay. If I'm person 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, and the 3 3 you ever talk or speak with him, or was it just seeing him in 4 bailiff --4 the area? A. That Friday and Saturday we saw each other -- I saw A. No. 5. 5 6 him in passing and standing in the doorway of his room. We had MS. HARTMANN: Your Honor, may the record reflect 7 that Mr. Turner has identified the Defendant? 7 not -- we never conversed during that time. 8 THE COURT: It will. Q. During Friday or Saturday? 8 Q. Had you known Mr. Crutsinger, or Billy Jack, before 9 A. Right, Friday or Saturday. 10 that Friday? Q. Did you see the Defendant on Sunday, the 6th of April? 10 11 A. No, ma'am. 11 A. Yes, I did. 12 Q. Had you ever seen him before? 12 Q. Was that early in the morning, afternoon --13 A. No, ma'am. 13 A. It was afternoon. 14 Q. And you said that you were at the car wash. Where did 14 Q. Did you have a conversation with him? 15 you first see the Defendant? 15 A. Yes, I did. 16 A. He was coming across the parking lot at the car wash. 16 Q. And did he appear to be intoxicated or drunk to you 17 Q. Was he coming towards you or walking away from you? 17 when you saw him? 18 A. He was walking like towards the Coke machine. 18 A. No. 19 19 Q. Was he doing anything as he walked toward the Coke Q. Did he make any comments to you about money? 20 machine? 20 A. Yes, he did. 21 A. He had his hand in his shirt pocket separating some 21 Q. What comments did he make to you? 22 money. 22 A. That he had run out of money. 23 Q. Did you have any conversation with him at that point? 23 Q. All right. How long a conversation did you have with 24 A. No. 24 him? 25 Q. What happened? Did he continue on towards the Coke 25 A. We talked for quite a few minutes. We talked about Page 194 Page 196 1 machine or not? 1 what was happening around the area and how he had noticed me A. No, he stopped to turn around and went back to the 2 and --3 motel, the motel office. 3 Q. Okay. Was it just general conversation? Q. Is the Cowboy Inn and car wash, are they located right 4 A. Just general conversation. 5 next to each other? 5 Q. Nothing specific about families or --6 A. They are adjacent to each other, yes. A. No. Q. Okay. Do you know whether or not the Defendant rented 7 Q. Or problems? 8 a room there at the Cowbov Inn? 8 A. No. A. Yes, I do. He did rent a room. 9 Q. All right. Did the Defendant stay there at the Cowboy 10 O. Which room did he rent? 10 Inn Motel, or did he leave at that point? 11 A. Room No. 12. 11 A. He was at the -- you mean on that Sunday? 12 Q. In regard to the setup of the Cowboy Inn Motel, is 12 Q. That Sunday, yes, sir. 13 that close to the front office or far away from it? 13 A. He left for a while that Sunday evening. 14 A. It is sort of catty corner from the office near the --14 Q. All right. 15 near Main street. It's right on Main Street. 15 A. It was like later evening. 16 Q. All right. And did you see Mr. Crutsinger later on 16 O. Did you see him ever come back Sunday evening to the 17 that Friday evening? 17 Cowboy Inn? 18 A. Yes, in his room in the doorway. 18 A. Yes, I did. 19 Q. All right. When you first noticed the Defendant, how 19 Q. When he came back, was he walking or in a vehicle? 20 did he appear as far as his appearance to you? 20 A. He was walking and carrying a sack. 21 A. He stood out because he didn't -- it wasn't -- he 21 Q. Did the sack have any labeling on it? 22 wasn't the normal Main Street motel visitor. He didn't -- just 22 A. Yes, it did. 23 didn't fit. 23 Q. What labeling was on that sack? 24 Q. All right. And did you see the Defendant on Saturday 24 A. Kentucky Fried Chicken. 25 at any time? 25 Q. Did he walk, in fact, back into the Cowboy Inn back to

- 11
- 12
- 13

2

3

6

11

12

15

17

19

20

21

22

23

6

7

- 14
- 15
- 16
- 18
- 19 Q. All right. Is that the time where he offered to let
- you have the room for the rest of the day?
- 21 A. Right, until 11:00 a.m.
 - Q. Until 11:00 a.m.
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. And he told you he was going to work and had to catch
- 25 the bus.

22

- 21 A. Yes, it is. 22 Q. As you look at the top photograph on our left-hand
- 23 side, would that be where the front office is?
- 24

20 the Cowboy Inn?

25 Q. On the opposite side, which would be the right of the

Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Page 55 of 64 PageID 4691 Page 203 1 photograph as we look at it, you can see a Dr. Pepper machine? I you see that in these pictures, or not? 2 A. Yes. A. Yes. I was more or less right in the second picture 3 Q. And there is a doorway that's just visible on the 3 here sitting where this vacuum is sitting right behind that 4 first floor. Is that Room No. 12? 4 fence there. 5 A. That's Room No. 12. O. Were you sitting on -- if we are looking -- if we are Q. The bottom photograph is a shot looking straight at 6 at the scene and we see this view and you were standing there, 7 room No. 12, is it not? 7 would we be able to see you, or would you be completely on the 8 other side of the fence? A. Yes, from the car-wash side. Q. From the car-wash side. Can you see the dumpster that A. I would be on the other side of the fence. You would 10 belongs to the Cowboy Inn? 10 have to come past the fence for me to see - to see me. 11 A. Yes. 11 O. There is a Coke machine in the bottom photograph. Is 12 Q. Can you see the Dr. Pepper machine? 12 that the direction that the Defendant was going? 13 A. Yes. 13 A. Yes. 14 Q. Is there actually a No. 12 attached to the doorway? 14 Q. So this bottom photograph has the Coke machine where 15 A. On the door frame, yes, ma'am. 15 the Defendant was walking. 16 MS. HARTMANN: Permission to publish to the jury? A. Right. And I am standing more or less over here. 16 17 17 THE COURT: Yes. Q. Close to the fence. 18 Q. All right. I'm showing you what's been marked for 18 A. No, on the other side of the fence right here. 19 identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 114. Do you 19 O. Okav. 20 recognize the four pictures that make up 114? 20 A. It is more towards the street side. There is a vacuum 21 A. Yes, I do. 21 right there, you can see the top of it. I was sitting there 22 Q. All right. Do they fairly and accurately depict the 22 reading the newspaper. 23 scenes that they are purporting to depict? 23 MS. HARTMANN: All right. Permission to publish 24 A. Sure. 24 to the jury? 25 25 MS. HARTMANN: Your Honor, at this time the State THE COURT: You may. Page 204 Page 202 1 would offer State's Exhibit 114. 1 (Pause in the proceedings) MR. RAY: No objection to 114. 2 MS. HARTMANN: May I have just one moment, Your 3 THE COURT: 114 is admitted. 3 Honor? (State's Exhibit No. 114 received) (Pause in the proceedings) Q. Let me ask you, sir, on Main Street down from Cowboy Q. Let me ask you this, Mr. Turner. Monday morning when 6 Inn, is there a Kentucky Fried Chicken? you went into his room, did he offer you and the lady that you A. Yes, going south. 7 were with, did he offer either one of you any of the remnants of Q. For the record, the top photograph in State's 114, 8 the chicken? 9 what is that showing? A. Yes, he did. There was a lot of chicken left, and he A. The El Triangulo nightclub. 10 told us we were more than welcome to have it. 11 Q. All right. And in the distance in the top photograph, 11 Q. Do you know whether or not that evening before, other 12 can you see the sign for the Cowboy Inn and the car wash --12 people were carrying any food or eating -- had he offered it to 13 A. Yes, ma'am. 13 other people? 14 Q. -- just down the road? 14 A. This one girl told me --15 A. Yes. 15 Q. Okay. You can't say what other people said. Did you Q. The second photograph in State's 114, is that a 16 see other people coming out of his room with food? 17 closeup of the Cowboy Inn and car wash? 17 A. Yes, Sunday night. 18 A. Yes. 18 MS. HARTMANN: Okay. Thank you, Mr. Turner. 19 Q. This Car Care car wash, is that where you were located 19 We'll pass the witness. 20 when you first saw the Defendant? 20 CROSS-EXAMINATION 21 A. Yes, ma'am. 21 BY MR. RAY: 22 Q. These bottom two photographs depict two views of the . 22 Q. How are you doing there, Mr. Turner? 23 car wash itself? 23 A. I'm fine. 24 A. Yes. 24 Q. You are up there in the state jail right now; is that 25 Q. Where you were located when you saw the Defendant, can 25 right?

Page 56 of 64 A. Yes, sir. A. No, sir. Q. You said you were up there for selling drugs or 2 O. Did they tell you how it was that they knew about you? 3 possession of drugs? 3 How did they know you were -- how did they know you knew Billy A. Delivery of a controlled substance. Q. Delivery? 5 A. You know, I never asked that question, sir. A. Yes, sir. Q. Did it seem kind of odd you were just sitting over Q. And you got a 180 day sentence for that crime, right? 7 there in jail one day and somebody shows up from the DA's A. Yes, sir. 8 office, says, "We had a big camera on you, and we saw you and Q. And you said you were due to get out in two months or 9 Billy Jack together"? 10 four months? 10 A. Not really, sir. 11 A. Two months. Q. Okay. Q. Two months. And in state jail felonies, you have to 12 A. Because for the last two years, my wife and I have 13 do them day for day. Do you understand that? 13 been separated and I have been in and around the motel for the A. Day for day. 14 last two years. And almost anything that goes on around there, Q. Did you get out of jail after you committed that 15 I'm usually aware of what goes on. 16 offense before you got sentenced? In other words -- well, what 16 Q. Where are you from? 17 I am leading up to is when did you get arrested for that 17 A. Originally from Indiana. 18 offense? 18 Q. How did you get to Fort Worth? A. In June, sir. 19 A. Job, employment. Q. Where were you when you got arrested? 20 O. Okay. Well, were you working when you got arrested A. At the Cowboy motel. 21 for selling drugs? Q. Okay. Now, you were at the Cowboy motel. Do you 22 A. No, sir, I wasn't. 23 remember exactly what day it was? 23 Q. How long had it been since you had a job until you got A. When I got arrested? 24 arrested for selling drugs? Q. Yeah. 25 A. Well, I had been working off and on. I do temp work, Page 208 Page 206 A. It was on a Thursday day, I believe. 1 contract labor. Q. Do you remember what number the day was? Q. Do a lot of people that live on the street kind of A. June 8. 3 funnel in and out of the Cowboy Motel? Q. Okay. Got arrested on June 8, and you have been in 4 A. Yes, they do. 5 jail ever since then, right? Q. Tell the jury what kind of hotel this is. We have A. Yes. 6 seen some pictures of it. Who stays there, what kind of folks Q. When did you settle your case with the District 7 are there, do they stay a long time --8 Attorney? A. It's a mix of people that stay there. You have a lot A. July. 9 of homeless - you have some homeless people, you have some Q. Do you remember about what day that was? 10 transient people, you have people that have circumstances that A. July 8. 11 require them to seek temporary housing daily, weekly or Q. Do you remember when it was you first talked to the 12 monthly. So it is a mix of people. 13 DA's office and maybe an investigator or some police officer O. The day Billy Jack here left and went to work, that 14 about testifying for the State? 14 was on a Monday, right? A. I don't remember the exact date, no, sir. 15 A. Yes, sir. Q. And he was leaving and you were there with some lady, Q. About when was it? 16 A. About five or six weeks ago -- about five weeks ago. 17 right? Q. Was it before your case was disposed of? 18 A. No. 19 Q. And he told you y'all could have the room until 11:00 Q. It was after your case was disposed of? 20 o'clock?

21

22

23

24

25

Q. Okay. You -- how did you communicate with the DA's

23 office? Did they call you, or did you call them?

Q. Had you sent any kind of message to them?

A. They contacted me.

A. Yes, sir.

A. It was a little before 7:00.

A. What were we doing?

Q. And what time was it that y'all had that conversation?

O. Okay. And what are you and that lady doing?

1

2

5

6

7

8

11

12

14

15

19

20

21

22

24

25

1

2

3

7

9

10

11

12

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

24

25

Page 205 - Page 208

Document & Condense It, Page 57 of 64 Page 211 1 Q. Yeah. O. Where is that located? 2 A. We were just hanging out at that time. 2 A. Downtown Fort Worth. 3 Q. Okay. Well, what were you going to do with the motel 3 O. Is that, in fact, located in the Tandy Center? 4 room? 5 5 O. What were your duties back in April of this year at A. Eat and sleep. Q. Okay. Eating chicken and sleep. 6 the Factory Brand Shoe Store? 7、 A. Okay. A. I am an assistant manager there. Q. Were you tired? O. I want to direct your attention specifically to Monday 9 morning at about 10:30, 10:40 in the morning. Were you working A. I had been up all night, yes, sir. 10 Q. Okay. Now, you said you were going to take Billy Jack 10 on that day? 11 his cell phone, right? 11 A. Yes, I was. 12 A. Yes, sir. 12 O. What time actually does the Factory Brand Shoe Store 13 Q. Where were you going to take it? 13 open? 14 A. If he was going to catch a bus, I knew where the bus 14 A. 10:00 o'clock. 15 was, and he had to walk downhill approximately four blocks --15 Q. And I will direct your attention specifically to April 16 O. Okay? 16 7 of this year. Did you have a -- well, let me ask you this. 17 A. -- so I could have caught him and given him his cell 17 In the mornings is it generally -- is there generally a lot of 18 phone. 18 business, or is it kind of slow? 19 19 Q. But you didn't, and he just eventually came back --A. It is kind of slow. 20 A. It was just a matter of a couple of minutes. He came 20 Q. All right. Did you have an older man come into your 21 right back to the room. 21 store looking to purchase a pair of tennis shoes? 22 Q. Okay. Is -- did you have any correspondence with the 22 A. Yes. 23 DA's office --23 Q. Okay. And did this man eventually pick out, or 24 A. I'm sorry. I can't hear you, sir. 24 select, a pair of shoes? Q. I'll repeat the question. I'm sorry I didn't speak 25 A. Yes. Page 210 Page 212 1 loud enough. 1 Q. And did he purchase a pair of shoes? Did you ever talk to the DA's office other than 2 A. Yes, he did. 3 in person? Did you ever give them any kind of written statement 3 Q. How did he pay for those shoes? 4 or talk to them? 4 A. Credit card. A. No. sir. 5 Q. Did you notice anything unusual about the man and the Q. Okay. And is there any kind of deal for your 6 name on the credit card? 7 testimony? A. It was a female's name, and other than that he had 8 A. No. sir. 8 like a duffle bag with him. 9 MR. RAY: I believe that's all. Pass the Q. All right. And did you ask him -- when you noticed 10 witness. 10 the fact that the credit card had a woman's name on it and he 11 MS. HARTMANN: The State has nothing further. 11 was a man, did you ask anything in particular about 12 Thank you. 12 identification? 13 THE COURT: You may step down, sir. 13 A. Yes, I did. 14 MS. HARTMANN: The State calls Loretta Angram. 14 Q. What did you ask for? 15 (Witness Sworn) 15 A. I asked, "Can I see your identification?" 16 Whereupon, 16 Q. And did he provide any identification to you? 17 17 LORETTA ANGRAM. A. No, he did not. 18 having been first duly sworn, testified as follows: 18 Q. Did he give you an explanation for why he didn't have 19 DIRECT EXAMINATION 19 any ID? 20 BY MS. HARTMANN: 20 A. Yes. He said something about he left it in his 21 Q. Could you state your name, please? 21 other -- like he changed clothes or something like that. 22 A. Loretta Angram, A-n-g-r-a-m. 22 Q. All right. Did he make any comments to you about why 23 Q. I want to direct your attention back to April of this 23 he was getting this pair of shoes? 24 year and ask you where you were working. 24 A. He said something about -- I'm not sure if he meant A. Factory Brand Shoes. 25 somebody and him were in earlier and I wasn't there, or the fact

1 that somebody was supposed to be letting him get some shoes or 1 THE COURT: You may. 2 something and he figured since he was downtown, he would go 2 MS. HARTMANN: Thank you. 3 The State calls Denise Schrader. 3 ahead and get them himself. Q. Did he mention anything about his aunt? 4 (Witness Sworn) A. Yes, something about -- he said, "My aunt said I could 5 Whereupon, 6 get these," or something like that. DENISE SCHRADER, Q. All right. Do you see anybody here in the courtroom 7 having been first duly sworn, testified as follows: 8 that you recognize to be the man who walked in the Factory Brand 8 DIRECT EXAMINATION 9 Shoe Store in the Tandy Center back on April 7 of this year? 9 BY MS. HARTMANN: 10 A. Right there. Q. Could you state your name for the jury? 10 11 Q. And you pointed. Can you describe where that person 11 A. Denise Schrader. 12 is located and something they are wearing? O. I want to direct your the attention back to the date 12 13 A. On the end with that pinkish, purplish looking shirt. 13 of April 7 of this year, 2003. Where were you working? 14 14 A. At Razoo's on Third and Main. MS. HARTMANN: Your Honor, at this time may the 15 record reflect that the witness has identified the Defendant? O. Third and Main here in Fort Worth? 15 16 A. Uh-huh. THE COURT: It will. 16 17 MS. HARTMANN: May I approach the witness? 17 Q. Is that yes? 18 THE COURT: Yes. A. Yes. 18 19 Q. I just need you to answer out loud because there is a Q. I am going to show you, Ms. Angram, what's previously 19 20 been marked for identification purposes as State's Exhibit No. 20 court reporter here, and he can only take down spoken words. 21 132 and ask you to take a look at that, please. 21 Okay? 22 A. Okay. 22 A. Yes. 23 Q. Do you recognize State's Exhibit 132? 23 Q. All right. Let me ask you, did you work at Razoo's 24 A. Yes. 24 back on April 7 of this year? 25 Q. What do you recognize it to be? 25 A. Yes, I did. Page 214 Page 216 A. It is our receipt from when you make a purchase. Q. Do you recall what hours you worked --1 Q. All right. And do you recognize this receipt as being A. I have always worked 9:00 to 6:00. 2 3 the one that was issued -- or I guess a copy of -- to the 3 Q. Would that be 9:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m.? 4 Defendant who you just identified? 4 A. Yes. 5 A. Yes. O. Did a man come into the bar area of Razoo's and sit Q. Other than the State's Exhibit sticker that's been put 6 down to place an order? 7 here at the top, is it an exact duplicate or copy? A. Yes. A. Yes. This is my employee number right here; and also, Q. And were you busy at that time or was it slow or what? 9 we don't have the machine that lets you print the credit card, 9 A. No, it was slow. 10 so I scratched it with a pencil. 10 Q. Did you yourself take an order from this gentleman? 11 MS. HARTMANN: All right. Your Honor, at this 11 A. Yes, I did. 12 time the State would offer State's Exhibit 132. 12 Q. Do you recall what this particular gentleman ordered? 13 MR. MOORE: No objection. 13 A. It was a draft beer and something to go. 14 THE COURT: 132 is admitted. 14 Q. Did this man introduce himself to you? 15 (State's Exhibit No. 132 received) 15 A. Yes, he did. 16 Q. Did you, in fact, give State's Exhibit 132 to a 16 Q. What name did he give you? 17 Detective McCaskill with the Fort Worth Police Department? 17 A. Billy. 18 A. Yes, I did. 18 Q. The name Billy? 19 Q. And other than what you have just testified to, you 19 A. Yes. 20 have no knowledge of the Defendant either before or after. Q. Did he tell you any information about what his plans 20 21 A. No, I do not. 21 were as far as staying in town or leaving or what? 22 MS. HARTMANN: We pass the witness at this time. 22 A. He was catching a bus out of town. 23 MR. MOORE: We don't have any questions. 23 Q. What was his general demeanor when you dealt with 24 24 him? THE COURT: You may step down, ma'am. 25 MS. HARTMANN: May this witness be excused? 25 A. He was calm and collected and just drank his beer.

	Condo	an er	It TM
Г	Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Cende		763/17 Page 59 of 64 PageID 4695 Page 219
1	Page 217 Q. Drank his beer?		Q. Does your employee number appear?
	-	1	
2	A. Uh-huh.	2	A. No.
3	Q. Is that yes?	3	Q. Okay. Do you recognize the receipt as being this
4	A. Yes.	1	receipt as being the one that was generated for the transaction
5	Q. Okay. Do you see anybody here today in the courtroom	Į .	involving the Defendant?
	that you recognize to be the man who came in and placed this	6	
7	order for a cheeseburger and a draft beer?	7	Q. Other than the State's Exhibit sticker, 135, is it a
8	A. Yes.	8	fair and accurate copy?
9	Q. Where is that person located?	9	A. Yes.
10	A. Right there.	10	MS. HARTMANN: Your Honor, at this time we'd
11	Q. And you are pointing you are pointing in that	11	offer State's 135.
12	direction?	12	VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION
13	A. In the pink shirt.	13	BY MR. RAY:
14	Q. Okay. Is this the person that you served	14	Q. You are telling us that this receipt that's dated
15	A. I believe so.	15	April 7 of this year represents the food that you sold to this
16	Q. Does it look like him?	16	man that morning?
17	A. A little cleaner.	17	A. Yes.
18	Q. Cleaner now?	18	Q. And you are absolutely sure of that?
19	A. Yes.	19	A. Yes.
20	Q. Other than that, is that him?	20	MR. RAY: No objection.
21	A. Yes.	21	THE COURT: No. 135 is admitted.
22	MS. HARTMANN: Your Honor, at this time I would	22	(State's Exhibit No. 135 received)
	request the record reflect that she has identified the	23	MS. HARTMANN: May I proceed?
	Defendant.	24	THE COURT: You may.
25	MR. RAY: I would like to take her on voir dire.	25	DIRECT EXAMINATION CONTINUED
F	Page 218	 	Page 220
	THE COURT: You may.	l .	BY MS. HARTMANN:
2	VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION	2	Q. Is there a name listed for the guest I guess the
1	BY MR. RAY:	_	person who is being served?
1		١.	•
7	Q. Ma'am, it ultimately comes down to this. You have	4	A. Always.
l .	identified the man here to my left. What the prosecutor is	5	Q. What name appears on State's Exhibit 135?
١.	asking you and what I want to know is are you absolutely sure	6	A. Billy.
1	that he's the person that you are talking about.	7	Q. All right. And did you turn in State's 135 to a
8	A. Pretty sure, yes.	l	Detective McCaskill with the Fort Worth Police Department?
9	Q. Okay. Well, I don't want to mince words with you, but	9	A. Yes.
	are you absolutely sure or something else? Can you say for	10	MS. HARTMANN: We'll pass the witness.
i	certain?	11	CROSS-EXAMINATION
12	A. Yes.	12	BY MR. RAY:
13	MS. HARTMANN: May I approach the witness?	13	Q. How long had you been working at Razoo's back in
14	THE COURT: Yes.	14	April?
15	DIRECT EXAMINATION CONTINUED	15	A. Two years.
16	Q. Ms. Schrader, I'm going to show you what's been	16	Q. Doing the same thing that you were doing then?
17	previously marked for identification purposes as State's Exhibit	17	A. Yes.
18	135 and ask you to take a look at that. Can you identify	18	Q. If a person walks in and gives you a credit card, do
19	State's Exhibit 135?	19	y'all look at it when they give it to you?
20	A. Yes.	20	A. No.
21	Q. How do you recognize it?	21	Q. Okay. So if I walk in with a card that says Mary
22	A. The time and the date and the amount.	22	Wilson on it, you just take the card anyway?
23	Q. Is there any identification like the employee	23	A. Usually, yes.
1	number, does that appear on this sheet?	24	MR. RAY: I'll pass the witness.
1	A. Yes.	ŀ	MS. HARTMANN: We don't have anything further.
25	A. 163.	25	MS HARIMANN: WE DON'T have anvining timper

	O 1-		TA TM
_	Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87		
	Page 221	1	Page 223
	THE COURT: You may step down, ma'am.	1	looked like?
2	MS. HARTMANN: May she be excused?	2	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
3	THE COURT: She may.	1	hair.
4	MS. HARTMANN: Thank you.	4	
5	MS CALLAGHAN: The State would call Rosalee	5	
	Dailey.	6	
7	(Witness Sworn)	7	, 3
8	Whereupon,	8	
9	, ROSALEE DAILEY,	9	
ı	having been first duly sworn, testified as follows:	10	to buy a drink. And we do not accept credit cards, so he asked
11	DIRECT EXAMINATION	11	
12		12	
13	Q. Could you state your name for the ladies and	13	Q. Okay. After taking orders, did he then leave?
1	gentlemen?	14	
15	A. Rosalee Dailey.	15	
16	Q. You can move that microphone back a little bit so you	16	him in the Elbow Room?
17		17	-
18	A. All right.	18	
19		19	• •
20		20	Q. Could you tell the ladies and gentlemen what he was
21	Q. What is the Elbow Room?	21	wearing?
22	A. A bar.	22	
23	Q. Does it have individual bars within that bar?	23	Shack" on it in black letters.
24	A. Yes.	24	
25	Q. How many are inside?	25	Room April 8 of 2003 and April 9 of 2003 in the courtroom here
ł		ı	
ì	Page 222	}	Page 224
1	Page 222 A. Three.	1	Page 224 today?
1 2	•	1 2	today?
1	A. Three.	3	today? A. Yes. Q. Can you point to him and describe an article of
2	A. Three. Q. Do they have separate names or	3	today? A. Yes.
3 4	A. Three.Q. Do they have separate names orA. Yes, they do.	3	today? A. Yes. Q. Can you point to him and describe an article of clothing he's wearing?
2 3 4 5	A. Three.Q. Do they have separate names orA. Yes, they do.Q. We have to talk one at a time. So if you will	3 4	today? A. Yes. Q. Can you point to him and describe an article of clothing he's wearing? A. Pink shirt.
2 3 4 5	 A. Three. Q. Do they have separate names or A. Yes, they do. Q. We have to talk one at a time. So if you will besitate just a minute after I ask the question and then go 	2 3 4 5	today? A. Yes. Q. Can you point to him and describe an article of clothing he's wearing? A. Pink shirt. Q. Could you point to him?
2 3 4 5 6	A. Three. Q. Do they have separate names or A. Yes, they do. Q. We have to talk one at a time. So if you will besitate just a minute after I ask the question and then go ahead and answer.	2 3 4 5 6	today? A. Yes. Q. Can you point to him and describe an article of clothing he's wearing? A. Pink shirt. Q. Could you point to him? A. Right there.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	 A. Three. Q. Do they have separate names or A. Yes, they do. Q. We have to talk one at a time. So if you will hesitate just a minute after I ask the question and then go ahead and answer. A. Okay. 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	today? A. Yes. Q. Can you point to him and describe an article of clothing he's wearing? A. Pink shirt. Q. Could you point to him? A. Right there.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	A. Three. Q. Do they have separate names or A. Yes, they do. Q. We have to talk one at a time. So if you will besitate just a minute after I ask the question and then go ahead and answer. A. Okay. Q. These three individual bars within the Elbow Room, what are they called? A. There's the Elbow Back Bar, Elbow Restaurant and Elbow	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	A. Yes. Q. Can you point to him and describe an article of clothing he's wearing? A. Pink shirt. Q. Could you point to him? A. Right there. MS. CALLAGHAN: May the record reflect that she's identified the Defendant, Billy Jack Crutsinger?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	A. Three. Q. Do they have separate names or A. Yes, they do. Q. We have to talk one at a time. So if you will besitate just a minute after I ask the question and then go ahead and answer. A. Okay. Q. These three individual bars within the Elbow Room, what are they called? A. There's the Elbow Back Bar, Elbow Restaurant and Elbow Club.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	A. Yes. Q. Can you point to him and describe an article of clothing he's wearing? A. Pink shirt. Q. Could you point to him? A. Right there. MS. CALLAGHAN: May the record reflect that she's identified the Defendant, Billy Jack Crutsinger?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	A. Three. Q. Do they have separate names or A. Yes, they do. Q. We have to talk one at a time. So if you will besitate just a minute after I ask the question and then go ahead and answer. A. Okay. Q. These three individual bars within the Elbow Room, what are they called? A. There's the Elbow Back Bar, Elbow Restaurant and Elbow	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	A. Yes. Q. Can you point to him and describe an article of clothing he's wearing? A. Pink shirt. Q. Could you point to him? A. Right there. MS. CALLAGHAN: May the record reflect that she's identified the Defendant, Billy Jack Crutsinger? THE COURT: It will.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	A. Three. Q. Do they have separate names or A. Yes, they do. Q. We have to talk one at a time. So if you will besitate just a minute after I ask the question and then go ahead and answer. A. Okay. Q. These three individual bars within the Elbow Room, what are they called? A. There's the Elbow Back Bar, Elbow Restaurant and Elbow Club. Q. Okay. How long have you worked there? A. A year, over a year.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	A. Yes. Q. Can you point to him and describe an article of clothing he's wearing? A. Pink shirt. Q. Could you point to him? A. Right there. MS. CALLAGHAN: May the record reflect that she's identified the Defendant, Billy Jack Crutsinger? THE COURT: It will. Q. Now, on April 8 when you talked to him about the credit card and he was in there taking cigarette orders, did he
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	A. Three. Q. Do they have separate names or A. Yes, they do. Q. We have to talk one at a time. So if you will besitate just a minute after I ask the question and then go ahead and answer. A. Okay. Q. These three individual bars within the Elbow Room, what are they called? A. There's the Elbow Back Bar, Elbow Restaurant and Elbow Club. Q. Okay. How long have you worked there? A. A year, over a year. Q. And what do you do for them?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	A. Yes. Q. Can you point to him and describe an article of clothing he's wearing? A. Pink shirt. Q. Could you point to him? A. Right there. MS. CALLAGHAN: May the record reflect that she's identified the Defendant, Billy Jack Crutsinger? THE COURT: It will. Q. Now, on April 8 when you talked to him about the credit card and he was in there taking cigarette orders, did he appear intoxicated to you?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	A. Three. Q. Do they have separate names or A. Yes, they do. Q. We have to talk one at a time. So if you will besitate just a minute after I ask the question and then go ahead and answer. A. Okay. Q. These three individual bars within the Elbow Room, what are they called? A. There's the Elbow Back Bar, Elbow Restaurant and Elbow Club. Q. Okay. How long have you worked there? A. A year, over a year.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	A. Yes. Q. Can you point to him and describe an article of clothing he's wearing? A. Pink shirt. Q. Could you point to him? A. Right there. MS. CALLAGHAN: May the record reflect that she's identified the Defendant, Billy Jack Crutsinger? THE COURT: It will. Q. Now, on April 8 when you talked to him about the credit card and he was in there taking cigarette orders, did he appear intoxicated to you? A. No. Q. What was his emotional state like?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	A. Three. Q. Do they have separate names or A. Yes, they do. Q. We have to talk one at a time. So if you will besitate just a minute after I ask the question and then go ahead and answer. A. Okay. Q. These three individual bars within the Elbow Room, what are they called? A. There's the Elbow Back Bar, Elbow Restaurant and Elbow Club. Q. Okay. How long have you worked there? A. A year, over a year. Q. And what do you do for them?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	A. Yes. Q. Can you point to him and describe an article of clothing he's wearing? A. Pink shirt. Q. Could you point to him? A. Right there. MS. CALLAGHAN: May the record reflect that she's identified the Defendant, Billy Jack Crutsinger? THE COURT: It will. Q. Now, on April 8 when you talked to him about the credit card and he was in there taking cigarette orders, did he appear intoxicated to you? A. No. Q. What was his emotional state like?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	A. Three. Q. Do they have separate names or A. Yes, they do. Q. We have to talk one at a time. So if you will hesitate just a minute after I ask the question and then go ahead and answer. A. Okay. Q. These three individual bars within the Elbow Room, what are they called? A. There's the Elbow Back Bar, Elbow Restaurant and Elbow Club. Q. Okay. How long have you worked there? A. A year, over a year. Q. And what do you do for them? A. I'm a bartender.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	A. Yes. Q. Can you point to him and describe an article of clothing he's wearing? A. Pink shirt. Q. Could you point to him? A. Right there. MS. CALLAGHAN: May the record reflect that she's identified the Defendant, Billy Jack Crutsinger? THE COURT: It will. Q. Now, on April 8 when you talked to him about the credit card and he was in there taking cigarette orders, did he appear intoxicated to you? A. No. Q. What was his emotional state like? A. It was fine as far as — he looked fine, no emotional
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	A. Three. Q. Do they have separate names or A. Yes, they do. Q. We have to talk one at a time. So if you will hesitate just a minute after I ask the question and then go ahead and answer. A. Okay. Q. These three individual bars within the Elbow Room, what are they called? A. There's the Elbow Back Bar, Elbow Restaurant and Elbow Club. Q. Okay. How long have you worked there? A. A year, over a year. Q. And what do you do for them? A. I'm a bartender. Q. Were you working at the Elbow Room in April of 2003? A. Yes. Q. Let's go to April 8 of 2003. Were you working at one	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	A. Yes. Q. Can you point to him and describe an article of clothing he's wearing? A. Pink shirt. Q. Could you point to him? A. Right there. MS. CALLAGHAN: May the record reflect that she's identified the Defendant, Billy Jack Crutsinger? THE COURT: It will. Q. Now, on April 8 when you talked to him about the credit card and he was in there taking cigarette orders, did he appear intoxicated to you? A. No. Q. What was his emotional state like? A. It was fine as far as — he looked fine, no emotional state at all. Happy go lucky and just a regular, you know, patron.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. Three. Q. Do they have separate names or A. Yes, they do. Q. We have to talk one at a time. So if you will besitate just a minute after I ask the question and then go ahead and answer. A. Okay. Q. These three individual bars within the Elbow Room, what are they called? A. There's the Elbow Back Bar, Elbow Restaurant and Elbow Club. Q. Okay. How long have you worked there? A. A year, over a year. Q. And what do you do for them? A. I'm a bartender. Q. Were you working at the Elbow Room in April of 2003? A. Yes. Q. Let's go to April 8 of 2003. Were you working at one of those bars on April 8?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	A. Yes. Q. Can you point to him and describe an article of clothing he's wearing? A. Pink shirt. Q. Could you point to him? A. Right there. MS. CALLAGHAN: May the record reflect that she's identified the Defendant, Billy Jack Crutsinger? THE COURT: It will. Q. Now, on April 8 when you talked to him about the credit card and he was in there taking cigarette orders, did he appear intoxicated to you? A. No. Q. What was his emotional state like? A. It was fine as far as — he looked fine, no emotional state at all. Happy go lucky and just a regular, you know,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	A. Three. Q. Do they have separate names or A. Yes, they do. Q. We have to talk one at a time. So if you will hesitate just a minute after I ask the question and then go ahead and answer. A. Okay. Q. These three individual bars within the Elbow Room, what are they called? A. There's the Elbow Back Bar, Elbow Restaurant and Elbow Club. Q. Okay. How long have you worked there? A. A year, over a year. Q. And what do you do for them? A. I'm a bartender. Q. Were you working at the Elbow Room in April of 2003? A. Yes. Q. Let's go to April 8 of 2003. Were you working at one	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. Yes. Q. Can you point to him and describe an article of clothing he's wearing? A. Pink shirt. Q. Could you point to him? A. Right there. Ms. CALLAGHAN: May the record reflect that she's identified the Defendant, Billy Jack Crutsinger? THE COURT: It will. Q. Now, on April 8 when you talked to him about the credit card and he was in there taking cigarette orders, did he appear intoxicated to you? A. No. Q. What was his emotional state like? A. It was fine as far as — he looked fine, no emotional state at all. Happy go lucky and just a regular, you know, patron.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A. Three. Q. Do they have separate names or A. Yes, they do. Q. We have to talk one at a time. So if you will hesitate just a minute after I ask the question and then go ahead and answer. A. Okay. Q. These three individual bars within the Elbow Room, what are they called? A. There's the Elbow Back Bar, Elbow Restaurant and Elbow Club. Q. Okay. How long have you worked there? A. A year, over a year. Q. And what do you do for them? A. I'm a bartender. Q. Were you working at the Elbow Room in April of 2003? A. Yes. Q. Let's go to April 8 of 2003. Were you working at one of those bars on April 8? A. Yes. Q. Which of the bars were you working on that day?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	A. Yes. Q. Can you point to him and describe an article of clothing he's wearing? A. Pink shirt. Q. Could you point to him? A. Right there. MS. CALLAGHAN: May the record reflect that she's identified the Defendant, Billy Jack Crutsinger? THE COURT: It will. Q. Now, on April 8 when you talked to him about the credit card and he was in there taking cigarette orders, did he appear intoxicated to you? A. No. Q. What was his emotional state like? A. It was fine as far as — he looked fine, no emotional state at all. Happy go lucky and just a regular, you know, patron. MS. CALLAGHAN: Pass the witness. CROSS-EXAMINATION
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A. Three. Q. Do they have separate names or A. Yes, they do. Q. We have to talk one at a time. So if you will hesitate just a minute after I ask the question and then go ahead and answer. A. Okay. Q. These three individual bars within the Elbow Room, what are they called? A. There's the Elbow Back Bar, Elbow Restaurant and Elbow Club. Q. Okay. How long have you worked there? A. A year, over a year. Q. And what do you do for them? A. I'm a bartender. Q. Were you working at the Elbow Room in April of 2003? A. Yes. Q. Let's go to April 8 of 2003. Were you working at one of those bars on April 8? A. Yes.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	A. Yes. Q. Can you point to him and describe an article of clothing he's wearing? A. Pink shirt. Q. Could you point to him? A. Right there. MS. CALLAGHAN: May the record reflect that she's identified the Defendant, Billy Jack Crutsinger? THE COURT: It will. Q. Now, on April 8 when you talked to him about the credit card and he was in there taking cigarette orders, did he appear intoxicated to you? A. No. Q. What was his emotional state like? A. It was fine as far as — he looked fine, no emotional state at all. Happy go lucky and just a regular, you know, patron. MS. CALLAGHAN: Pass the witness. CROSS-EXAMINATION
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A. Three. Q. Do they have separate names or A. Yes, they do. Q. We have to talk one at a time. So if you will hesitate just a minute after I ask the question and then go ahead and answer. A. Okay. Q. These three individual bars within the Elbow Room, what are they called? A. There's the Elbow Back Bar, Elbow Restaurant and Elbow Club. Q. Okay. How long have you worked there? A. A year, over a year. Q. And what do you do for them? A. I'm a bartender. Q. Were you working at the Elbow Room in April of 2003? A. Yes. Q. Let's go to April 8 of 2003. Were you working at one of those bars on April 8? A. Yes. Q. Which of the bars were you working on that day?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A. Yes. Q. Can you point to him and describe an article of clothing he's wearing? A. Pink shirt. Q. Could you point to him? A. Right there. MS. CALLAGHAN: May the record reflect that she's identified the Defendant, Billy Jack Crutsinger? THE COURT: It will. Q. Now, on April 8 when you talked to him about the credit card and he was in there taking cigarette orders, did he appear intoxicated to you? A. No. Q. What was his emotional state like? A. It was fine as far as — he looked fine, no emotional state at all. Happy go lucky and just a regular, you know, patron. MS. CALLAGHAN: Pass the witness. CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. MOORE:
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	A. Three. Q. Do they have separate names or A. Yes, they do. Q. We have to talk one at a time. So if you will besitate just a minute after I ask the question and then go ahead and answer. A. Okay. Q. These three individual bars within the Elbow Room, what are they called? A. There's the Elbow Back Bar, Elbow Restaurant and Elbow Club. Q. Okay. How long have you worked there? A. A year, over a year. Q. And what do you do for them? A. I'm a bartender. Q. Were you working at the Elbow Room in April of 2003? A. Yes. Q. Let's go to April 8 of 2003. Were you working at one of those bars on April 8? A. Yes. Q. Which of the bars were you working on that day? A. In the restaurant. Q. Did you see a man that day that caught your attention? A. Yes.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A. Yes. Q. Can you point to him and describe an article of clothing he's wearing? A. Pink shirt. Q. Could you point to him? A. Right there. MS. CALLAGHAN: May the record reflect that she's identified the Defendant, Billy Jack Crutsinger? THE COURT: It will. Q. Now, on April 8 when you talked to him about the credit card and he was in there taking cigarette orders, did he appear intoxicated to you? A. No. Q. What was his emotional state like? A. It was fine as far as — he looked fine, no emotional state at all. Happy go lucky and just a regular, you know, patron. MS. CALLAGHAN: Pass the witness. CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. MOORE: Q. Ms. Dailey, had you ever seen this person before?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	A. Three. Q. Do they have separate names or — A. Yes, they do. Q. We have to talk one at a time. So if you will besitate just a minute after I ask the question and then go ahead and answer. A. Okay. Q. These three individual bars within the Elbow Room, what are they called? A. There's the Elbow Back Bar, Elbow Restaurant and Elbow Club. Q. Okay. How long have you worked there? A. A year, over a year. Q. And what do you do for them? A. I'm a bartender. Q. Were you working at the Elbow Room in April of 2003? A. Yes. Q. Let's go to April 8 of 2003. Were you working at one of those bars on April 8? A. Yes. Q. Which of the bars were you working on that day? A. In the restaurant. Q. Did you see a man that day that caught your attention?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	A. Yes. Q. Can you point to him and describe an article of clothing he's wearing? A. Pink shirt. Q. Could you point to him? A. Right there. MS. CALLAGHAN: May the record reflect that she's identified the Defendant, Billy Jack Crutsinger? THE COURT: It will. Q. Now, on April 8 when you talked to him about the credit card and he was in there taking cigarette orders, did he appear intoxicated to you? A. No. Q. What was his emotional state like? A. It was fine as far as — he looked fine, no emotional state at all. Happy go lucky and just a regular, you know, patron. MS. CALLAGHAN: Pass the witness. CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. MOORE: Q. Ms. Dailey, had you ever seen this person before? A. No, sir.

Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Condense 1/03/17 Page 61 of 64 Page ID 4697 Page 225 Page 227 A. Prior to that, about six months, seven months. 1 A. Okay. Q. Are you from Galveston? 2 O. Were you working at the Elbow Room as a bartender 3 A. Yes, sir. 3 then? Q. And that Elbow Room, it is one building that's just --A. I was working there then, yes. 4 5 you can just walk right through a door, and there is another O. Specifically directing your attention to the day of 6 bar, right? 6 April 8, were you in the Elbow Room with your ex-husband? A. Yes, sir. 7 A. Yes. Q. Why is it separated into three different 8 O. And what had you-all just done? 9 establishments? A. We had wired money to my son. 9 A. I have no idea. That's the way it is. I have no Q. Where does your son live or where did he live at that 10 11 idea. 11 time? 12 Q. When this person presented the credit card, did you 12 A. He still does. He lives in Arizona. 13 look at it? 13 O. Does he live in Phoenix? 14 A. No, he did not show it. 14 A. Yes. 15 Q. He just asked if you took credit cards? 15 Q. And you had to wire him some money? 16 16 A. Yes, ma'am. 17 Q. I got you. 17 Q. Were there any arrangements for you to check in with 18 And what time on April 9 did you see him in 18 him to see if, in fact, he had gotten the money? 19 there? 19 A. I made arrangements to let him know he could pick up 20 A. It was in the morning time. I would say before 12:00, 20 the money because I wasn't for sure how long it would take. 21 12:30. 21 Q. How were you going to do that? 22 MR. MOORE: Thank you, ma'am. 22 A. I was going to call him and let him know. 23 Pass the witness. 23 Q. And did you have a cell phone? 24 MS. CALLAGHAN: The State has no further 24 A. No, I did not. 25 questions. 25 Q. Did your ex-husband have a cell phone? Page 228 Page 226 Your Honor, this witness has come up to attend 1 A. No, ma'am. 2 from Galveston. May she be released to return to Galveston? 2 Q. Did either one of you have any type of calling card or 3 THE COURT: She may. 3 way to make that long distance phone call to your son in MS. HARTMANN: The State calls Lynn White. 4 Phoenix, Arizona? (Witness Sworn) A. My ex-husband had a phone card he was going to let me 6 Whereupon, 6 use, but he couldn't find it. 7 LYNN WHITE, Q. While you were at the bar, were you sitting at a table 8 having been first duly sworn, testified as follows: 8 or at the bar itself? 9 DIRECT EXAMINATION A. At the bar. 10 BY MS. HARTMANN: 10 Q. Was there anybody else in the bar in addition to you 11 Q. Would you state your name, please? 11 and your ex-husband? 12 A. Lynn White. 12 A. Yes, ma'am. 13 Q. What city do you live in? 13 Q. Was it a man, woman? 14 A. Galveston. 14 15 Q. And what do you -- how are you employed? 15 Q. Was there anybody else sitting next to you-all? 16 A. I work at the Elbow Room. I'm a bartender. 16 A. No, ma'am. 17 Q. The Elbow Room, is that a bar? 17 Q. How were you-all seated, in what order? 18 A. Yes. 18 A. It was a gentleman as you come - as you would be 19 Q. In Galveston? 19 leaving the bar, there was a gentleman, there was my husband and 20 A. Yes, ma'am. 20 there was myself. 21 Q. How long have you worked at the Elbow Bar at 21 Q. All right. When you and your husband --22 Galveston? 22 A. Ex-husband. 23 A. I have worked there for about a month. 23 Q. I'm sorry? 24 Q. I want to direct your attention back to April 8 and 9 24 A. I keep doing it too. 25 of this year. 25 Q. Were you and your ex-husband discussing how you were

	TA TM
	enseIt [™] # 11/03/17 Page 62 of 64 PageID 4698
Page 229	Page 231
1 going to make this call to your son?	1 A. The one at the end.
2 A. Right. He was searching for the card for me to use	2 Q. The far end?
3 because I needed to let him know.	3 A. Far end.
4 Q. Did he ever find it?	4 Q. Does he have a suit jacket on or not?
5 A. No. He found one, but he wasn't for sure if it had	5 A. No, he doesn't.
6 any minutes on it.	6 MS. HARTMANN: Your Honor, at this time may the
7 Q. The gentleman that was sitting next to your husband,	7 record reflect the witness has identified the Defendant?
8 did he offer anything to you and your ex-husband?	8 THE COURT: It will.
9 A. Yes, ma'am. He offered to let me use his cell phone.	9 Ms. HARTMANN: Thank you. We'll pass the
Q. Let me ask you this. Do you know Rosalee Dailey who	1
11 was just in here?	MR. RAY: No questions.
12 A. Yes, ma'am.	THE COURT: You may step down, ma'am.
Q. Was she there at the bar on April 8, 2003?	MS. HARTMANN: May this witness be released to
14 A. Yes.	14 return to Galveston?
Q. The same day that this gentleman offered you use of	15 THE COURT: She may.
16 the phone?	16 MS. HARTMANN: Thank you.
17 A. Yes.	17 MR. RAY: No objection.
Q. Did you, in fact, use the cell phone that this man	MS. HARTMANN: Your Honor, at this time the State
19 offered?	19 would offer State's Exhibit No. 98, business records.
20 A. Yes, I did.	20 MR. RAY: Can I have just a second, Judge?
Q. Did you, in fact, make a phone call to your son in	21 THE COURT: Yes.
22 Phoenix, Arizona?	MR. RAY: Judge, we have a matter we would like
23 A. Yes.	23 to take up outside the presence of the jury just briefly.
24 Q. Is that number 480-430-4144?	24 THE COURT: Can it wait?
25 A. Yes, ma'am.	MR. RAY: It's about this it's about State's
<u></u>	
Page 230	
Page 230 1 Q. How much time passed I guess what period well,	
1	Page 232
1 Q. How much time passed I guess what period well,	Page 232 1 Exhibit 98.
1 Q. How much time passed I guess what period well, 2 let me ask you this. Did you, in fact, put a completed call to	Page 232 1 Exhibit 98. 2 THE COURT: We'll take that up at the end of the
1 Q. How much time passed - I guess what period - well, 2 let me ask you this. Did you, in fact, put a completed call to 3 your son and talk to him?	Page 232 1 Exhibit 98. 2 THE COURT: We'll take that up at the end of the 3 day.
1 Q. How much time passed - I guess what period - well, 2 let me ask you this. Did you, in fact, put a completed call to 3 your son and talk to him? 4 A. Yes, I did.	Page 232 1 Exhibit 98. 2 THE COURT: We'll take that up at the end of the 3 day. 4 MS. HARTMANN: The State would offer State's
1 Q. How much time passed I guess what period well, 2 let me ask you this. Did you, in fact, put a completed call to 3 your son and talk to him? 4 A. Yes, I did. 5 Q. On this cell phone?	Page 232 1 Exhibit 98. 2 THE COURT: We'll take that up at the end of the 3 day. 4 MS. HARTMANN: The State would offer State's 5 Exhibit 100.
1 Q. How much time passed - I guess what period well, 2 let me ask you this. Did you, in fact, put a completed call to 3 your son and talk to him? 4 A. Yes, I did. 5 Q. On this cell phone? 6 A. Yes.	Page 232 1 Exhibit 98. 2 THE COURT: We'll take that up at the end of the 3 day. 4 MS. HARTMANN: The State would offer State's 5 Exhibit 100. 6 MR. RAY: No objection to 100.
1 Q. How much time passed I guess what period well, 2 let me ask you this. Did you, in fact, put a completed call to 3 your son and talk to him? 4 A. Yes, I did. 5 Q. On this cell phone? 6 A. Yes. 7 Q. All right. And how much contact or how long a period	Page 232 1 Exhibit 98. 2 THE COURT: We'll take that up at the end of the 3 day. 4 MS. HARTMANN: The State would offer State's 5 Exhibit 100. 6 MR. RAY: No objection to 100. 7 THE COURT: 100 is admitted
1 Q. How much time passed I guess what period well, 2 let me ask you this. Did you, in fact, put a completed call to 3 your son and talk to him? 4 A. Yes, I did. 5 Q. On this cell phone? 6 A. Yes. 7 Q. All right. And how much contact or how long a period 8 of time were you around this man who loaned you the phone?	Page 232 1 Exhibit 98. 2 THE COURT: We'll take that up at the end of the 3 day. 4 MS. HARTMANN: The State would offer State's 5 Exhibit 100. 6 MR. RAY: No objection to 100. 7 THE COURT: 100 is admitted 8 (State's Exhibit No. 100 received)
Q. How much time passed — I guess what period — well, let me ask you this. Did you, in fact, put a completed call to your son and talk to him? A. Yes, I did. Q. On this cell phone? A. Yes. Q. All right. And how much contact or how long a period of time were you around this man who loaned you the phone? A. Ten or 15 minutes, if that. I really didn't talk to	Page 232 1 Exhibit 98. 2 THE COURT: We'll take that up at the end of the 3 day. 4 MS. HARTMANN: The State would offer State's 5 Exhibit 100. 6 MR. RAY: No objection to 100. 7 THE COURT: 100 is admitted 8 (State's Exhibit No. 100 received) 9 MS. HARTMANN: May I publish by reading orally
1 Q. How much time passed I guess what period well, 2 let me ask you this. Did you, in fact, put a completed call to 3 your son and talk to him? 4 A. Yes, I did. 5 Q. On this cell phone? 6 A. Yes. 7 Q. All right. And how much contact or how long a period 8 of time were you around this man who loaned you the phone? 9 A. Ten or 15 minutes, if that. I really didn't talk to 10 him.	Page 232 1 Exhibit 98. 2 THE COURT: We'll take that up at the end of the 3 day. 4 MS. HARTMANN: The State would offer State's 5 Exhibit 100. 6 MR. RAY: No objection to 100. 7 THE COURT: 100 is admitted 8 (State's Exhibit No. 100 received) 9 MS. HARTMANN: May I publish by reading orally 10 parts of State's Exhibit 100 to the jury?
1 Q. How much time passed I guess what period well, 2 let me ask you this. Did you, in fact, put a completed call to 3 your son and talk to him? 4 A. Yes, I did. 5 Q. On this cell phone? 6 A. Yes. 7 Q. All right. And how much contact or how long a period 8 of time were you around this man who loaned you the phone? 9 A. Ten or 15 minutes, if that. I really didn't talk to 10 him. 11 Q. All right. Do you I know it's been since April and	Page 232 1 Exhibit 98. 2 THE COURT: We'll take that up at the end of the 3 day. 4 MS. HARTMANN: The State would offer State's 5 Exhibit 100. 6 MR. RAY: No objection to 100. 7 THE COURT: 100 is admitted 8 (State's Exhibit No. 100 received) 9 MS. HARTMANN: May I publish by reading orally 10 parts of State's Exhibit 100 to the jury? 11 THE COURT: You may.
1 Q. How much time passed — I guess what period — well, 2 let me ask you this. Did you, in fact, put a completed call to 3 your son and talk to him? 4 A. Yes, I did. 5 Q. On this cell phone? 6 A. Yes. 7 Q. All right. And how much contact or how long a period 8 of time were you around this man who loaned you the phone? 9 A. Ten or 15 minutes, if that. I really didn't talk to 10 him. 11 Q. All right. Do you — I know it's been since April and 12 it was a short period of time. Do you see anybody in the room	Page 232 1 Exhibit 98. 2 THE COURT: We'll take that up at the end of the 3 day. 4 MS. HARTMANN: The State would offer State's 5 Exhibit 100. 6 MR. RAY: No objection to 100. 7 THE COURT: 100 is admitted 8 (State's Exhibit No. 100 received) 9 MS. HARTMANN: May I publish by reading orally 10 parts of State's Exhibit 100 to the jury? 11 THE COURT: You may. 12 MS. HARTMANN: State's Exhibit 100 is a Texas
Q. How much time passed — I guess what period — well, let me ask you this. Did you, in fact, put a completed call to your son and talk to him? A. Yes, I did. Q. On this cell phone? A. Yes. Q. All right. And how much contact or how long a period of time were you around this man who loaned you the phone? A. Ten or 15 minutes, if that. I really didn't talk to him. Q. All right. Do you — I know it's been since April and it was a short period of time. Do you see anybody in the room that you recognize to be the person who loaned you that phone?	Page 232 1 Exhibit 98. 2 THE COURT: We'll take that up at the end of the 3 day. 4 MS. HARTMANN: The State would offer State's 5 Exhibit 100. 6 MR. RAY: No objection to 100. 7 THE COURT: 100 is admitted 8 (State's Exhibit No. 100 received) 9 MS. HARTMANN: May I publish by reading orally 10 parts of State's Exhibit 100 to the jury? 11 THE COURT: You may. 12 MS. HARTMANN: State's Exhibit 100 is a Texas 13 Department of Transportation Vehicle Inquiry Receipt regarding
1 Q. How much time passed — I guess what period — well, 2 let me ask you this. Did you, in fact, put a completed call to 3 your son and talk to him? 4 A. Yes, I did. 5 Q. On this cell phone? 6 A. Yes. 7 Q. All right. And how much contact or how long a period 8 of time were you around this man who loaned you the phone? 9 A. Ten or 15 minutes, if that. I really didn't talk to 10 him. 11 Q. All right. Do you — I know it's been since April and 12 it was a short period of time. Do you see anybody in the room 13 that you recognize to be the person who loaned you that phone? 14 A. Yes, ma'am.	Page 232 1 Exhibit 98. 2 THE COURT: We'll take that up at the end of the 3 day. 4 MS. HARTMANN: The State would offer State's 5 Exhibit 100. 6 MR. RAY: No objection to 100. 7 THE COURT: 100 is admitted 8 (State's Exhibit No. 100 received) 9 MS. HARTMANN: May I publish by reading orally 10 parts of State's Exhibit 100 to the jury? 11 THE COURT: You may. 12 MS. HARTMANN: State's Exhibit 100 is a Texas 13 Department of Transportation Vehicle Inquiry Receipt regarding 14 Patricia Lee Syren, 2716 Scott Avenue, Fort Worth, Texas 76103,
Q. How much time passed — I guess what period — well, let me ask you this. Did you, in fact, put a completed call to your son and talk to him? A. Yes, I did. Q. On this cell phone? A. Yes. Q. All right. And how much contact or how long a period frime were you around this man who loaned you the phone? A. Ten or 15 minutes, if that. I really didn't talk to him. Q. All right. Do you — I know it's been since April and it was a short period of time. Do you see anybody in the room that you recognize to be the person who loaned you that phone? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. Where is that person located, and can you tell me	Page 232 1 Exhibit 98. 2 THE COURT: We'll take that up at the end of the 3 day. 4 MS. HARTMANN: The State would offer State's 5 Exhibit 100. 6 MR. RAY: No objection to 100. 7 THE COURT: 100 is admitted 8 (State's Exhibit No. 100 received) 9 MS. HARTMANN: May I publish by reading orally 10 parts of State's Exhibit 100 to the jury? 11 THE COURT: You may. 12 MS. HARTMANN: State's Exhibit 100 is a Texas 13 Department of Transportation Vehicle Inquiry Receipt regarding 14 Patricia Lee Syren, 2716 Scott Avenue, Fort Worth, Texas 76103, 15 for a 1996 Cadillac with a plate number VPF81X.
Q. How much time passed — I guess what period — well, let me ask you this. Did you, in fact, put a completed call to your son and talk to him? A. Yes, I did. Q. On this cell phone? A. Yes. Q. All right. And how much contact or how long a period of time were you around this man who loaned you the phone? A. Ten or 15 minutes, if that. I really didn't talk to him. Q. All right. Do you — I know it's been since April and it was a short period of time. Do you see anybody in the room that you recognize to be the person who loaned you that phone? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. Where is that person located, and can you tell me something they are wearing?	Page 232 1 Exhibit 98. 2 THE COURT: We'll take that up at the end of the 3 day. 4 MS. HARTMANN: The State would offer State's 5 Exhibit 100. 6 MR. RAY: No objection to 100. 7 THE COURT: 100 is admitted 8 (State's Exhibit No. 100 received) 9 MS. HARTMANN: May I publish by reading orally 10 parts of State's Exhibit 100 to the jury? 11 THE COURT: You may. 12 MS. HARTMANN: State's Exhibit 100 is a Texas 13 Department of Transportation Vehicle Inquiry Receipt regarding 14 Patricia Lee Syren, 2716 Scott Avenue, Fort Worth, Texas 76103, 15 for a 1996 Cadillac with a plate number VPFSIX. 16 MS. HARTMANN: At this time, Your Honor, the
Q. How much time passed — I guess what period — well, let me ask you this. Did you, in fact, put a completed call to your son and talk to him? A. Yes, I did. Q. On this cell phone? A. Yes. Q. All right. And how much contact or how long a period fitime were you around this man who loaned you the phone? A. Ten or 15 minutes, if that. I really didn't talk to him. Q. All right. Do you — I know it's been since April and it was a short period of time. Do you see anybody in the room that you recognize to be the person who loaned you that phone? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. Where is that person located, and can you tell me something they are wearing? I am a little color blind, so	Page 232 1 Exhibit 98. 2 THE COURT: We'll take that up at the end of the 3 day. 4 MS. HARTMANN: The State would offer State's 5 Exhibit 100. 6 MR. RAY: No objection to 100. 7 THE COURT: 100 is admitted 8 (State's Exhibit No. 100 received) 9 MS. HARTMANN: May I publish by reading orally 10 parts of State's Exhibit 100 to the jury? 11 THE COURT: You may. 12 MS. HARTMANN: State's Exhibit 100 is a Texas 13 Department of Transportation Vehicle Inquiry Receipt regarding 14 Patricia Lee Syren, 2716 Scott Avenue, Fort Worth, Texas 76103, 15 for a 1996 Cadillac with a plate number VPF81X. 16 MS. HARTMANN: At this time, Your Honor, the 17 State would offer State's Exhibit No. 99, which is also business
Q. How much time passed — I guess what period — well, let me ask you this. Did you, in fact, put a completed call to your son and talk to him? A. Yes, I did. Q. On this cell phone? A. Yes. Q. All right. And how much contact or how long a period of time were you around this man who loaned you the phone? A. Ten or 15 minutes, if that. I really didn't talk to him. Q. All right. Do you — I know it's been since April and it was a short period of time. Do you see anybody in the room that you recognize to be the person who loaned you that phone? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. Where is that person located, and can you tell me something they are wearing? A. That they are wearing? I am a little color blind, so	Page 232 1 Exhibit 98. 2 THE COURT: We'll take that up at the end of the 3 day. 4 MS. HARTMANN: The State would offer State's 5 Exhibit 100. 6 MR. RAY: No objection to 100. 7 THE COURT: 100 is admitted 8 (State's Exhibit No. 100 received) 9 MS. HARTMANN: May I publish by reading orally 10 parts of State's Exhibit 100 to the jury? 11 THE COURT: You may. 12 MS. HARTMANN: State's Exhibit 100 is a Texas 13 Department of Transportation Vehicle Inquiry Receipt regarding 14 Patricia Lee Syren, 2716 Scott Avenue, Fort Worth, Texas 76103, 15 for a 1996 Cadillac with a plate number VPFSIX. 16 MS. HARTMANN: At this time, Your Honor, the 17 State would offer State's Exhibit No. 99, which is also business 18 records.
Q. How much time passed — I guess what period — well, let me ask you this. Did you, in fact, put a completed call to your son and talk to him? A. Yes, I did. Q. On this cell phone? A. Yes. Q. All right. And how much contact or how long a period of time were you around this man who loaned you the phone? A. Ten or 15 minutes, if that. I really didn't talk to him. Q. All right. Do you — I know it's been since April and it was a short period of time. Do you see anybody in the room that you recognize to be the person who loaned you that phone? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. Where is that person located, and can you tell me something they are wearing? A. That they are wearing? I am a little color blind, so Il — Q. Well, tell me what position they are, where they are	Page 232 1 Exhibit 98. 2 THE COURT: We'll take that up at the end of the 3 day. 4 MS. HARTMANN: The State would offer State's 5 Exhibit 100. 6 MR. RAY: No objection to 100. 7 THE COURT: 100 is admitted 8 (State's Exhibit No. 100 received) 9 MS. HARTMANN: May I publish by reading orally 10 parts of State's Exhibit 100 to the jury? 11 THE COURT: You may. 12 MS. HARTMANN: State's Exhibit 100 is a Texas 13 Department of Transportation Vehicle Inquiry Receipt regarding 14 Patricia Lee Syren, 2716 Scott Avenue, Fort Worth, Texas 76103, 15 for a 1996 Cadillac with a plate number VPF81X. 16 MS. HARTMANN: At this time, Your Honor, the 17 State would offer State's Exhibit No. 99, which is also business 18 records. 19 MR. RAY: We have an objection to this we would
Q. How much time passed — I guess what period — well, let me ask you this. Did you, in fact, put a completed call to your son and talk to him? A. Yes, I did. Q. On this cell phone? A. Yes. Q. All right. And how much contact or how long a period fitime were you around this man who loaned you the phone? A. Ten or 15 minutes, if that. I really didn't talk to him. Q. All right. Do you — I know it's been since April and it was a short period of time. Do you see anybody in the room that you recognize to be the person who loaned you that phone? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. Where is that person located, and can you tell me something they are wearing? A. That they are wearing? I am a little color blind, so I — Q. Well, tell me what position they are, where they are	Page 232 1 Exhibit 98. 2 THE COURT: We'll take that up at the end of the 3 day. 4 MS. HARTMANN: The State would offer State's 5 Exhibit 100. 6 MR. RAY: No objection to 100. 7 THE COURT: 100 is admitted 8 (State's Exhibit No. 100 received) 9 MS. HARTMANN: May I publish by reading orally 10 parts of State's Exhibit 100 to the jury? 11 THE COURT: You may. 12 MS. HARTMANN: State's Exhibit 100 is a Texas 13 Department of Transportation Vehicle Inquiry Receipt regarding 14 Patricia Lee Syren, 2716 Scott Avenue, Fort Worth, Texas 76103, 15 for a 1996 Cadillac with a plate number VPF81X. 16 MS. HARTMANN: At this time, Your Honor, the 17 State would offer State's Exhibit No. 99, which is also business 18 records. 19 MR. RAY: We have an objection to this we would 20 like to take up outside the presence of the jury.
1 Q. How much time passed — I guess what period — well, 2 let me ask you this. Did you, in fact, put a completed call to 3 your son and talk to him? 4 A. Yes, I did. 5 Q. On this cell phone? 6 A. Yes. 7 Q. All right. And how much contact or how long a period 8 of time were you around this man who loaned you the phone? 9 A. Ten or 15 minutes, if that. I really didn't talk to 10 him. 11 Q. All right. Do you — I know it's been since April and 12 it was a short period of time. Do you see anybody in the room 13 that you recognize to be the person who loaned you that phone? 14 A. Yes, ma'am. 15 Q. Where is that person located, and can you tell me 16 something they are wearing? 17 A. That they are wearing? I am a little color blind, so 18 I— 19 Q. Well, tell me what position they are, where they are 20 located in the courtroom? 21 A. Sitting over there.	Page 232 1 Exhibit 98. 2 THE COURT: We'll take that up at the end of the 3 day. 4 MS. HARTMANN: The State would offer State's 5 Exhibit 100. 6 MR. RAY: No objection to 100. 7 THE COURT: 100 is admitted 8 (State's Exhibit No. 100 received) 9 MS. HARTMANN: May I publish by reading orally 10 parts of State's Exhibit 100 to the jury? 11 THE COURT: You may. 12 MS. HARTMANN: State's Exhibit 100 is a Texas 13 Department of Transportation Vehicle Inquiry Receipt regarding 14 Patricia Lee Syren, 2716 Scott Avenue, Fort Worth, Texas 76103, 15 for a 1996 Cadillac with a plate number VPF81X. 16 MS. HARTMANN: At this time, Your Honor, the 17 State would offer State's Exhibit No. 99, which is also business 18 records. 19 MR. RAY: We have an objection to this we would 20 like to take up outside the presence of the jury. 21 THE COURT: We'll do it at the end of the day.
1 Q. How much time passed — I guess what period — well, 2 let me ask you this. Did you, in fact, put a completed call to 3 your son and talk to him? 4 A. Yes, I did. 5 Q. On this cell phone? 6 A. Yes. 7 Q. All right. And how much contact or how long a period 8 of time were you around this man who loaned you the phone? 9 A. Ten or 15 minutes, if that. I really didn't talk to 10 him. 11 Q. All right. Do you — I know it's been since April and 12 it was a short period of time. Do you see anybody in the room 13 that you recognize to be the person who loaned you that phone? 14 A. Yes, ma'am. 15 Q. Where is that person located, and can you tell me 16 something they are wearing? 17 A. That they are wearing? I am a little color blind, so 18 I— 19 Q. Well, tell me what position they are, where they are 20 located in the courtroom? 21 A. Sitting over there. 22 Q. And you are indicating the table to your right and my	Page 232 1 Exhibit 98. 2 THE COURT: We'll take that up at the end of the 3 day. 4 MS. HARTMANN: The State would offer State's 5 Exhibit 100. 6 MR. RAY: No objection to 100. 7 THE COURT: 100 is admitted 8 (State's Exhibit No. 100 received) 9 MS. HARTMANN: May I publish by reading orally 10 parts of State's Exhibit 100 to the jury? 11 THE COURT: You may. 12 MS. HARTMANN: State's Exhibit 100 is a Texas 13 Department of Transportation Vehicle Inquiry Receipt regarding 14 Patricia Lee Syren, 2716 Scott Avenue, Fort Worth, Texas 76103, 15 for a 1996 Cadillac with a plate number VPF81X. 16 MS. HARTMANN: At this time, Your Honor, the 17 State would offer State's Exhibit No. 99, which is also business 18 records. 19 MR. RAY: We have an objection to this we would 20 like to take up outside the presence of the jury. 21 THE COURT: We'll do it at the end of the day. 22 MS. HARTMANN: May we approach briefly, Your
1 Q. How much time passed — I guess what period — well, 2 let me ask you this. Did you, in fact, put a completed call to 3 your son and talk to him? 4 A. Yes, I did. 5 Q. On this cell phone? 6 A. Yes. 7 Q. All right. And how much contact or how long a period 8 of time were you around this man who loaned you the phone? 9 A. Ten or 15 minutes, if that. I really didn't talk to 10 him. 11 Q. All right. Do you — I know it's been since April and 12 it was a short period of time. Do you see anybody in the room 13 that you recognize to be the person who loaned you that phone? 14 A. Yes, ma'am. 15 Q. Where is that person located, and can you tell me 16 something they are wearing? 17 A. That they are wearing? I am a little color blind, so 18 I — 19 Q. Well, tell me what position they are, where they are 20 located in the courtroom? 21 A. Sitting over there. 22 Q. And you are indicating the table to your right and my 23 left?	Page 232 1 Exhibit 98. 2 THE COURT: We'll take that up at the end of the 3 day. 4 MS. HARTMANN: The State would offer State's 5 Exhibit 100. 6 MR. RAY: No objection to 100. 7 THE COURT: 100 is admitted 8 (State's Exhibit No. 100 received) 9 MS. HARTMANN: May I publish by reading orally 10 parts of State's Exhibit 100 to the jury? 11 THE COURT: You may. 12 MS. HARTMANN: State's Exhibit 100 is a Texas 13 Department of Transportation Vehicle Inquiry Receipt regarding 14 Patricia Lee Syren, 2716 Scott Avenue, Fort Worth, Texas 76103, 15 for a 1996 Cadillac with a plate number VPF81X. 16 MS. HARTMANN: At this time, Your Honor, the 17 State would offer State's Exhibit No. 99, which is also business 18 records. 19 MR. RAY: We have an objection to this we would 20 like to take up outside the presence of the jury. 21 THE COURT: We'll do it at the end of the day. MS. HARTMANN: May we approach briefly, Your 23 Honor?

Case 4:07-cv-00703-Y Document 87 Condense 1,5 17 Page 63 of 64 PageID 4699 Page 233 Page 235 MS. HARTMANN: We have run out of witnesses. The 1 part. 2 2 next witness is from the Medical Examiner's office, and his MS. HARTMANN: Our response is that is Ms. 3 testimony will be pretty lengthy and they are not here at this 3 Moffett is not law enforcement. The Court has ruled that the point. So if we can finish for the day --4 statement is admissible. Defense Counsel uses the word THE COURT: How many more witnesses? 5 confession. I think basically it is just documenting in the 6 MS. HARTMANN: I would anticipate two. 6 course of her capacity of her duties the statements the 7 (In the hearing of the jury) 7 Defendant made to her. She's not law enforcement, and they are 8 THE COURT: Ladies and gentlemen, that is as far certainly probative and relevant to the issues here at trial. 9 as we are going to be able to work today. We going to break THE COURT: Well, it is hearsay in this form. 10 until 9:00 o'clock in the morning. The question is can you get by the hearsay objection. 11 11 MS. HARTMANN: Admission of party opponent, Please remember and follow your instructions and 12 meet the bailiffs outside tomorrow morning as usual. Have a statement against interest. 13 good evening. THE COURT: I'll look at it overnight and let 14 14 y'all know in the morning. (Jury not present) 15 15 MR. RAY: Our objection to 98, Judge, which is MS. HARTMANN: Is State's Exhibit 98, then, the 16 the Cingular Wireless phone records, is that the Court 16 Cingular records, have they been admitted? 17 previously suppressed pursuant to our Motion to Suppress the 17 THE COURT: I have told you I will admit them, 18 cellar telephone that was found in the Defendant's bag at the 18 but I haven't done so in front of the jury yet. 19 Tonis Bar by Officer Garcia, III. And for those reasons, we 19 MS. HARTMANN: All right. 20 believe that the telephone records are not relevant. 20 THE COURT: Anything else? 21 21 MS. HARTMANN: May I respond? MR, RAY: I think that's it. 22 THE COURT: Yes. 22 MS. HARTMANN: That's all from the State. 23 23 THE COURT: All right. I would like both sides MS. HARTMANN: Those are telephone records of 24 Patricia Lee Syren. The last witness testified that she 24 to have with them tomorrow morning any proposed jury charges 25 borrowed -- or that the Defendant offered her a cell phone which 25 that they wish to have in the Court's Charge other than the Page 236 Page 234 1 we know was the victim's cell phone because there's a phone call 1 normal and ordinary charges you would expect to find for this 2 to Phoenix, Arizona. She confirmed the number, and we have 2 type of offense. 3 proved up independently of any arrest or seizure of a cell With regards to 99, there are two hearsay hurdles 4 phone -- we are entitled to prove up any other way that he was 4 you have to get by on this document. 5 in possession of her cell phone. MS. HARTMANN: All right. 6 We're not going to introduce the cell phone 6 THE COURT: The first hearsay objection is 7 itself or anything that he was caught with at the time of his 7 statements made to the witness and your party opponent gets you 8 arrest, but the fact that he was using the cell phone, that he 8 by -- your party-opponent theory gets you by that, but all we 9 loaned it to someone else in the bar is relevant. 9 have here is a piece of paper. You don't have your witness in 10 THE COURT: Is that the extent of your objection? 10 court. So that's another hearsay hurdle. 11 MR. RAY: Yes, sir. 11 MS. HARTMANN: Well, I think under the business 12 THE COURT: It's overruled. 12 records exception and hearsay provisions. 13 MR. RAY: And in regard to State's Exhibit 99, 13 THE COURT: But is this a business record? 14 State's Exhibit No. 99 is a business record from the Galveston 14 MS. HARTMANN: It is the State's position it is. 15 jail. The gist of our objection is they are offering this 15 THE COURT: What is it? 16 objection (sic) without any sponsoring testimony of the -- not 16 MS. HARTMANN: They are records that are kept by 17 the custodian, which happens to be the same witness. My 17 the sheriff's office, but it is the medical division. 18 objection is not a custodial -- or a business records objection 18 MR. RAY: I think what she testified to was that 19 because we have that agreement that they can do that. 19 she was a nurse -- this lady has testified here before. 20 My objection is this contains a confession of the 20 THE COURT: Right. 21 Defendant therein, and I am not in a position to cross-examine 21 MR. RAY: I think what she testified to was she 22 this writing without the State bringing this witness to 22 was a person sent over to a jail to do a medical or 23 testify. So until such time as the state brings Ms. Cheryl psychological evaluation, is my understanding of what was said. 24 Moffett, it is our position that this violates our right to 24 THE COURT: Okay. 25 effectively cross-examine this witness. I have turned it to the 25 MR. RAY: So while they may get past the business

CondenseIt[™]

Page 64 of 64 PageID 4700 1 records exception, the problem is that she's over there -- and 1 STATE OF TEXAS 2 she said this was the first confession, or statement against 2 COUNTY OF TARRANT I 3 interest or whatever you want to call it, that she'd ever gotten I. Steve Schiller, Official Court Reporter for the 4 213th District Court of Tarrant County, Texas, do hereby certify 4 because her normal deal was to go interview people and see how 5 they were feeling. And this was something that was kind of 5 that the above and foregoing contains a true and correct 6 blurted out, if I remember her testimony correctly. 6 transcription of all portions of evidence and other proceedings 7 7 requested in writing by counsel for the parties to be included And if they don't call her as a witness, I am not 8 in a position to cross-examine all of those things. That's the 8 in this volume of the Reporter's Record, in the above-styled and 9 problem I have. The fact that they have got a bunch of records 9 numbered cause, all of which occurred in open court or in 10 from the sheriff's department and stuck labels on them is a 10 chambers and were reported by me. 11 11 different story. 12 12 THE COURT: That's my question, is it really a I further certify that this Reporter's Record of the 13 business record. Sure, it's kept by the sheriff's department, 13 proceedings truly and correctly reflects the exhibits, if any, 14 but witness statements are kept by police departments too. That 14 admitted by the respective parties. 15 doesn't make them admissible as business records. 15 16 16 MS. HARTMANN: But this is more than just a 17 statement. This is an actual medical record. Those are medical 17 18 18 records, and that's different from a witness statement where someone goes into a police department and --19 the 25th day of April, 2004. 20 THE COURT: Is it in the regular course of 20 21 business for someone to record that type of information on a 21 STEVE SCHILLER, CSR Official Court Reporter 22 medical record? 22 213th District Court 401 West Belknap 23 23 Fort Worth, Texas 76196 (817) 884-2687 MS. HARTMANN: Yes. She's in there performing 24 her duty, which is to do screening; and in the course of that, 24 Certification No. 4665 25 25 he makes these admissions to her. Certification Expires: 12-31-05 Page 238 THE COURT: I'll look at it overnight. 1 2 MS. HARTMANN: All right. 3 (Proceedings recessed) 6 7 8 9 10 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25